

Interactive comment on “Monitoring recent variations of the surface displacements of eight Nyainqêntanglha glaciers” by J. Shi and M. Menenti

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 17 March 2014

This study presents surface displacement estimates using remote sensing from two time periods for eight Tibetan Plateau glaciers. The main thing lacking in this study is a central motivation for the research. It is clear what the manuscript is reporting on but not entirely clear why. What is the novel thing here? Filling a data gap in the glacier research community is excellent but not entirely novel enough (on its own) for a contribution in Hydrological and Earth Systems Science. Specifically at the end of the introduction section, I miss a clear statement of the main goal of this study and how it is expected to contribute to the HESS community.

In addition, the authors might find that a glacier-centric or more regional journal would

C500

make a better home for the results of this study. This is clearly seen in the short Discussion section of the study. There is no real discussion or interpretation of the results put forward. Rather, the main results are restated. As such, the entire manuscript seems to be more appropriate as a technical study on remote sensing rather than a full research study. The “next steps” alluded to in the Conclusion section highlight this as well.

In addition to these major concerns, a review of the techniques to measure surface displacements of temperate glaciers is missing. This makes it impossible to gauge the advancement of the techniques applied in this work with respect to other approaches.

Finally, the language throughout is poor with many instances of incorrect grammar. Often the verb-noun agreement with regards to number is off. A much more thorough edit by the authors is required. Potentially consider consulting a professional editing service to fix the grammar throughout. In the minor comments, I have highlighted several of the editorial errors, but this list is not exhaustive. This manuscript needs extensive revision with regards to the writing and language.

Minor comments

P1556L23: Change “controllers” to “controls”

P1556L24: Sentence starting with “However” is poorly writing.

P1557L2: “Glacier”? This sentence is poorly written.

P1557L10: Missing “be”

P1559L4: Change “has” to “have”

P1562L16: You keep shifting between image and imagery. Which is it?

P1563L8: “culled”?

P1564L11: Change “~2” to “2”.

C501

P1564L14: Here and everywhere. Are the methods really accurate down to the millimeter scale? Check significant digits throughout.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 11, 1555, 2014.

C502