

***Interactive comment on* “Effects of vegetation patterns on yields of the surface and subsurface waters in the Heishui Alpine Valley in west China” by Y. Liu et al.**

**Anonymous Referee #1**

Received and published: 4 August 2006

Any lack of climate data and other associated data such as geology of watersheds will make it difficult to accept the conclusions on vegetation effects. I have not been convinced that the watersheds have similar physical parameters other than vegetation compositions. An analysis is needed since this is not a 'paired watershed' study.

The response stated that 'spatial distribution AET and Precipitation are similar for the seven watersheds according to Jiang et al'. I was unclear how this info was derived. If AET, and P are similar for all the watersheds, the streamflow should be similar, so why did the researchers conclude there are differences in water yield among them.

I do not believe sampling baseflow (no rain days) will assure the streamflow was not

affected by previous rainfall events. For large watersheds, rainfall can have long period of influences on streamflow.

The authors stated uncertainties on vegetation-flow relations for different size of watersheds - the scale issues. This uncertainty may be caused only by the uncertainty of climate. I understand the difficulty to get climate data for large watersheds. This is the challenge for large basin hydrology study. I hope the authors can address this and derive conclusions accordingly.

---

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 3, 1021, 2006.

**HESSD**

3, S644–S645, 2006

---

Interactive  
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper