Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 12, C5728–C5729, 2015 www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/12/C5728/2015/ © Author(s) 2015. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.





Interactive Comment

Interactive comment on "A rainfall design method for spatial flood risk assessment: considering multiple flood sources" by X. Jiang and H. Tatano

E. Morin (Editor)

efrat.morin@mail.huji.ac.il

Received and published: 21 December 2015

Two reviewers have read this manuscript. They both found the paper interesting but raised substantial problems. In addition to the reviewers' comments, it is not clear if any improvement was achieved using the proposed method. It should be demonstrated that the problem of risk assessment for basins with a different response for different tributaries is indeed solved using the suggested method as compared to current practice. Another point - the authors raise a problem that in general relates to spatial heterogeneity of the basin which is of course a most important one. However, they handle only a very specific aspect of this spatial heterogeneity. The proposed solution is a method that modifies the current practice by accounting for several concentration time intervals. I am not sure this modification justifies a standalone scientific paper. Although it is in-





teresting to examine the copula of max rain intensities for different concentration time intervals, I could not identify what new understanding is presented, or, alternatively, whether an improvement was actually gained for the risk assessment practice?

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 12, 8005, 2015.

HESSD

12, C5728-C5729, 2015

Interactive Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

