Hydrology and
Earth System
Sciences
Discussions

Open Access

Interactive comment on "Testing gridded land precipitation data and precipitation and runoff reanalyses (1982–2010) between 45 S and 45 N with Normalized Difference Vegetation Index data" *by* S. O. Los

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 12 January 2015

General Comments

The paper is sensibly-structured and clearly written. Objectives are established and then logically pursued. Figures are clearly labelled and provide useful information in support of the findings and arguments.

Specific Comments

2.2.1 (CRU Precipitation) There is no acknowledgement of the 'station count' files which

are available alongside the data and which would allow data to be excluded where they are sourced from climatology rather than observation. Given that errors are being identified this might have been a good place to start. If not, then that should be explained.

2.2.2 (GPCP Precipitation) There is no acknowledgement of the extensive error estimates and related documentation for this dataset. As for the comment on 2.2.1, this might have been a useful contribution. Again, if not then that needs to explained.

2.3.1 (NCEP/NCAR Reanalysis) This is ambiguous as to which version of the reanalysis products is used. Version 1 covers 1948-present (1949 is mentioned in the text), and version 2 covers 1979-present (this is the version described in the referenced paper, Kanamitsu et al., 2002). The 'Acknowledgements' section specifies v1, but then the Kanamitsu refence is wrong? http://www.esrl.noaa.gov/psd/data/gridded/tables/subdaily.html

3 (Analysis) It could be instructive to make use of the error-related data and documentation for CRU TS and GPCP.

4.1.3 (Temporal deviations in tropical N. Africa) In paragraph 2 & Fig. 8, why is GPCP excluded? A reason should be given.

Technical Corrections

2.2.1 (CRU Precipitation) The dataset is called 'CRU TS 3.21'.

2.2.3 (TRMM) Delete 'mission' on first line.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 11, 13175, 2014.