

Interactive comment on “Knowledge-based approaches for river basin management” by P. Mikulecký et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 1 August 2007

GENERAL COMMENTS

In general the content of the paper seems interesting and appropriate for the Journal. However, the paper presents significant problems that should be revised to be accepted as journal paper.

The most important comments are:

1. The title of the paper is confusing. The main purpose of the paper is to present part of the research work corresponding to the AQUIN project.
2. The AQUIN project finishes in 2008, so there is not evaluation results about the proposal. The paper should include deep evaluation results in order to estimate the importance of the contribution.

3. The paper should include more technical details about the proposal and more figures.

OTHER SPECIFIC COMMENTS

Section 2 describes mainly well known concepts about knowledge management. This information about knowledge management should be shorter because it is already described in the literature. However, other concepts about knowledge engineering should be included (e.g. problem-solving methods about diagnosis, etc.)

Section 3 shows a list of expert systems. The selection and classification of such systems seems arbitrary (it should follow a more rigorous classification as it is proposed for instance by CommonKads). According to this descriptions, it seems that the authors are not very familiarized with knowledge engineering. Some other related systems are missing (see for example, Molina, Fuentetaja, Garrote: "Hydrologic Models for Emergency Decision Support Using Bayesian Networks".).

TECHNICAL COMMENTS

Only one figure is included. More figures should be included.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 4, 1999, 2007.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper