Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 5, S2018–S2019, 2008

www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/5/S2018/2008/ © Author(s) 2008. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



HESSD

5, S2018-S2019, 2008

Interactive Comment

Interactive comment on "On the relationship between large-scale climate modes and regional synoptic patterns that drive Victorian rainfall" by D. Verdon-Kidd and A. S. Kiem

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 29 November 2008

1 major comment: I am not sure whether the analysis is addressing the problem the authors think they are addressing. This doubt arises because they refer to various climate indices describing ENSO events, Indian Ocean Dipole events and the Southern Annular Mode. The indices they use describe INTERANNUAL fluctuations of the climate system and, as such, are based on MONTHLY ANOMALIES. On the other hand, the SOM analysis describes purely raw monthly patterns and, as such, simply captures the SEASONAL CYCLE of the pressure patterns across the regions. The question is then: Why did they not perform an SOM analysis of the MSLP monthly anomalies so that they could have analysed like with like? As it stands, I believe the results only tell





us when the rain falls during the year - and soes not explain anything about anomalous rainfall. This should be addressed befor epublication.

1 minor comment: Why not use a recognized index for the IOD? A Dipole Mode Index is available.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 5, 2791, 2008.

HESSD

5, S2018-S2019, 2008

Interactive Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

