Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 11, C5762–C5763, 2014 www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/11/C5762/2014/ © Author(s) 2014. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



HESSD 11, C5762–C5763, 2014

> Interactive Comment

Interactive comment on "Do changes in climate or vegetation regulate evapotranspiration and streamflow trends in water-limited basins?" by Q. Liu et al.

B. van den Hurk (Editor)

hurkvd@knmi.nl

Received and published: 19 December 2014

The paper is improved a bit but does not answer all the questions raised by the reviewers:

- The title on the revised manuscript does not reflect the title in the reply
- A major comment was the poor justification of the assumed positive relationship between Ze and annual precip. I prefer not to give a long set of equations, but to provide a figure of how Ze varies with P in your model, and comment on the shape



Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



of this figure using biophysical arguments such as those proposed by Schenk and Jackson (2002).

- In section 4 you discuss the relative influence of P, Ze, alpha and Ep on the actual evaporation. However, Ze is not an independent quantity as it depends on P. So the relative influence of these factors is not clear. Also it is not obvious how I can deduce the order of importance (P > Ze > alpha > Ep) from the figures you show. This needs more clarification
- The caption of Figure 2 misses a description of the period over which the trend is shown
- The chosen color scale in figure 4 does not print very well
- Figure 5 misses a significance indication, such as provided in Fig 6
- I suggest to combine the upper and lower panels in Figure 6 by showing the significant grid points by a small dot or shading on top of the value. And a plot of the difference between the scenarios would be interesting as well
- Fig 7a and 7b seem to be exactly complementary (and adding up to 1). You can consider to use only one figure
- The english still needs improvement

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 11, 11183, 2014.

11, C5762-C5763, 2014

Interactive Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

