

Interactive comment on “Urban water sustainability: an integrative framework for regional water management” by P. Gonzales and N. K. Ajami

G. Characklis (Editor)

charack@email.unc.edu

Received and published: 1 February 2016

The review process for this manuscript is ready to proceed, with comments from two anonymous reviewers and one from an interested discussant.

The two anonymous reviewers seem to have some serious concerns about nature of the contribution, and along with the other discussant, they have some additional comments on the introduction and relatively thin literature review. It seems clear that the authors would do well to make a much more detailed and cogent case for the nature of their intended contribution, supported by references to the wealth of related literature. This applies to research both within and outside of California (there is, in

C6576

fact, a reasonable amount of research on Hetch Hetchy itself).

In addition, all of the reviewers ask for substantially more clarity and detail on the methodology, as well as a more comparative analysis of in which the performance of the metrics developed in this work are held up against the host of sustainability metrics that have already been developed. The reviewers' request for this type of analysis seems reasonable and it would appear that they feel such an analysis will be important to establishing whether this work represents an advance.

There are a number of less serious concerns that the reviewers express as well, but no discussion of these here seems necessary.

The nature of the revision required to satisfy the reviewers would seem to fall into the category of "Major", and the reviewers have asked to re-review the revised manuscript, so I hope the authors will undertake a comprehensive effort to address the reviewers concerns.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 12, 11291, 2015.

C6577