

Interactive comment on “Hydrogeomorphic controls on runoff in a temperate swamp” by S. C. Kaufman et al.

A. Montanari (Editor)

alberto.montanari@unibo.it

Received and published: 6 June 2005

The referees' comments on the paper highlight that the manuscript is not suitable for publication in the present form. In detail, it seems that the weakest point of the paper is the difficulty to extend the findings to other swamps. In its present form the manuscript is just a presentation of a case study, with gives a limited contribution to the comprehension of the dynamics of swamps in general. I would say that a fundamental requirement of a scientific contribution is to present results that may have a general validity.

Therefore I would suggest the authors to reply to the points raised by the Reviewers in the interactive discussion, stating how they believe that each of the remarks provided by the Referees can be addressed. In particular, it is important to know the authors' opinion about my major concern explained above, regarding the possibility to extend

Full Screen / Esc

Print Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

EGU

the results to other systems.

Interactive comment on Hydrology and Earth System Sciences Discussions, 2, 483, 2005.

HESSD

2, S241–S242, 2005

Interactive
Comment