

Interactive comment on “Rivers we can’t bring ourselves to clean – historical insights into the pollution of the Moselle River (France), 1850–2000” by R. J. Garcier

S. Barles (Editor)

sabine.barles@univ-paris8.fr

Received and published: 20 August 2007

Two reviews of the manuscript have now been achieved and published as “Referee Comments” in HESSD. I hereby acknowledge the referees for their work and valuable comments. They both agree in finding this paper very interesting and innovative, suitable for publication in HESS, and a contribution to both environmental history and present day understanding. Based on these evaluations and my own reading of the manuscript, the latter is accepted for publication in the special issue “Man and river systems: Long term interactions between societies and nature in regional scale watersheds” with minor changes. The author is asked to write an “Author Comment” within 4

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

weeks to respond to the referee comments and attributed short comments if any, and to submit a revised version of the manuscript accordingly. In doing so, she shall address each point of the referee comments and provide a list of the changes introduced to the manuscript. In addition to the minor demands from referees that should be answered and lead to some precisions in the manuscript, it seems important to establish a link between the theoretical framework developed in the beginning of the paper and the case study (how does it fit with the theoretical model?) and to give some elements of comparison with other rivers (see referees' suggestions). Another point concerns the various forms of pollution (origin, nature and consequences), as in France the first regulations concerned urban and domestic - than organic - ones, whereas the Mosel is much more concerned with industrial impacts. The manuscript is not fully clear on this point. My last comment deals with the question of primary sources: I fully agree with Referee #3 on this point.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 4, 1697, 2007.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper