

Interactive comment on “Modeling suspended sediment sources and transport in the Ishikari River Basin, Japan using SPARROW” by W. Duan et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 17 January 2015

This paper demonstrates an application of the SPARROW suspended solid water quality model to the Ishikari River Basin in Japan. The paper is well written and easy to read. I have a few comments and questions:

1. Line 14, P. 11038: I believe the unit of the mean annual SS flux should be (kg yr^{-1}) .
2. Line 6, P. 11049: Same comment as above. Also, are you sure the unit of MSE is $\text{kg km}^{-2} \text{yr}^{-1}$?
3. P. 11060: The calibration results in Table 2 look strange. For Forest Land, I don't understand why the P value can be 0.011 given that parameter estimate and standard

C6109

error are 75.554 and 123.79, respectively. The parameter estimate is statistically insignificant ($t = 75.554/123.79 = 0.61$) and is inconsistent with the P value. Why is that? There are several other parameters which have similar problems.

4. I suggest that the authors go over the paper carefully to make sure everything is correct.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 11, 11037, 2014.