

Interactive comment on “Review and classification of indicators of green water availability and scarcity” by J. F. Schyns et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 11 August 2015

Article HESSD-12-5519-2015 “Review and classification of indicators of green water availability and scarcity” reviews the existing green water indicators of green water availability and scarcity. They further highlight the importance of including the green water more on the water scarcity discussions.

I find the article very timely and good effort to summarise the existing knowledge. The article needs, however, some amendments before publication. I have some comments below which hopefully help to revise the article:

1. I agree on the Reviewer #1’s comment on “aim for better conceptual clarity, not just a mechanical listing of existing indicators, irrespective of their soundness”. I found the review indeed somewhat a mechanical list of indicators. It is as such a good start for

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



more comprehensive review. I would thus recommend authors to revise the writing style from listing to more discussive style.

2. The review would, in my opinion, benefit of one table where authors could list the assessed meta-classes of reviewed indicators with, for example, a brief content of them and possible restrictions. I agree with the authors, that the detail list of each indicator should be in appendix.

3. It should be made clear in the introduction whether there are some existing review articles on here reviewed issues, e.g. drought indicators, etc. I.e. it needs to be clearly justified that there is not this kind of review available already.

4. Different definitions of blue and green water should be discussed more in Section 2.3, as commented by Reviewer #1.

5. The language is in general fine, but could benefit of careful language check

6. Method developed by Gerten et al (2011) include also blue water (i.e. irrigation). This should be mentioned and further discussed whether it is important to include blue water to e.g. Hoekstra et al (2011), if it is not already included there. And if it is, it should be again mentioned and discussed.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 12, 5519, 2015.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper