

Interactive comment on “Systems analysis – a new paradigm and decision support tools for the water framework directive” by M. Bruen

S. Barles (Editor)

sabine.barles@univ-paris8.fr

Received and published: 23 November 2007

Two reviews of the manuscript have now been achieved and published as "Referee Comments" in HESSD. I hereby acknowledge the authors of reviews for their work and valuable appreciation. They agree in finding this paper very useful and interesting, despite some weak points. Based on these evaluations and my own reading of the manuscript, the latter is accepted for publication in the special issue "Man and river systems: Long term interactions between societies and nature in regional scale watersheds" of HESS with major changes.

The author is asked to write an "Author Comment" within 4 weeks to respond to the referee comments and attributed short comments if any, and to submit a revised version

of the manuscript accordingly. In doing so, he shall address each point of the referee comments and provide a list of the changes introduced to the manuscript.

In addition to the minor demands from referees that should be answered and lead to some precisions in the manuscript, the paper presents four main problems: 1) the structure is unclear and unbalanced - some sections are very detailed (mainly Sect. 4), others are not -, 3) the text is often too descriptive (like a long list of models and methods) and not analytical enough, 3) some sections could be improved thanks to more references and examples in the field of water management, and 4) the Wincoms project seems of very secondary importance in the paper, it is not related to the others sections, and not introduced in the text. In other words, the paper lacks a main thread (or more precisely does not express it clearly enough) that would organise the various sections (general structure an internal structure and developments) and help to understand what is at stake, where Wincoms comes from and what is Wincoms. It could be more illustrated (examples).

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 4, 1491, 2007.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper