

Interactive comment on “A multi-scale soil water structure model based on the pedostructure concept” by E. Braudeau et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 22 March 2009

1. Unfortunately the wordy authors' response does not touch the clear reviewer 1's concerns.
2. The essence of the matter is as follows: a "physically based" approach cannot be founded on curve-fitting that literally saturates one under consideration.
3. The reference of the Authors to a recent work (2009) additionally confirms that "physics" remains on a word level (as decorations) in this recent work, and "practical applications" in the manuscript under consideration ("Kamel") are reduced to the customary curve-fitting.
4. Still another formulation of the essence of the matter in connection with point 3: if one indeed has a quantitative physical theory (not curve-fitting) he/she can use that

C108

practically (without curve-fitting).

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 6, 1111, 2009.