

Interactive comment on “Does the Budyko curve reflect a maximum power state of hydrological systems? A backward analysis” by M. Westhoff et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 1 October 2015

I read this paper with a great interest. Considering Budyko curve as an optimized result is an inspiring idea. The paper is well-written and technically sound. I see great contribution of this paper to HESS. This paper is almost ready for publication except for minor corrections that authors already expressed to implement.

I have little comment to make on specific details as this paper is of high standard. Rather, I would like to make a general inquiry. As described in introduction, there have been previous attempts to investigate Budyko curve from optimization framework such as maximum entropy production. In this paper, authors used maximum power approach. It is curious how the maximum power principle works and how it is compared

C3977

with other principles. Well this is beyond the scope of this paper. However, it would be very nice if authors can comment on this somewhere in the manuscript. Or it can be a subject of future study.

Again, I find this paper is of high standard. I have been picky reviewer in many occasions and it is my great pleasure to encounter such a high quality manuscript. Thank you.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 12, 7821, 2015.