

Interactive comment on “Detection of contaminant plumes released from landfills” by N. B. Yenigül et al.

O. Cirpka (Editor)

Olaf.Cirpka@eawag.ch

Received and published: 28 July 2006

The article of Yenigül et al. has received three fairly critical reviews. In particular, the reviewers doubt the novelty and relevance of analyzing the case of a homogeneous conductivity distribution. The heterogeneous case was considered to be worth an extended analysis, but the reviewers missed the reference to current approaches of stochastic subsurface hydrology. The reviewers felt that the conceptual understanding of the underlying processes should go deeper.

In addition, concerns regarding the methods used by the authors have been raised. Lists of specific comments and technical corrections were mainly given by reviewers 1 and 2.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

I recommend that the authors go very carefully through the major comments of the reviewers. A detailed response should be given before going through the painstaking exercise of revising the paper. At this point, it is less important to address the minor points.

Following the key recommendations of the reviewers would result in a substantially improved manuscript differing in major points from the original paper. I highly recommend that the authors pick up the ideas of the reviewers. Because of necessary modifications, the improved paper would have to go through a new review process.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 3, 819, 2006.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper