

Interactive comment on “Co-operative agreements and the EU Water Framework Directive in conjunction with the Common Agricultural Policy” by I. Heinz

Anonymous Referee #4

Received and published: 22 December 2007

General comments

The paper is very interesting and addresses particularly relevant questions. It is very stimulating and opens the way for numerous further researches. I recommend its publication with minor revisions.

In particular, the paper does not cite and does not refer to enough literature: nearly no state of the art, no connection of the work to others, etc. This is the case in Sect. 1, but also in others (Sect. 3 for instance). The theoretical background does not appear enough.

Sect. 2. How was the research conducted? What sources (statistical data, interviews, quantitative survey, etc.)? How is the money saved (economic efficiency) estimated: what method? All this section is embarrassing because the origin of the information is not mentioned, so the reader cannot decide whether some statements are the result of the author's investigations (what I suppose, but it has to be more explicit), of literature, or pure conjectures (for instance 1599, l. 2-13: where did you find those explanations? Literature (if yes, please give the appropriate references), other means? 1604, l. 23-26: about UK).

Sect. 4. You use the polluter-pays principle in quite a different way than the usual one: "polluter pays for his remaining pollution" is the general case, whereas in CAs it is more "polluter gains less when he pollutes" (if I don't misunderstand). This point could be discussed, and the reasoning strengthened.

Specific comments

1604, l. 23: contribute should be intransitive in this use (I think).

1618, origin of Table 1?

1619, idem Table 2

1620, please give the reference of the directive.

1621, "Table 4" appears twice, give the name of the regulation.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 4, 1593, 2007.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper