

Interactive comment on “Using stable isotope tracers to identify hydrological flow paths, residence times and landscape controls in a mesoscale catchment” by P. Rodgers et al.

S. Uhlenbrook (Editor)

s.uhlenbrook@unesco-ihe.org

Received and published: 14 March 2005

The manuscript obtained two reviews (interactive discussion comments in HESSD), and both reviewers (and myself) came to the conclusion that the manuscript is very suitable for publication in HESS after it has undergone some major revisions. We all agree that the data set is very interesting as well as that the statistical analysis of the major influencing factors of residence times in different sized catchments is important. These facts clearly show that the paper is worth to publish in HESSD. However, before publication in HESS the authors should address the following issues raised by the reviewers. The revisions contain a rewriting of parts of the manuscripts and some minor data reanalysis.

Full Screen / Esc

Print Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

Interactive
Comment

Reviewer # 1 asked for a careful discussion of the assumptions associated with the selected model approach. A crucial point he/she made, was the justification of the input function (incl. assuming the extrapolation to previous times). In addition, he/she made many specific remarks that should be carried out by authors to make the manuscript clearer and easier for the reader to fully understand the approach.

Reviewer # 2 put the paper into a broader perspective and encourages the authors to relate the results also the water management issues. He also asks for a wider discussion of the used methods (input data extrapolation and modeling), but he/she is less critical about the modeling approach compared to reviewer # 1. In addition to the specific comments of reviewer # 1, he/she made a few more specific remarks, which should guide the authors while revising their manuscript.

Interactive comment on Hydrology and Earth System Sciences Discussions, 2, 1, 2005.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Print Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)