

## ***Interactive comment on* “Theoretical investigation of process controls upon flood frequency: role of thresholds” by I. Struthers and M. Sivapalan**

**L. Pfister (Editor)**

pfister@lippmann.lu

Received and published: 10 April 2007

The paper has received two quite constrasting reviews. Both reviewers agree on the fact that the main subject of the paper, namely a theoretical interpretation of flood frequency curves is of high interest and relevance for publication in HESS. However, reviewer 1 rises several concerns which he considers as being of such importance that the paper needs major revisions. These concerns are mainly centered around the choice of the hydrological model, for which it has not been proven that it can correctly reproduce measured discharge. In their response, the authors rise several pertinent elements of explanation, among which the need of using a general model with a small parameter set, ensuring that it is catchment- and climate-independent (especially with

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

respect to the objectives of the paper). Reviewer 2 has less concerns and considers the paper as being ready for publication after minor revisions. Given the reviews, as well as the author's responses, I suggest that they resubmit a revised version of their paper, where they strongly rely on the issues raised by the reviewers and their various explanatory elements they have provided in their responses.

---

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 3, 3279, 2006.

**HESSD**

3, S1974–S1975, 2007

---

Interactive  
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper