

Interactive comment on “Spatial rainfall variability and runoff response during an extreme event in a semi-arid catchment in the South Pare Mountains, Tanzania.” by M. L. Mul et al.

A. Montanari (Editor)

alberto.montanari@unibo.it

Received and published: 10 November 2008

The paper presents an interesting analysis of a flood event that recently occurred in Tanzania. The river basin was not gauged until recent times and therefore the assessment of the meteorological and runoff generation processes that led to the formation of the flood flows constitute an important piece of information. In my opinion the paper is well written and well matches the interest of the audience of HESS.

My positive opinion agrees with the constructive feelings of the referees, who both agreed that the analysis is interesting and therefore worth publishing on HESS. How-

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



ever, the very careful assessment by the reviewers resulted in a long list of critical remarks. I believe the authors will be able to satisfactorily address the referees' concerns, although in my opinion a significant amount of additional work is needed.

I believe that one important point that was raised by the referees is related to the uncertainty that may affect this study. To assess uncertainty in this particular case could be not possible. However, I think a thoughtful discussion about uncertainty is needed and the results should be evaluated with the respect to the possible errors. Discussing uncertainty means also to evaluate the plausibility of the assumptions that were introduced (like the assumption of gradually varied flow) in view of the available information. I agree with Dr. Di Baldassarre that checking the results by using an additional and independent information would add a significant value to the paper. I do not know if the use of flood envelopes is feasible in this case, but I believe this is a very useful suggestion and I would highly recommend the authors to consider this possibility.

Moreover, I agree with the referees that the scope of the paper should be better clarified at the beginning and the conclusions should be drawn accordingly. I think the paper is indeed relevant for gaining information about flood formation processes in the study region but the authors should make clearer what is their main intent.

I think that this paper, with a significant revision, will provide a significant contribution for readers of HESS. I recommend the authors to address or discuss all the comments raised by the referees.

I wish to congratulate with the authors and thank the referees for their valuable help.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 5, 2657, 2008.

HESSD

5, S1779–S1780, 2008

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

