

Interactive comment on “Multi-criteria validation of artificial neural network rainfall-runoff modeling” by R. Modarres

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 7 January 2009

Review report on manuscript HHESSD-2008-0134: Multi-criteria validation of artificial neural network by Modarres

General:

In this manuscript, the author uses 17 global statistics and 3 non-parametric tests to evaluate the performance of neural network models and multiple regression equations. In the current ANN practice it is common to use simple numerical measures such as determination coefficient (R^2) to show the linearity between the observed and simulated runoff and time series and/or scatter diagram of the observed and simulated runoff. Using daily rainfall and runoff data from the Zayandehrud watershed in Iran the

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

author compared the observed and simulated runoff data by using 17 global statistics and 3 non-parametric tests.

The manuscript is well organized and written. I suggest publication of the manuscript in Hydrology and Earth System Sciences after following comments are responded and corrections are made.

Comments:

1. Page 3454 Line 5: The observation was divided into training, validation and cross-validation. Two questions are arisen here: (i) We know that 'training data set' is used to calibrate the model and 'validation data set' to test. What for is used the 'cross-validation data set'? (ii) What percentage of the total data is used in each data set? Please note that these three data sets are mentioned in Page 3455 Line 6 for a second time.

2. Page 3454 Lines 18-19: The term 'normalized' in Line 19 should be 'standardized' as in Line 18.

3. Page 3456 Line 8: Insert following paragraph after '... different models.' and cite the references provided below in the text and list them among the references.

It is noted that Unal et al. (2004) validated simulation models by using statistical characteristics such as average, standard deviation, skewness coefficient, autocorrelation coefficient, maximum and minimum values, and performance criteria such as relative error, absolute error, frequency of success, ranges of relative and absolute errors. Very recently Aksoy and Dahamsheh (2009) used a multi-criteria validation of ANN models developed for Jordan by using graphical and numerical measures including the forecasted and observed time series, scatter diagram, the residual time series between the forecast and observation, mean absolute and relative errors between the forecast and observation, dimensionless mean absolute error and dimensionless mean relative error between the forecast and observation. Additionally following performance

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

measures are adopted: Determination coefficient to quantify the linearity between the forecast and observation, mean square error, mean absolute error; and a and b (the slope and the intercept) in the best-fit linear line of the scatter diagram between the forecast and observation.

NE Unal, H Aksoy, T Akar, 2004, Annual and monthly rainfall data generation schemes, *Stoch. Environ. Res. Risk Assess.*, 18: 245-257.

H Aksoy, A Dahamsheh, 2009, Artificial neural network models for forecasting monthly precipitation in Jordan, *Stoch. Environ. Res. Risk Assess.*, DOI 10.1007/s00477-008-0267-x (in press and online available). (USE VOLUME, ISSUE AND PAGE TO PAGE INFORMATION FOR THIS REFERENCE IF IT IS PUBLISHED BEFORE THIS MANUSCRIPT IS PRODUCED.)

4. Page 3457 Line 4: Provide a reference after the Blom's method is mentioned.
5. Page 3457 Line 24: What does Table 2 say? Explain in brief.
6. From Line 22 in Page 3458 to Line 4 in Page 3459: 'Table 3 represents the global ... is the best network.' I could not link statements in this paragraph with Table 3. I think the table should be re-arranged to correspond what the text says.

Technical Corrections:

Abstract:

Page 3450 Line 8: Delete 'but' at the end of the line.

Page 3450 Line 13: for low, medium and

Page 3450 Line 14: for low, medium and

Page 3450 Line 15: statistics, the empirical (Delete 'but')

Page 3450 Line 16: of low, medium and

3 Multi-layer perceptron

From Page 3453 Line 2 to Page 3454 Line 2: Variables are all should be lowercase both in the text and in the equations. Only E, N and M in Equation (5) are capital. All other variables should be lowercase. Please pay a particular Delete 'but' at the end of the line.

4 Model development

Page 3455 Line 8: Correct as 'Propagation'

Page 3455 Line 13: Use 'validation' instead of 'testing'

5 Empirical model

Page 3455 Line 23: Insert as '... in Fig. 3 for the validation data set.'

6 Comparison of the models

Page 3456 Line 23: Delete 'but' as '... the models, they do not ...'

Page 3459 Line 2: Use sub-index i with N as N_i .

Page 3460 Line 11: Correct as 'significance level'

References

Page 3464 Line 15: Correct as 'An artificial ...'

Table 1

0.92 for CE(%) in Regression model should be 92.xx

Use equal number of digits for CE(%) in all model types.

Use equal number of digits for loAD in all model types.

Use equal number of digits for PI in all model types.

Fig. 4 (Caption)

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



Use lower case in '... box-plots ...'

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 5, 3449, 2008.

HESSD

5, S2283–S2287, 2009

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

S2287

