

Interactive comment on “A spatially distributed analysis of erosion susceptibility and sediment yield in a river basin by means of geomorphic parameters and regression relationships” by S. Grauso et al.

S. Uhlenbrook (Editor)

s.uhlenbrook@unesco-ihe.org

Received and published: 22 June 2007

The paper was evaluated quite critically by three reviewers; one additional comment came in that was more positive. The authors replied to each of the reviewers, and I think this is a good example how valuable it is that comments and replies are stored in the system. Generally, the authors feel confident to be able to reply adequately to all issues raised by the reviewers and they would like to submit a revised version for HESS. I would like to invite the authors to do so, but this must be a very significantly revision. I rate the manuscript as a borderline case of rejection at this stage and major

revisions. The latter must include

┆ a widely re-written text (i.e. objectives, methodology, discussion and interpretation of the results),

┆ major revisions of the methodology incl. better justification and validation (!) of the method,

┆ better description of the scientific insights gained through the application of the regression models,

┆ additional modeling results as suggest by the authors (uncertainty and sensitivity analysis), and

┆ improved technical writing.

I understand that this will be a very challenging task for the authors, in particular in respect of the methodology and its justification as the study suffers (as many other studies in this field) from uncertain data. However, as I see the general importance of such empirical methods, I would like to encourage the authors to rework the paper accordingly.

I will consult at least two of the reviewers to re-review a revised manuscript and I will review it myself in further detail, before making a decision for acceptance/rejection for HESS.

Stefan Uhlenbrook, Delft, The Netherlands

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 4, 627, 2007.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper