Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 12, C1323–C1324, 2015 www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/12/C1323/2015/
© Author(s) 2015. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



Interactive comment on "Water savings potentials of irrigation systems: dynamic global simulation" by J. Jägermeyr et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 6 May 2015

I found the paper to be well written and the research to be of such high quality and presentation that I recommended this paper be highlighted in HESS. The dataset provided in this manuscript is of critical importance to understanding water availability and use at the global scale and I would expect this paper to have immediate impact in the global modeling community. I also commend the authors on providing an evaluation of their simulation results in the context of past values reported in the literature (Section 3.4) and in providing a discussion of the modeling issues that were encountered (Section 4.2).

I have no substantial comments but I do have a few minor comments on the manuscript that I have provided below.

C1323

- p. 3597, line 8: Change "referred to" to "referenced"
- p. 3597, line 9: Change "but" to "yet still"
- p. 3597, line 16: Add a reference to LPJmL. The "(see below)" phase had be look for a section later in the paper titled LPJmL but it was not clear where the discussion of the model can be found later. A reference here would rectify that. Also, add a reference after PCR-GLOBWB. Consider adding a sentence at the end of the statements about these two models to explain why LPJmL was then selected for these simulations.
- p. 3598 line 23 to p. 3599 line 2. This sentence should go in Section 2.2 and not in Section 2.1.

Sections 2.2 and 2.3 titles: Add to the end of the section title "...in LPJmL". Then it is clear to the reader where the discussion of the LPJmL model is located in the paper.

- p. 3604, lines 20-27: Please give another 1-2 sentences about crops C4 and C3. Add a reference to the classification. I had to look this up to understand what the differences are and where this designation originates.
- p. 3608, line 6: Instead of "new irrigation scheme" be specific about the scheme used so it is immediately clear to the reader.
- p. 3608, line 7: Use a semi-colon instead of a comma after "2009"
- p. 3608, line 15: Should read "However, on a global average"

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 12, 3593, 2015.