

Interactive comment on “Comparison of methods for separating flood frequency of reservoir by sub-seasons” by J. Li et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 5 January 2016

Manuscript version: hessd-12-10431-2015.pdf; Title: Comparison of methods for separating flood frequency of reservoir by sub-seasons; Authors: J. Li, M. Xie, K. Xie, and R. Li; Url: <http://www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/12/10431/2015/hessd-12-10431-2015.pdf>;

After reading the manuscript, I do not think that the manuscript under review can pass the standard for publication in HESS. This is due to some of my main concerns below:

1. On Clarity: Methods were presented in an exceedingly confusing and unclear and imprecise manner. Results were then obscurely derived. Therefore it shows insufficient interest to HESS readers and fails to make a convincing case.
2. On Novelty: Obviously, this study presents no novelty to the existing state of the field covered by HESS.
3. On Referencing: The manuscript have over-cited (grey) papers/reports which were

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



written in Chinese or/and inaccessible to international readers. One can easily get lost in this hidden context.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 12, 10431, 2015.

HESD

12, C5975–C5976, 2016

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

C5976

