

Interactive comment on “Knowledge-based approaches for river basin management” by P. Mikulecký et al.

A. Ducharne (Editor)

Agnes.ducharne@ccr.jussieu.fr

Received and published: 27 September 2007

Two reviews of the manuscript have now been achieved and published as "Referee Comments" in HESSD. The referees are acknowledged for their work and valuable comments. They agree in finding the general topic of the manuscript interesting, and relevant to both HESS and the special issue "Man and river systems: Long term interactions between societies and nature in regional scale watersheds" but they both deplore that the paper has major weaknesses, in agreement with my own evaluation of the manuscript.

The first part of the paper, which aims at reviewing the existing knowledge-based approaches, is neither complete nor clear enough to help a non specialised reader. The

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

second part aims at showing the interest of such methods in the framework of water management, through the example of the AQUIN project. But it really lacks useful technical details about the project, and it does not reach any substantial conclusions, making it difficult to convince a scientific audience.

As a consequence, this manuscript cannot be accepted in HESS. The authors are encouraged to gain insight from the two Referee Comments, in order to strengthen the scientific content of their manuscript, for a new submission, either in HESS or in another journal.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 4, 1999, 2007.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper