Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 5, S566–S567, 2008 www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/5/S566/2008/ © Author(s) 2008. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



HESSD

5, S566-S567, 2008

Interactive Comment

Interactive comment on "The European Flood Alert System EFAS – Part 2: Statistical skill assessment of probabilistic and deterministic operational forecasts" by J. C. Bartholmes et al.

L. Pfister (Editor)

pfister@lippmann.lu

Received and published: 1 July 2008

The reviewing process of the two related papers by Thielen et al. and Bartholmes et al. on the European flood alert system EFAS has come to the point where it allows to give a judgement on both closely related papers. Having two papers dealing with one and the same issue was identified as somewhat problematic by the reviewers. The first paper, by Thielen et al., looks indeed as being of less relevance for a scientific journal and I would recommend the authors to reconsider the publication of that manuscript in either a different journal (e.g. practicioners journal as suggested by one reviewer) or to integrate its content in a strongly reduced version in the second paper submitted by

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



Bartholmes et al. This second paper can be evaluated as being very interesting and relevant to the scientific community. The authors should take into consideration the mainly minor revision suggestions of the reviewer for the Part 2 paper (Bartholmes et al.). They should also seriously consider either the integration of Part 1 of their study into the second paper (submitted by Bartholmes et al.), or a submission in another journal that is rather targeting stakeholders that are involved in flood management.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 5, 289, 2008.

HESSD

5, S566-S567, 2008

Interactive Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

