

Interactive comment on “A qualitative description of shallow groundwater effect on surface soil temperature” by F. Alkhaier et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 26 June 2009

The scientific significance of the topic is highly relevant, but the quality of the paper is just fair (see also comments in the pdf). The description of the processes is confusing, the content of tables and figures seems not to be consistent. According to the figures 2 and 3, I doubt whether the correlations are significant. Thus, a level of significance should be added and inconsistencies between r^2 in figure 2 and 3 and table 2 should be revised. I would also strongly recommend to revise the paper according to the English language, because a lot of passages are quite confusing (see also comments in the pdf). The units are missing in most equations, they should be inserted. The paper should be revised with respect to consistency, e.g. why only r^2 of 2 days are presented in the figure? Why was the soil watered until field capacity an day 6? The results of the fully watered soil are not mentioned? The quality of figure 1a is very poor

C1338

and the citation is missing, the image type as source of figure 1c is also missing. The section "discussion" is not really a discussion of the results, but a set of statements which are not proven in the paper. These fact result in a fair to poor quality of the presentation. Please notice the comments in the paper!

Please also note the Supplement to this comment.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 6, 2129, 2009.