Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 11, C520–C521, 2014
www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/11/C520/2014/

Hydrology and Earth System Sciences
Discussions

Interactive comment on "Evaluation of drought regimes and impacts in the Limpopo basin" *by* B. F. Alemaw and J.-M. Kileshye-Onema

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 19 March 2014

I read the manuscript with great interest since it addresses the critical issue of drought in Africa.

The manuscript reflects on an essential theme: the idea about the complexity drought. However, the manuscript's ideas have been analysed in numerous occasions and recently by the same authors. I am not convinced that this work is sufficiently distinct to warrant publication in this journal. There have been a series of very similar studies that have come to broadly similar conclusions.

I'm also not convinced that one can define a sustainability, risk and resiliency of agriculture as presented by the authors. This leads on to another issue: that the analysis presented has limitations for understanding the complexity of drought and therefore for

Full Screen / Esc
Printer-friendly Version
Interactive Discussion
Discussion Paper

informing policy.

It is not clear the link of simulated parameters to observations, both in the meteorological and agricultural drought analysis, therefore questioning if the thresholds suggested are validated. Not taking these issues into account lessens the inferences that can be drawn from studies such as this.

Finally, the analysis of the limited data presented in very shallow, the results are not justified, and therefore the conclusions are not justified.

Having said all of this, it is important to note that the manuscript is interesting and merits publication in some journal, probably a more general type of journal, since the analysis is very shallow.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 11, 199, 2014.