

Interactive comment on “Uncertainty in soil physical data at river basin scale” by P. van der Keur and B. V. Iversen

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 17 August 2006

Comment 1

The manuscript is well structured and pleasant to read and addresses the interesting issue of uncertainty in soil physical data at river basin scale.

Comment 2

This happens to be a review article as no new experimental work by the authors is presented. Therefore to be informative towards potential readers the word “review” should be used in the title of the manuscript.

Comment 3

The authors describe the different sources of uncertainty (e.g. model uncertainty, un-

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

certainty in soil physical and chemical properties, effects of various spatial and temporal scales) and they classify this uncertainty in 3 different categories. However, what is really lacking in this manuscript is what the authors themselves promise in the fourth line of their introduction: “providing guidance for the assessment of uncertain soil data targeted towards practitioners within hydrological modeling”. From a real good review article it can be expected that authors not only analyze the different sources of uncertainty but that in addition to this, they also provide a synthesis of all the important aspects related to uncertainty and that they design a logical framework (or a decision support system) that provides guidance for the assessment of uncertainty. So far the authors focused on the analysis and the synthesis is largely missing. It is recommended that the authors seriously improve their synthesis section. Without such a synthesis section this manuscript is insufficient innovative.

Comment 4

What means WFD at the third line from the bottom on page 7?

Comment 5

At the middle of page 13 a reference is made to Finke et al. (1996). However this paper is not listed in the references. Please correct and verify that all other references are correct.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 3, 1281, 2006.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)