

1 **Nitrogen Dynamics and Associated Greenhouse Gases Emissions in Constructed**
2 **Wetlands: A Review**

3

4 M.M.R. Jahangir^{1, 2,*}, Owen Fenton², Laurence Gill¹, Christoph Müller^{3,4}, Paul Johnston¹, Karl G.
5 Richards²,

6

7 ¹Department of Civil, Structural & Environmental Engineering, Trinity College Dublin, Dublin 2,
8 Ireland;

9

10 ²Department of Environment, Soils & Land Use, Teagasc Environment Research Centre,
11 Johnstown Castle, Co. Wexford, Ireland;

12

13 ³School of Biology and Environmental Science, University College Dublin, Belfield, Ireland

14 ⁴Department of Plant Ecology (IFZ), Justus-Liebig University Giessen, Germany

15

16 * Correspondence: Teagasc Environment Research Centre

17 Johnstown Castle

18 Co. Wexford

19 Ireland

20 Tel: +353 (0) 53 9171200

21 E-mail: jahangim@tcd.ie

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34 **Abstract**

35 Wastewater, derived from various sources, contains levels of pollutants that exceed water quality
36 guidelines. Constructed wetlands (CWs) are a rising technology globally used to remove these
37 pollutants (e.g. carbon- C and nitrogen- N) from wastewater. The N removal efficiency of CWs is
38 very inconsistent and does not in itself reveal whether the removal processes are due to physical
39 attenuation or whether the different species have been transformed to other reactive forms
40 causing pollution swapping. There are many pathways by which the removed N can contribute to
41 water and air pollution: accumulation and adsorption in soils, leaching to groundwater (nitrate-
42 NO_3^- and ammonium- NH_4^+), emission to atmosphere via nitrous oxide- N_2O and ammonia and/or
43 conversion to di-nitrogen (N_2) gas. The kinetics of these pathways/processes varies with CW
44 management and therefore needs to be studied quantitatively, for their sustainable use. For
45 example, the quality of groundwater underlying CWs with regards to the reactive N (Nr) species
46 is largely unknown. Equally, there is a dearth of information on the extent of Nr accumulation in
47 soils and discharge to surface waters and air. Moreover, CWs are rich in dissolved organic carbon
48 (DOC) and produce substantial amounts of carbon dioxide (CO_2) and methane (CH_4). These
49 dissolved C species discharge to ground and surface waters and are emitted to the atmosphere.
50 The dynamics of dissolved N_2O , CO_2 and CH_4 in CWs is a key “loop hole” in global greenhouse
51 gas budgets. In this review we provide an overview of the current knowledge and discussion
52 about the dynamics of C and N in CWs and their likely impacts on aquatic and atmospheric
53 environments. We recommend that the fate of various N species in CWs and their surface
54 emissions and subsurface export need to be evaluated in a holistic way to better understand their
55 potential for pollution swapping. Research on process based N removal and balancing of end
56 products into reactive and benign forms is critical when assessing the environmental performance
57 of CWs. Thus we strongly suggest further detailed examinations of *in situ* N transformations and
58 the fate of such transformational products with respect to pollution swapping.

59

60 Keywords: Carbon, nitrogen, constructed wetlands, pollution swapping, nitrous oxide, methane

61

62 **1. Introduction**

63 Increasing anthropogenic loading of reactive N (Nr) along the nitrogen (N) cascade in the
64 environment raises many critical concerns for human health, drinking water quality (Gray, 2008),
65 coastal and marine water degradation causing eutrophication, as well as algal blooms and hypoxia
66 (Conley et al., 2009; Rabalais et al., 2010). There are natural sinks for Nr along the N cascade

67 (Galloway et al, 2003; Tanner et al., 2005) but other sinks that are rehabilitated or artificial, may
68 also be introduced and evaluated at key locations e.g. constructed wetlands (CWs) (Gold et al.,
69 2013) or permeable reactive interceptors (Fenton et al., 2014). Many investigations target single
70 contaminant remediation, whilst disregarding the reality of mixed contaminants entering and
71 leaving such systems. They do not consider the dynamic of pollution swapping (the increase in
72 one pollutant as a result of a measure introduced to reduce a different pollutant) driven by
73 transformational processes within and around the system. This review focuses on CWs which are
74 now an established technology used globally as a mitigation option for nutrient retention at the
75 delivery end of the transfer continuum (Dunne, et al., 2005; Sjøvik et al., 2006; Tanner and
76 Kadlec, 2013; Tanner and Sukias, 2011). They have been successfully used for treating domestic
77 sewage, urban runoff and storm water, industrial and agricultural wastewater, and leachate
78 (Scholz and Lee, 2005; Gill et al., 2014). In addition, CWs provide multi-faceted ecosystem
79 services that include both socio-economic and ecological aspects (Turner et al., 2008; Milder et
80 al., 2010; Lei et al., 2011). Although CWs have a proven potential for the removal of organic
81 matter and N, studies have shown that removal efficiencies have been highly variable, due to
82 inadequate observations of N transformations and their removal mechanisms (Seitzinger et al.,
83 2002) and lack of improved adoption and placement (Gold et al., 2013). The removal efficiencies
84 can vary with the types of CWs (i.e. surface flow and subsurface flow) and with types of plants
85 grown. CWs are complex bioreactors which facilitate a number of physical, chemical and
86 biological processes but often continue to be evaluated as a 'black box' in terms of process
87 understanding (Langergraber, 2008). The removal efficiencies can vary with the types of CWs
88 (i.e. surface flow and subsurface flow) and with types of plants grown.

89
90 Denitrification is the main mechanism in CWs to reduce nitrate (NO_3^- -N) but its intermediate
91 product, nitrous oxide (N_2O), is a potent greenhouse gas (GHG), causing 6% of anthropogenic
92 global warming as well as being the leading cause of stratospheric ozone depletion (Beaulieu et
93 al., 2011). It is known that CWs significantly contribute to atmospheric N_2O emissions either
94 directly to the atmosphere from the surface of the wetland as its byproduct (IPCC, 2014; Sjøvik et
95 al., 2006; Ström et al., 2007; Elberling et al., 20011; van der Zaag et al., 2010) or indirectly via
96 dissolved N_2O in the effluent or groundwater upon discharge to surface waters. The global
97 importance of this N_2O emission has been increasingly recognised (IPCC, 2014). Indirect N_2O
98 emissions from CWs effluents that discharge directly to aquatic environments have a default
99 emission factor (EF) of 0.005 but with a wide range (0.0005-0.25). The wide range of EF is
100 highlighting the large uncertainty, which warrants further refinement. Indeed, the production and

101 reduction processes of N_2O in the environment are not yet fully understood (Butterbatch-Bahl et
102 al., 2014).

103

104 In CWs soil organic N is degraded releasing ammoniacal-N which further undergoes
105 transformation to other forms. Ammonium can accumulate in CWs due to limited oxidation of
106 NH_4^+ in the reduced environment. For example, questions arise with respect to NH_4^+
107 concentrations in groundwater underlying the CWs (often higher in groundwater than the effluent
108 e.g. Harrington et al., 2007; Dzakpasu et al., 2012). Dissimilatory NO_3^- reduction to ammonium
109 (DNRA) occurring in wetland soils can contribute to ammonium (NH_4^+) pollution (Burgin et al.,
110 2013). Mass balance analysis of the different components of the N cycle and kinetics of the N
111 transformation processes occurring within the treatment cells using the isotope-tracing ^{15}N
112 technique can provide mechanistic information for N transformation products (Lee et al., 2009;
113 O’Luanaigh et al., 2010) and therefore can be used to start to answer such questions. Huygens, et
114 al. (2013) described two complementary stable isotope methods that can be used to determine N
115 cycle processes in CWs: i) the isotope pairing and revised isotope pairing techniques which
116 calculate total N_2 production by denitrification and anaerobic ammonium oxidation (anammox)
117 and ii) isotope dilution and tracing techniques which assess gross N transformation in wetland
118 soils. Denitrification in porewater samples can be measured by analysing samples for dissolved
119 N_2 in a membrane inlet mass spectrometer (MIMS; Kana et al., 1994) and N_2O in gas
120 chromatograph (GC; Jahangir et al., 2012). The studies of natural abundance of ^{15}N and ^{18}O ($\delta^{15}N$
121 and $\delta^{18}O$) in NO_3^- is an insightful tool for the investigation of the sources, fate and
122 transformational processes of N in a system (e.g. in shallow groundwater, Baily et al., 2011).
123 However, this analysis cannot in itself explain whether the denitrification process has occurred *in*
124 *situ* or if the gases have been transported from other soil zones to groundwater. A ^{15}N based
125 method could be developed to measure *in situ* N cycle processes and to understand the movement
126 (both upward and downward) of the N cycle products in wetland sediments. This would involve
127 incubation of intact laboratory soil columns from the site in question enriched with $^{15}NH_4^{14}NO_3$
128 and $^{14}NH_4^{15}NO_3$ kept at average site temperature (Huygens et al., 2013). The *in situ*
129 denitrification, DNRA and C dynamics of groundwater below the CWs can be elucidated in the
130 field with shallow piezometers or boreholes using push-pull investigations (Addy et al., 2002;
131 Jahangir et al., 2013; Burgin et al., 2013). These methods in combination will be able to provide a
132 comparative analysis of the rates of N transformation processes occurring in CWs. For example,
133 *in situ* quantification of the rates of NH_4^+ oxidation and denitrification in CWs will give insights
134 into their role in delivering NO_3^- and or NH_4^+ to groundwater and N_2O to the atmosphere.

135 CWs can either be sources or sinks of C (Whiting and Chanton, 2001) but only a few studies have
136 considered carbon dioxide (CO₂) efflux from CWs (Mander et al., 2008). CWs are characterised
137 by anaerobic conditions with low organic matter turnover (Augustin et al., 1998) but they also
138 release C back into the atmosphere (Clair et al., 2002). Wetlands can contribute to the dissolved
139 organic carbon (DOC) load transfer to ground and surface waters and can exchange substantial
140 amounts of CO₂ and methane (CH₄) with the atmosphere (Clair et al., 2002; Elberling et al.,
141 2011). CO₂ is lost by plant respiration and aerobic organic matter decomposition, whilst CH₄ is
142 lost by methanogenic activity during anaerobic decomposition of DOC. Methane is emitted from
143 wetlands due to anoxic or suboxic conditions that occur in the soils (Ström et al., 2007; Søvik et
144 al., 2006; Pangala et al., 2010). In addition to the positive aspects highlighted previously, CWs
145 can have negative climatic impacts (Ström et al., 2007), enhance pollution swapping (Reay,
146 2004) and act as an active source of GHGs (IPCC, 2014; Clair et al., 2002; Mander et al., 2008;
147 Mitsch and Gosselink, 2000). For example, van der Zaag et al. (2010) measured CH₄-C emissions
148 as 0.2- 27% of the total C removed and N₂O emissions as 0.1- 1.16% of the total N removed in
149 CWs. Estimation of GHG emissions from different CWs management systems, especially in
150 response to a changing climate, is poorly known. Consequently, the improved understanding of
151 integrated C and N dynamics is required to improve the CW management to optimise their
152 environmental benefits.

153

154 2. Removal Efficiency, Hydraulic Loading and Retention Time

155 In CWs used for wastewater treatment, the efficiency of OM removal is often satisfactory, but N
156 removal is generally limited. The limited removal can be caused by the typically reduced
157 environment that enhances NH₄⁺ accumulation and limits NH₄⁺ oxidation, in addition to the lower
158 denitrification rates due to lack of NO₃⁻ and N recycling by vegetation. On average, it appears
159 that 50% of the influent N can be removed but the removal rates are very inconsistent. A
160 summary of influent composition and their removal efficiencies is given in Table 1. In European
161 systems, for example, typical removal percentages of ammoniacal-N in long-term operation are c.
162 35% but can be enhanced if some pre-treatment procedures are followed (Verhoeven, and
163 Meuleman, 1999; Luederitz et al., 2001). O’Luanaigh et al. (2010) in a subsurface CW showed
164 41% N removal across a tertiary treatment system (receiving secondary treated effluent) with
165 little evidence of any seasonal change. In a single house domestic wastewater treatment using
166 CWs, Gill et al. (2012) has shown mean removal efficiencies of 33-36% of total N (TN) but did
167 not investigate the N cycling processes. To enhance such a low removal, the nature of N
168 transformations and the fate of the removed N within the CWs should be investigated. However,

169 to our knowledge, no study is available that provides a holistic evaluation of N attenuation and
170 transformations to other reactive N as losses to the atmosphere (N_2O , NH_3 , N_2) and receiving
171 surface waters or groundwater (NO_3^- , NH_4^+).

172

173 The removal efficiency of pollutants in CWs depends on hydraulic loading rates (HLR) and
174 hydraulic retention time (HRT) (Toet et al., 2005). **The effects of HLR and HRT can vary with
175 the nature of the use of CWs e.g. whether they are used for treating single or mixed contaminants.
176 Therefore, to have the least amount of Nr delivery to the receiving waters or to the atmosphere,
177 CWs need to be optimally designed with respect to HLR and HRT.** Investigation into the effects
178 of fluctuating hydraulic loadings (hydraulic pulsing) on N removal efficiency and its
179 transformation products will provide information about the potential of pollution swapping for
180 NO_3^- , NO_2^- , NH_3 , NH_4^+ and N_2O . If the dominant product is N_2 , the system will be more benign
181 to the environment than many of the other potential end products. If N is transformed into NH_4^+ it
182 should be fixed in the soils and subsoils but there is also the potential for transport to ground and
183 surface waters connected to CWs if the cation exchange sites become saturated. **However,
184 contrasting results on the impacts of hydraulic loadings on nutrients removal efficiency are
185 available in literature. Luo et al. (2005) reported that low HLR results in incomplete
186 denitrification, whereas Zhang et al. (2006) argued that low HLR increases NH_4^+ and chemical
187 oxygen demand (COD) removals by 25 and 11%, respectively. Several authors have used a wide
188 range of HLR and HRT to measure nutrient removal efficiency but experimental evidence is still
189 scarce (Toet et al., 2005). For example, Zhou and Hosomi (2008) constructed a surface flow
190 wetland with a HLR of $0.20 \text{ m}^3 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1}$ and an average water depth of 0.056 m. The authors
191 estimated the N removal efficiency in terms of a comparison between N inputs and outputs but
192 did not quantify how this rate corresponded to the different forms of the removed N. Similarly,
193 Song et al. (2011) reported an average HRT of 2.4 days during wetland operation periods for the
194 removal of NO_3^- and NH_4^+ without documented design optima or pollution swapping. The way in
195 which a CW performance is assessed can lead to different conclusions regards removal of Nr. For
196 future studies, evaluation of systems in a holistic manner, which include pollution swapping at
197 different HLRs and HRTs is important, particularly within the context of the changing
198 hydrological cycle in a changing climate. Also local legislative targets should be considered and
199 weighting factors (are GHGs more important than water quality targets) developed for different
200 species within the system to come up with overall balances for the CW. Thus far, estimates of
201 nutrient removal efficiencies are based on the subtraction of the concentrations of nutrients in the
202 effluent from the influent, but the transformation kinetics of the removed nutrients are unknown.**

203 A holistic assessment of ecologically engineered systems has been thoroughly outlined in Healy
204 et al. (2011) and developed further in Fenton et al. (2014). Such assessments can be applied in
205 evaluating nutrient dynamics in CWs. In a subsurface CW, O’Luanaigh et al. (2010) used ^{15}N
206 isotopes to show that N spiralling occurred between NH_4^+ to organic N and back to NH_4^+ within
207 the CW. So, studying the dynamics of N in CW systems is crucial because the forms of removed
208 N are particularly of concern with respect to their potential for pollution swapping; global
209 warming and water pollution. In addition to the estimation of nutrient removal rates,
210 investigations into the effect of HLR and HRT on the different forms of nutrients in the final
211 effluents and their fate in the natural environment are needed to address the pollution swapping
212 potential of CWs. In addition, the Nr delivered to groundwater can be transformed *in situ* to other
213 reactive or benign forms. Hence, quantification of such Nr loadings to groundwater and their *in*
214 *situ* consumption (e.g. N_2O to N_2) is required to understand their environmental consequences.

215

216 3. Accumulation of C and N in CWs Soils

217 The soil in CWs is a major sink for N. Data on the N accumulation (dissolved organic N- DON,
218 TN, NH_4^+ or NO_3^- -N) within the soil profile of various CWs are scarce as most studies focus on
219 N balances between influent and effluent N loads. The accumulation of N could be a substantial
220 part of the total N added to CWs; 30-40% (Shamir et al., 2001), 39% (Harrington et al., 2007),
221 9% (Mander et al., 2008) and 2.5% (Obarska-Pempkowiak and Gajewska, 2003). The wider
222 range of N accumulation could be due to variations in CW types and their management. The
223 accumulated species of N are rather reactive unless they are transformed to N_2 by biogeochemical
224 processes. For example, Shamir et al. (2001) measured about 80% of the total accumulated N as
225 organic and the remainder as NH_4^+ . The organic N could be mineralised to NH_4^+ and NO_3^- ,
226 reactive forms of N, depending on the physico-chemical properties of soil. The Nr could be
227 assimilated by plants and microbes living in CWs, which are recycled in a soil-plant-soil
228 continuum. Typically, N accumulation has been found to decrease with soil depth: for example,
229 Shamir et al. (2001) reported mean NH_4^+ concentrations in 0-0.15, 0.15-0.30 and 0.30-0.60 cm
230 depths of 156, 151, and 28 mg N kg^{-1} , respectively. However, dissolved nutrients can be
231 preferentially leached down into deeper soil layers via different pathways e.g. root channels. In
232 terms of the input-output balance, these are considered as removed N, but they remain in such a
233 biogeochemically active system. In addition to N, organic C accumulation occurs in CW soils. In
234 a gravel-bed CW, Nguyen (2000) measured 17.5, 16.2 and 3.6% of total C (TC) accumulation at
235 surface, 0-10 and 10-40 cm depth. As such, CWs represent organic C and Nr rich systems where
236 the products of the continuously occurring biogeochemical processes can be transported to fresh

237 waters and to the atmosphere. The NO_3^- could be denitrified to N_2O or N_2 and NH_4^+ could be
238 mineralised to NO_3^- or fixed in soil matrix. Estimation of the reaction kinetics of these processes
239 is required to accurately measure the fate of the added nutrients in CWs. With methodological
240 advancement, measurement of these processes is now possible. For example, application of ^{15}N
241 tracer technique ($^{15}\text{NO}_3^-$) can give insights into the NH_4^+ oxidation and fixation capacity of
242 sediments below CWs. Estimating the rates of nutrient accumulation in soil and subsoils and their
243 *in situ* transformation kinetics in various types of CWs is important. Elucidating the fate of these
244 added nutrients will help to reduce their potential for pollution swapping which has been ignored
245 so far in managing CWs. The stability of the accumulated C and N under changing climatic
246 scenarios also needs to be addressed to consider the long term sustainability of CWs.

247

248 4. C and N Dynamics and Greenhouse Gas Emissions

249 Processes involved in N removal and N transformations in wetlands include sedimentation of
250 particulates (Koskiaho, 2003); nitrification, denitrification and DNRA (Poach et al., 2003; Burgin
251 et al., 2013), microbial assimilation and plant uptake-release (Findlay et al., 2003), anammox and
252 DEAMOX (DEnitrifying AMmonium OXidation). Müller et al. (2014) developed a ^{15}N tracing
253 model, which is able to identify four different pathways of NO_2^- reduction to N_2O : i) reduction of
254 NO_2^- associated with nitrification, ii) reduction of NO_2^- associated with denitrification, iii)
255 reduction of NO_2^- associated with organic N oxidation, and iv) co-denitrification, a hybrid
256 reaction where one N atom in NO_2^- originates from organic N and the other from NO_2^- reduction
257 via denitrification. Most of these pathways transfer Nr (mainly NH_4^+ and N_2O) to the
258 environment, however, some pathways can convert Nr to N_2 (e.g. denitrification, anammox and
259 DEAMOX). During denitrification, NO_3^- is used as a terminal electron acceptor to produce N_2 or
260 N_2O (Starr and Gillham, 1993). Anammox can remove NO_2^- and NH_4^+ as N_2 in CWs when the
261 existing environment is hypoxic. The DEAMOX can remove NO_3^- and NH_4^+ as N_2 where NO_3^- is
262 converted to NO_2^- by autotrophic denitrification with sulphide (Kalyuznyi et al., 2006).
263 Denitrification has been estimated to be a significant N removal process but actual quantification
264 data are scarce. Limited studies have estimated N losses by denitrification e.g. 19% (Mander et
265 al., 2008) and 86% (Obarska-Pempkowiak and Gajewska, 2003) of the total N input based on the
266 mass balance study. To our knowledge, no data are available on denitrification measurements in
267 soil/subsoils of surface flow CWs.

268

269 In addition, the two other processes that can remove Nr from the CWs (anammox and
270 DEAMOX) are not well understood and so it is crucial to identify which of the processes are
271 occurring in a specific type of CW and at what rate they occur. Once a process that provides N₂
272 as the end product is determined in a specific system then the CW management could be directed
273 towards enhancement of that process. Hence, quantifying the rates of these processes under
274 various CW types is required for improved N management towards lowering Nr in the
275 environment. There is large uncertainty about the processes involved and their magnitude. Many
276 studies focus on the mass balance approach and use the difference as the rate of N attenuation.
277 N₂O emissions from CWs have been reported to be high (EF 0.005; IPCC, 2014) but there is
278 large uncertainty around these values due to the limited scope of the research that has been
279 carried out to quantify such processes. The enhanced reduction of N₂O to N₂ needs further
280 elucidation.

281

282 Similarly, C transformations involve respiration, fermentation, methanogenesis, CH₄ oxidation
283 and reduction of S, Fe and NO₃⁻. Anaerobic methane oxidation coupled with denitrification, a
284 recently proposed pathway of the C cycle (á Norði and Thamdrup, 2014; Haroon et al., 2013;
285 Islas-Lima et al., 2004), can reduce CH₄ emissions in CWs. The C removal processes are
286 sedimentation, microbial assimilation, gaseous emissions, dissolved C losses through water to
287 ground and surface water bodies and chemical fixation (bonding with chemical ions). As CWs
288 are designed to remove pollutants in an anaerobic/suboxic environment, they change the C and N
289 dynamics and contribute significantly to CH₄ and N₂O emissions (Johansson et al., 2002, 2003;
290 Mander et al., 2005, 2008; Stadmark and Leonardson, 2005; Liikanen et al., 2006). The
291 hydrological, chemical and microbial processes of CWs are likely to be different from the
292 processes occurring in more natural wetlands, because they receive nutrient rich waters from
293 various sources. Increased nutrients and organics inputs will increase the productivity of wetland
294 ecosystems and increase the production of GHGs. Søvic et al. (2006) measured N₂O, CH₄ and
295 CO₂ emissions in various CWs in different European countries and suggested that the potential
296 atmospheric impacts of CWs should be examined as their development is increasing globally.
297 Ström et al. (2007) recommended that CW management processes must consider the negative
298 climatic aspects of increased emissions of GHGs in addition to their primary functions.
299 Therefore, estimation of the contribution of CWs to global warming is required. Modelling or up-
300 scaling of GHG emissions at national and regional scales to a global scale is important to improve
301 global GHG budgets. The use of CWs to improve water quality is likely to increase to meet

302 policy drivers such as the European Union Water Framework Directive and so the uncertainty of
303 GHG budgets needs to be reduced to prevent pollution swapping.

304

305 In this regard, measurement of spatial and temporal variations (seasonal and diurnal) of GHG
306 emissions is required. Moreover, plant mediated GHG emissions could be an important
307 component of total emissions but research in this area is very limited. The GHG from CWs can
308 vary with vegetated and non-vegetated systems. Vegetation and its composition affect the
309 nutrient dynamics and the production, consumption and transport of greenhouse gases and hence
310 their exchange between wetlands and atmosphere (Ström et al., 2003, 2005; Sövic et al., 2006;
311 Johansson et al., 2003). Emergent plants can transport atmospheric O₂ to rooting zone and
312 contribute to C and N dynamics in wetland soils e.g. N₂O and CO₂ production and CH₄
313 consumption (Brix, 1997). Vascular plants can exchange GHGs between the rooting zone and
314 atmosphere (Yavitt and Knapp, 1998). Emissions of N₂O and CH₄ in CWs can vary across CW
315 typologies e.g. surface flow or subsurface flow (Van der Zaag et al., 2010). Therefore, the
316 assessment of GHG emissions in various types of CW (surface flow, subsurface flow; vertical
317 and horizontal), under different management systems (vegetated, nonvegetated, plant species
318 composition) and usage (municipal waste water, agricultural runoff, landfill leachate) is
319 necessary in light of the national and global GHG budgets and mitigation of GHG emissions. In
320 addition, such measurements will help scientists, environmental managers and policy makers to
321 adopt environmental friendly construction and management of CWs. Assessment of the reactive
322 versus the benign forms of C and N transformation products in various types of CWs will give
323 insights into their environmental friendly design and management.

324

325 5. Surface Emissions vs. Subsurface Export of C and N

326 Dissolved GHGs in porewater in wetland soils and subsoils can be emitted to the atmosphere by
327 transpiration of vascular plants (from within the rooting zone) and via groundwater, upon
328 discharge to the surface waters. Dissolved GHGs in groundwater can flow towards surface waters
329 by advective transport and or by dispersion of groundwater. The GHGs produced in soils/subsoils
330 in CWs can also be emitted to the atmosphere by ebullition and diffusion. Elberling et al. (2011)
331 reported that in wetlands, the transport of subsurface soil gases occurs both via diffusive transport
332 in the pores and through the vascular plants. In addition to measuring the surface emissions,
333 Ström et al. (2007) also measured a considerable quantity of CH₄ in porewater and found a
334 significant correlation ($p = 0.021$) between the surface emissions and porewater CH₄
335 concentrations in vegetated wetlands. Measuring porewater GHGs and linking these to the

336 surface emissions and subsurface export to groundwater below CWs will help to estimate a better
337 GHG balance from both a national and global context. Elberling et al. (2011) linked subsurface
338 gas concentrations in wetlands to the surface fluxes using a diffusion model which has
339 demonstrated the need for future studies on subsurface GHG production, consumption and net
340 GHG emissions in CWs ecosystem in a climate change context. It is important to characterise
341 soils and subsoils physical and hydraulic properties and to assess their potential to percolate
342 dissolved nutrients and gases to the underlying groundwater. To our knowledge, this indirect
343 pathway of GHG emissions from CWs has never been reported despite the fact that this would
344 appear to have a high biogeochemical potential to produce and exchange GHGs. The balance
345 between N and C input and output flows between CWs and aquatic and atmospheric
346 environments together with the direct and indirect emissions of C and N species could be an
347 important input to global C and N budgets.

348

349 6. Hydrogeochemistry below CWs

350 CWs can be designed with or without a clay liner or a compacted soil bed at the base, which can
351 lead to large differences in permeability of the underlying layers. The variation in permeability of
352 a CW soil bed will affect solute, nutrient and GHG flows and their interactions with the
353 underlying groundwater (Dzakpasu et al., 2012; 2014). Groundwater hydrogeochemistry below
354 CWs can therefore provide a unique insight into such interactions. An example of such
355 interactions would be between nutrient rich water discharging from CW cells mixing with
356 laterally moving regional groundwater. It should be noted that groundwater can also discharge
357 into CWs depending on the hydraulic gradients. This necessitates that multiple multi-level
358 piezometers or boreholes are installed at such sites to elucidate groundwater flow direction,
359 hydraulic gradients and hydraulic permeability. Such monitoring networks allow water samples
360 to be taken and then sources of nutrients in the groundwater body below CWs can be identified.
361 For example, natural abundance of N ($\delta^{15}\text{N}$) and oxygen ($\delta^{18}\text{O}$) can be used to identify the
362 sources of NO_3^- and infer transformational processes responsible for concentrations in
363 groundwater (Baily et al., 2011). The local site hydrology (precipitation, groundwater table
364 fluctuations and evapotranspiration) has greater impacts on the pollutant removal by physical
365 attenuation and by biochemical transformations. Hydrogeochemical studies on an accurate spatial
366 and temporal resolution should explain the effects of precipitation on nutrient removal by dilution
367 as well in situ nutrient turnover. Despite conditions within CWs being saturated throughout the
368 year, changes in the water table elevation affect the oxygen (O_2) concentrations in CWs which is

369 key parameter for the biogeochemistry of soils and subsoils. For example, lowering the water
370 level increases the O₂ concentrations and accelerates soil OM decomposition, thereby increasing
371 CH₄ oxidation and CO₂ emissions. Highly contrasting results on gas emissions with fluctuating
372 water levels have been reported and the controlling mechanisms are unclear (Elberling et al.,
373 2011). Effective CW management requires an understanding of the effects of wetland hydrology
374 on the physical and biochemical attenuation of nutrients in order to assess their impacts on the
375 surface emissions and subsurface export of nutrients and GHGs. Data on the species of N in
376 groundwater below the CWs are required to provide an in-depth understanding of wetland
377 ecosystem services, particularly if CW systems have the potential to leak pollutants down into the
378 groundwater (Dzakpasu et al., 2014). A study on a clay lined CW system reported that the
379 nutrient content in the underlying groundwater to be NH₄⁺-N 4.0 mg L⁻¹, NO₃⁻-N 0.2 mg L⁻¹ and
380 molybdenum reactive phosphorus (MRP) <0.01mg L⁻¹. The elevated NH₄⁺-N indicates transport
381 of nutrient from the CW to groundwater through leakage or *in situ* N transformations such as
382 DNRA. However, the impact of CWs on the local underlying groundwater quality has been
383 seldom assessed. Linking geochemistry of groundwater below CWs to site hydrology, water table
384 fluctuations and soil/subsoils physico-chemical properties is required to elucidate the major
385 environmental drivers of C and N removal and or pollution swapping.

386

387 7. Methodological Developments

388 Quantification of the occurrence and magnitude of N transformations and hydrochemical
389 properties is crucial to improve the assessment of CW ecosystem services and to minimize their
390 potential for pollution swapping. With the recent advancement of isotope pairing and dilution
391 techniques, single or simultaneously occurring N transformation processes in CWs can be
392 quantified in laboratory or *in situ* conditions (Huygens et al., 2013; Müller et al., 2014). The
393 isotope technique relies on the introduction of a known amount of ¹⁵N into the CW system and
394 then quantification of N concentrations and isotopic compositions through different N pools after
395 incubation for a specific period. Laboratory methods involve collection of intact soil/sediment
396 cores, with subsequent incubation in the laboratory. The *in situ* field techniques involve release of
397 ¹⁵N solution *in situ* in the CWs soils. The *in situ* stable isotope techniques may be an appropriate
398 tool for the determination of simultaneously occurring N transformation processes in wetland
399 soils (Huygens et al, 2013).

400

401 Details of the application of isotope pairing/ revised isotope pairing techniques and isotope
402 dilution/ tracing techniques have been presented elsewhere (Huygens et al., 2013). In brief,

403 incubation of intact soil cores with differentially labelled $^{15}\text{NH}_4^{14}\text{NO}_3$ and $^{14}\text{NH}_4^{15}\text{NO}_3$ can be
404 used to quantify the rates of different N transformation processes ((Rütting and Müller, 2008).
405 The quantification of simultaneously occurring N transformation rates rely on the analysis with
406 appropriate ^{15}N tracing models. Development in the recent years in ^{15}N tracing techniques is now
407 available, which are able to identify process specific NO_2^- pools (Rütting and Müller, 2008),
408 pathways specific N_2O production and emission as well as $\text{N}_2\text{O}/\text{N}_2$ ratios (Müller et al., 2014).
409 Traditional techniques for investigation of gross N dynamics in sediments (Blackburn, 1979)
410 should be combined with the latest ^{15}N tracing techniques where all N transformation rates are
411 included that are important in wetlands and under anoxic condition (Huygens et al., 2013). Thus,
412 current models should consider processes such as anammox and/or DEAMOX and then be tested
413 in CW environments under various conditions. The *in situ* NO_3^- push-pull method has been used
414 to determine denitrification in shallow groundwater (<3 m) in riparian wetlands (Addy et al.,
415 2002; Kellogg et al., 2005) and in deep groundwater in arable/grassland (Jahangir et al., 2013).
416 This method can be used in CW sites using piezometers or boreholes screened at different
417 intervals to investigate *in situ* C and N dynamics. In this method the parameters of importance
418 to be analysed are $^{15}\text{N}_2\text{O}$, $^{15}\text{N}_2$, $^{15}\text{NO}_3^-$, and $^{15}\text{NH}_4^+$. In addition measurements of DOC and gases
419 (CO_2 and CH_4) will provide insights into the C consumption and transformation associated with
420 the N transformations.

421

422 Carbon and N dynamics are influenced by the interacting effects of soil conditions with microbial
423 community structure and functioning. Occurrence of C and N cycling processes are controlled by
424 the environment which involves transcription of genes, translation of messenger RNA and
425 activity of enzymes (Firestone et al., 2012). As such, activities of microbial communities under
426 various environmental conditions and how these contribute to C and N dynamics is a very
427 important area of future research (Müller and Clough, 2013). Molecular approaches can be
428 important tools to identifying and quantifying the genes that code for enzymes mediating C and N
429 cycles (Peterson et al., 2012). These tools help assess the relationships among genes,
430 environmental controllers and the rates of C and N processes.

431

432 **8. Conclusions and Recommendations**

433 The transformational processes on a mixture of contaminants within and below CWs can cause
434 pollution swapping. A holistic assessment of C and N dynamics in CWs is needed to fully
435 understand their removal, transport and impact on water quality and emissions to the atmosphere.

436 Mixed contaminants entering CWs and those formed within and underneath CWs during
437 transformational processes must be considered in future studies. The overall balance of these
438 constituents will decide on whether a CW is a pollution source or a sink. This will necessitate a
439 higher degree of multi-level spatial and temporal monitoring and use of multi-disciplinary
440 techniques both *in* and *ex situ* to fully characterise all pathways of C and N loss.

441

442 Leakages of nutrients and gases from CWs to groundwater can only be elucidated through the
443 techniques itemised herein and a better understanding of the transformation processes along a
444 **vertical geochemical gradient** from the CW into the underlying aquifer. The reactive versus the
445 benign forms of the N transformation products should be evaluated in various CWs. An
446 understanding of how N removal occurs and how losses of N and associated gases impact water
447 and air quality is required. Denitrification, DEAMOX and anammox are the processes which
448 remove N to its benign form (N₂) and all other processes produce only reactive forms of N. Data
449 on **when, where and at what rates denitrification, DEAMOX and anammox occur in CWs are**
450 **needed as well as what are the key factors that control such processes. The provenance of NH₄⁺ in**
451 **groundwater below CW cells needs clarification and its impact on down gradient receptors.**

452

453 **This review shows that CWs have the potential to produce N₂O, DON, DOC, DIC, CO₂ and CH₄**
454 **and that the GHGs produced in CWs can be emitted to the atmosphere. They can also be exported**
455 **to fresh waters via groundwater and degassed upon discharge to surface waters. Moreover, the**
456 **DOC and DIC transferred to the fresh water sediments (rivers and lakes) can produce GHGs that**
457 **in turn get emitted to the atmosphere. Therefore, it is important to know the concentrations of**
458 **dissolved C and N species and the rates of production and consumption of GHGs in groundwater**
459 **below CWs. The amount of C and N exported from terrestrial ecosystem via the subsurface**
460 **pathway to fresh waters has been the missing piece of our understanding of global C and N**
461 **budgets. It is clear that data on the various C and N species along with the GHGs in various CWs**
462 **systems are thus crucial to make a robust input-output balance of C and N in such a rising and**
463 **engineered ecosystem. Spatial and temporal variation in N₂O emissions in CWs under different**
464 **management systems is critical to get much more rigorous estimates of N₂O emission factors.**
465 **These data will bring down the existing uncertainties in global C and N budgets.**

466

467 **Managing wetting and drying spells (pulsing hydrology) in CWs can enhance mineralisation of**
468 **organic N and oxidation of NH₄⁺ to NO₂⁻/NO₃⁻ and then denitrification/anammox could transform**
469 **these species to benign N₂. This requires more research into the N cycle processes over the**

470 wetting drying spells which is now possible with the advancement in ^{15}N tracing and modelling
471 techniques. With the recent advancement of isotope pairing and dilution techniques single or
472 simultaneously occurring N transformation processes can be quantified. The isotope based
473 techniques can also be extended to other elements e.g., a ^{33}P tracing model has been developed
474 recently to study phosphorous cycle in soil (Müller and Bünemann, 2014). Further reducing the
475 saturated hydraulic conductivity below the wetland bed will help reduce nutrients leaching to
476 groundwater below the CWs cells. The selection of plant species is important to increase
477 nutrients removal, sequester more C and decrease greenhouse gas emissions which is an area that
478 still requires more research across types of CWs and countries. More research is also still needed
479 to be done on the impacts of hydraulic retention time on nutrients dynamics and removal.
480 Subsurface export of nutrients and GHGs to groundwater through leachates, preferential flow
481 paths created by dead roots and holes of burrowing invertebrates and subsequent transport to
482 surface water bodies should be accounted in CW management. Rates of nutrient accumulation or
483 fixation in soils and their *in situ* transformation in CWs need to be quantified to know their
484 contribution to C sequestration fate in the environment. Estimation of GHG production in CWs,
485 their consumption and emissions to the atmosphere in a changing climate is urgent. The
486 ecosystems services from CW will make them an attractive option for water pollution mitigation
487 while providing an important aquatic habitat, but their integrated impact on environmental quality
488 needs to be addressed in a holistic manner to avoid unwanted side effects.

489

490 Acknowledgements

491 The research was funded by Irish Research Council and Department of Agriculture, Food and
492 Marine in Association with The University of Dublin, Trinity College

493

494 Author's Contributions

495 The first author, M.M.R. Jahangir has reviewed articles in the relevant area, analysed results and
496 identified knowledge gaps and prepared the draft paper. All co-authors were directly involved in
497 preparation of the paper and edited the paper for its improvement.

498 References

- 499 á Norði, K. and Thamdrup, B.: Nitrate-dependent anaerobic methane oxidation in a freshwater
500 sediment, *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*, 132, 141-150, 2014.
- 501 Addy, K., Kellogg, D.Q., Gold, A.J., Groffman, P.M., Ferendo, G., and Sawyer, C.: *In situ* push-
502 pull method to determine groundwater denitrification in riparian zones, *J. Environ. Qual.*,
503 31, 1017-1024, 2002.

- 504 Augustin, J., Merbach, W., and Rogasik, I.: Factors influencing nitrous oxide and methane
505 emissions from minerotrophic fens in northeast Germany, *Biol. Fertil. Soils*, 28, 1-4,
506 1998.
- 507 Baily, A., Rock, L., Watson, C.J., and Fenton, O.: Spatial and temporal variations in groundwater
508 nitrate at an intensive dairy farm in south-east Ireland: Insights from stable isotope data,
509 *Agril. Ecosuysts. Environ.*, 308-318, 2011.
- 510 Beaulieu, J.J., Tank, J.L., Hamilton, S.K., Wollheim, W.M., Hall, R.O., Mulholland, P.J.: Nitrous
511 oxide emission from denitrification in stream and river networks, *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.*,
512 108, 214–219, 2011.
- 513 Blackburn, T.H.: Methods for measuring rates of NH_4^+ turnover in anoxic marine sediments,
514 using a $^{15}\text{N-NH}_4^+$ dilution technique, *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.*, 37(4), 760-765, 1979.
- 515 Brix, H.: Do macrophytes play a role in constructed treatment wetlands, *Water Sci. Technol.*, 35,
516 11-17, 1997.
- 517 Burgin, A.J., Hamilton, S.K., Gardner, W.S., and McCarthy, M.J.: Nitrate reduction,
518 denitrification, and dissimilatory nitrate reduction to ammonium in wetland sediments, in:
519 R.D. DeLaune, K.R. Reddy, C.J. Richardson, and J.P. Megonigal, (Eds.), *Methods in*
520 *Biogeochemistry of Wetlands*, SSSA Book Series, no. 10, Madison, USA, 307-325, 2013.
- 521 Butterbach-Bahl, K., Baggs, E.M., DannenmannM., Kiese, R., and Zechmeister-Boltenstern, S.:
522 Nitrous oxide emissions from soils, how well do we understand the processes and their
523 controls, *Philosop. Transac. Royal Soc. London*, B368 (20130122), 16-21, 2013.
- 524 Clair, T.A., Arp, P., Moore, T.R., Dalva, M., and Meng, F.R.: Gaseous carbon dioxide and
525 methane, as well as dissolved organic carbon losses from a small temperate wetland under
526 a changing climate, *Environ. Pollut.*, 116(1), S143-S148, 2002.
- 527 Conley, D.J., Paerl, H.W., Howarth, R.W. Boesch, D.F., Seitzinger, S.P., Havens, K.E., Lancelot,
528 C., and Likens, G.E.: Controlling eutrophication: Nitrogen and phosphorus, *Science*, 323,
529 1014–1015, 2009.
- 530 Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government (DEHLG): Integrated
531 constructed wetlands: Guidance document for farmyard soiled water and domestic
532 wastewater applications, November 2010, Dublin, pp. 23-30, 2010.
- 533 Dunne, E.J., Culleton, N., O'Donovan, G., Harrington, R., and Olsen, A.E.: An integrated
534 constructed wetland to treat contaminants and nutrients from dairy farmyard dirty water,
535 *Ecol. Eng.*, 24(3), 219-232, 2005.

- 536 Dzakpasu, M., Hofmann, O., Scholz, M., Harrington, R., Jordan, S.N., and McCarthy, V.:
537 Nitrogen removal in integrated constructed wetland treating domestic wastewater, J.
538 Environ. Sci. Health A: Tox. Hazard Subst. Environ. Eng., 46(7), 742-750, 2011.
- 539 Dzakpasu, M., Scholz, M., Harrington, R., McCarthy, V. and Jordan, S.: Groundwater Quality
540 Impacts from a Full-Scale Integrated Constructed Wetland, Groundwater Monit. Rem.,
541 34(3), 51-64, 2014.
- 542 Dzakpasua, M., Scholz, M., Harrington, R., Jordan. S.N., and McCarthy, V.: Characterising
543 infiltration and contaminant migration beneath earthen-lined integrated constructed
544 wetlands, Ecol. Eng., 41, 41-51, 2012.
- 545 Elberling, B., Louise A., Christian, J.J., Hans, P.J., Michael K., Ronnie N.G., and Frants, R.L.:
546 Linking soil O₂, CO₂, and CH₄ concentrations in a wetland soil: implications for CO₂ and
547 CH₄ fluxes, Environ. Sci. Technol., 45, 3393–3399, 2011.
- 548 Fenton, O., Healy, M.G., Brennan, F., Jahangir, M.M.R., Lanigan, G.J., Richards, K.G.,
549 Thornton, S.F., and Ibrahim, T.G.: Permeable reactive interceptors – blocking diffuse
550 nutrient and greenhouse gas losses in key areas of the farming landscape, J. Agric. Sci.
551 doi:10.1017/S0021859613000944, 2014.
- 552 Findlay, S., Groffman, P., and Dye, S.: Effects of *Phragmites australis* removal on marsh nutrient
553 cycling, Wetlands Ecol. Manage., 11, 157-165, 2003.
- 554 Firestone, M., Blazewicz, S., Peterson, D.G., and Placella, S.: Can molecular microbial ecology
555 provide new understanding of soil nitrogen dynamics, in: Richards, K.G., Fenton, O.,
556 Watson, C. J. (Eds.) Proceedings of the 17th Nitrogen Workshop, 11-14, 2012.
- 557 Galloway, J.N., Aber, J.D., Erisman, J.W., Seitzinger, S.P., Howarth, R.W., Cowling, E.B., and
558 Cosby, B.J.: The nitrogen cascade, BioSci., 53(4), 341-356, 2003.
- 559 Gill L.W., Ring, P., Higgins N., and Johnston P.M.: Accumulation of heavy metals in a
560 constructed wetland treating road runoff, Ecol. Eng., 70, 133-139, 2014.
- 561 Gill, L.W., Osman, H., and O’Luanaigh, N.: The performance of two Free Water Surface
562 constructed wetlands for the treatment of on-site wastewater effluent in Ireland, in:
563 proceedings of the IWA 13th International Conference on Wetland Systems for Water
564 Pollution Control, Perth Australia, 2012.
- 565 Gold, A.J., Eddy, K., David, M.B., Schpper L.A., and Needelman, B.A.: Artificial sinks:
566 opportunities and challenges for managing offsite nitrogen losses, J. Contemp. Water Res.
567 Edu., 151, 9-19, 2013.
- 568 Gray, N.F.: Drinking water quality, 2nd edn., Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge, UK, 2008.

569 Haroon, M. F., Hu, S., Shi, Y., Imelfort, M., Keller, J., Hugenholtz, P., Yuan, Z., and Tyson,
570 G.W.: Anaerobic oxidation of methane coupled to nitrate reduction in a novel archaeal
571 lineage, *Nature*, 500, 567-570, 2013.

572 Harrington, R., Carroll, P., Carty, A.H., Keohane, J., and Ryder, C.: Integrated constructed
573 wetlands: concept, design, site evaluation and performance, *Int. J. Water*, 3(3), 243-255,
574 2007.

575 Healy, M.G., Ibrahim, T.G., Lanigan, G., Serrenho, A.J., and Fenton, O.: Nitrate removal rate,
576 efficiency and pollution swapping potential of different organic carbon media in
577 laboratory denitrification bioreactors, *Ecol. Eng.*, 40, 198-209, 2011.

578 Huygens, D., Trimmer, M., Rütting, T., Müller, C., Heppell, C.M., Lansdown, K., and Boeckx,
579 P.: Biogeochemical N cycling in wetland ecosystems: ¹⁵N isotope techniques, *Methods in*
580 *biogeochemistry of wetlands*, K.R. Reddy, J.P. Megonigal and R.D. Delaune, (Eds.), *Soil*
581 *Sci. Soc. Amer.*, 30, 553-591, 2013.

582 IPCC: 2006 IPCC Guidelines for National Greenhouse Gas Inventories, Prepared by the National
583 Greenhouse Gas Inventories Programme, edited by: Eggleston H.S., Buendia L., Miwa
584 K., Ngara T. and Tanabe K., 28, IGES, Japan, 2006.,

585 IPCC: 2013 Supplement to the 2006 IPCC guidelines for national greenhouse gas inventories:
586 wetlands, edited by: Hirashi, T., Krug, T., Tanabe, K., Srivastava, N., Baasansuren, J.,
587 Fukuda, M., Troxler, T.G., Switzerland, IPCC Task Force on National Greenhouse Gas
588 Inventories, 354, 2014.

589 Islas-Lima, S., Thalasso, F., and Gomez-Hernandez, J.: Evidence of anoxic methane oxidation
590 coupled to denitrification, *Water Res.* 38(1), 13-16, 2004.

591 Jahangir, M.M.R., Johnston, P., Addy, K., Khalil, M.I., Groffman, P., and Richards, K.G.:
592 Quantification of in situ denitrification rates in groundwater below an arable and a
593 grassland system, *Water Air Soil Pollut.*, 224, 1693, doi:10.1007/s11270-013-1693-z,
594 2013.

595 Jahangir, M.M.R., Johnston, P., Grant, J., Somers, C., Khalil, M.I., and Richards, K.G.:
596 Evaluation of headspace equilibration methods for measuring greenhouse gases in
597 groundwater, *J. Environ. Manage.*, 111, 208-212, 2012.

598 Johansson, A.E., Kasimir-Klemedtsson, A., Klemedtsson, L., and Svensson, B.H.: Nitrous oxide
599 exchanges with the atmosphere of a constructed wetland treating wastewater, *Tellus*, 55B,
600 737–750, 2003.

601 Johansson, E.: Constructed wetlands and deconstructed discourses—greenhouse gas fluxes and
602 discourses on purifying capacities, Dept. Water Environ. Studies, Linköping Univ.,
603 Sweden, 2002.

604 Kalyuzhnyi, S., Gladchenko, M., Mulder, A., and Versprille, B.: DEAMOX-new biological
605 nitrogen, *Water Res.*, 40, 3637-3645, 2006.

606 Kana, T.M., Darkangelo, C., Hunt, M.D., Oldham, J.B., Bennett, G.E, and Cornwell, J.C.:
607 Membrane inlet mass spectrometer for rapid high precision determination N₂, O₂ and Ar
608 in environmental water samples, *Anal. Chem.*, 66, 4166-4170, 1994.

609 Kellogg, D.Q., Gold, A.J., Groffman, P.M., Addy, K., Stolt, M.H., and Blazejewski, G.: *In situ*
610 groundwater denitrification in stratified, permeable soils underlying riparian wetlands, *J.*
611 *Environ. Qual.*, 34, 524-533, 2005.

612 Koskiaho, J., Ekholm, P., Rätty, M., Riihimäki, J., and Puustinen, M.: Retaining agricultural
613 nutrients in constructed wetlands- experiences under boreal conditions, *Ecol. Eng.*, 20(1),
614 89–103, 2003.

615 Langergraber, G.: Modeling of processes in subsurface flow constructed wetlands: A review.
616 *Vadose Zone, J.* 7, 830-842, 2008.

617 Lee, C., Fletcher, T.D., and Sun, G.: Nitrogen removal in constructed wetland systems, *Eng. Life*
618 *Sci.*, 9(1), 11-22, 2009.

619 Lei, L., Jian, L., Yutao, W., Nvjie, W., and Renqing, W.: Cost-Benefit Analysis and payments
620 for watershed-scale wetland rehabilitation: a case study in Shandong Province, China,
621 *Intl. J. Environ. Res.*, 5, 787-796, 2011.

622 Liikanen, A., Huttunen, J.T., Kaijalainen, S.M., Heikkinen, K. Vdisdinen, T.S., Nykiinen,H., and
623 Martikainen, P.J.: Temporal and seasonal changes in greenhouse gas emissions from a
624 constructed wetland purifying peat mining runoff water, *Ecol. Eng.*, 26, 241-251, 2006.

625 Luederitz, V., Eckert, E., Lange-Weber, M., Lange, A., and Gersberg, R.M.: Nutrient removal
626 efficiency and resource economics of vertical flow and horizontal flow constructed
627 wetlands, *Ecol. Eng.*, 18, 157–171, 2001.

628 Luo W.G., Wang, S.H., Huang, J., and Qian, W.Y.: Denitrification by using subsurface
629 constructed wetland in low temperature. *China Water Wastewater* (in Chinese), 21, 37–
630 40, 2005.

631 Mander, U., Lõhmus, K., Teiter, S., Muring, T., Nurk, K., and Augustin, J.: Gaseous fluxes in
632 the nitrogen and carbon budgets of subsurface flow constructed wetlands, *Sci. Total*
633 *Environ.*, 404, 343-353, 2008.

- 634 Mander, Ü., Löhmus, K., Teiter, S., Nurk, K., Mairing, T., and Augustin, J.: Gaseous fluxes from
635 subsurface flow constructed wetlands for wastewater treatment, *J. Environ. Sci. Health A*
636 40(6–7), 1215–26, 2005.
- 637 Milder, J.C., Scherr, S.J., and Bracer, C.: Trends and future potential of payment for ecosystem
638 services to alleviate rural poverty in developing countries, *Ecol. Soc.*, 15, 4, 2010.
- 639 Mitsch, W.J., and Gosselink, J.G.: *Wetlands*, 3rd Edn. New York, John Wiley & Sons, p. 936,
640 2000.
- 641 Müller, C. and Clough, T.J.: Advances in understanding nitrogen flows and transformations: gaps
642 and research pathways, *J. Agril. Sci.*, doi: 10.1017/S0021859613000610, 2013.
- 643 Müller, C. and Bünemann, E.K.: A ³³P tracing model for quantifying gross P transformation rates
644 in soil, *Soil Biol. Biochem.*, 76, 218-226, doi:10.1016/j.soilbio.2014.05.013, 2014.
- 645 Müller, C., Laughlin, R.J., Spott, O., and Rütting, T.: Quantification of N₂O emission pathways
646 via a ¹⁵N tracing model, *Soil Biol. Biochem.*, 72, 44-54, 2014.
- 647 Nguyen, L.M.: Organic matter composition, microbial biomass and microbial activity in gravel-
648 bed constructed wetlands treating farm dairy wastewaters, *Ecol. Eng.* 16, 199-221, 2000.
- 649 O’Lunaigh, N.D., Goodhue, R., and Gill, L.W.: Nutrient removal from on-site domestic
650 wastewater in horizontal subsurface flow reed beds in Ireland, *Ecol. Eng.* 36, 1266-1276,
651 2010.
- 652 Obarska-Pempkowiak, H., and Gajewska, M.: The dynamics of processes responsible for
653 transformation of nitrogen compounds in hybrid wetlands systems in a temperate climate,
654 in: J. Vymazal (Eds.) *Wetlands- Nutrients, Metals and Mass Cycling*. Backhuys
655 Publishers, Leiden, The Netherlands, p.129–42. 2003.
- 656 Pangala, S.R., Reay, D.S., and Heal, K.V.: Mitigation of methane emissions from constructed
657 farm wetlands, *Chemosphere*, 78, 493-499, 2010.
- 658 Peterson, D.G., Blazewicz, S., Herman, D.J., Firestone, M., Turetsky, M. and Waldrop, M.:
659 Abundance of microbial genes associated with nitrogen cycling as indices of
660 biogeochemical process rates across a vegetation gradient in Alaska, *Environ. Microbiol.*,
661 14, 993-1008, 2012.
- 662 Poach, M.E., Hunt, P.G., Vanotti, M.B., Stone, K.C., Matheny, T.A., Johnson, M.H., and Sadler
663 E.J.: Improved nitrogen treatment by constructed wetlands receiving partially nitrified
664 liquid swine manure, *Ecol. Eng.*, 20, 183-197, 2003.
- 665 Rabalais, N.N., Diaz, R.J. Levin, L.A. Turner, R.E., Gilbert, D., and Zhang, J.: Dynamics and
666 distribution of natural and human-caused coastal hypoxia, *Biogeosciences*, 7, 585–619,
667 2010.

668 Reay, D.S.: Title: Fertilizer 'solution' could turn local problem global - Protecting soil and water
669 from pollution may mean releasing more greenhouse gas, *Nature*, 427, 485-485, 2004.

670 Rütting, T. and Müller, C.: Process-specific analysis of nitrite dynamics in a permanent grassland
671 soil by using a Monte Carlo sampling technique, *Euro. J. Soil Sci.*, 59: 208-215, 2008.

672 Scholz, M., and Lee, B.H.: Constructed wetlands: A review, *Int. J. Environ. Stud.*, 62, 421-447,
673 2005.

674 Seitzinger, S.P., Sanders, R.W., and Styles, R.: Bioavailability of DON from natural and
675 anthropogenic sources to estuarine plankton, *Limnol. Oceanogr.*, 47, 353-366, 2002.

676 Shamir, E., Thompson, T.L, Karpisak, M.M., Freitas, R.J., and Zauderer, J.: Nitrogen
677 accumulation in a constructed wetland for dairy wastewater treatment, *J. Amer. Water*
678 *Resour. Assoc.*, 37(2), 315-325, 2001.

679 Song, K., Lee, S.H., and Kang, H.: Denitrification rates and community structure of denitrifying
680 bacteria in newly constructed wetland, *Eur. J. Soil Biol.*, 47(1), 24-29, 2011.

681 Søvik, A.K., Augustin, J., Heikkinen, K., Huttunen, J.T., Necki, J.M., Karjalainen, S.M., Klove,
682 B., Liikanen, A., Mander, U., Puustinen, M., Teiter, S., and Wachniew, P.: Emission of
683 the greenhouse gases nitrous oxide and methane from constructed wetlands in Europe. *J.*
684 *Environ, Qual.* 35, 2360-2373, 2006.

685 Stadmark, J., and Leonardson, L.: Emissions of greenhouse gases from ponds constructed for
686 nitrogen removal, *Ecol. Eng.*, 25, 542-551, 2005.

687 Starr, R.C., and Gillham, R.W.: Denitrification and organic carbon availability in two aquifers,
688 *Ground Water*, 31, 934-947, 1993.

689 Ström, L., Ekberg, A., Mastepanov M., and Christensen, T.R.: The effect of vascular plants on
690 carbon turnover and methane emissions from a tundra wetland, *Global Change Biol.* 9,
691 1185-1192, 2003.

692 Ström, L., Lamppa, A., and Christensen, T.R.: Greenhouse gas emissions from a constructed
693 wetland in southern Sweden, *Wetlands Ecol. Manage.*, 15, 43-50, 2007.

694 Ström, L., Mastepanov, M., and Christensen, T.R.: Species specific effects of vascular plants on
695 carbon turnover and methane emissions from wetlands, *Biogeochem.*, 75, 65-82, 2005.

696 Tanner, C.C., and Kadlec, R.H.: Influence of hydrological regime on wetland attenuation of
697 diffuse agricultural nitrate losses, *Ecol. Eng.*, 56, 79-88, doi:
698 10.1016/j.ecoleng.2012.08.043, 2013.

699 Tanner, C.C., and Sukias, J.P.S.: Multi-year nutrient removal performance of three constructed
700 wetlands intercepting drainage flows from intensively grazed pastures, *J. Environ. Qual.*,
701 40, 620-633, 2011.

702 Tanner, C.C., Nguyen, M.L., and Sukias, J.P.S.: Nutrient removal by a constructed wetland
703 treating subsurface drainage from grazed dairy pasture, *Agric. Ecosysts. Environ.*, 105,
704 145-162, 2005.

705 Toet, S., Richards, S.P., van Logtestijn, Kamp, R., Schreijer, M., and Verhoeven, J.T.A.: The
706 effect of hydraulic retention time on the performance of pollutants from sewage treatment
707 plant effluent in a surface flow constructed wetland system, *Wetlands*, 25, 375-391, 2005.

708 Turner, R.K., and Daily, G.C.: The ecosystem services framework and natural capital
709 conservation, *Environ. Resour. Econ.*, 39(1), 25-35, 2008.

710 Van der Zaag, A.C., Gordon, R.J., Burton, D.L., Jamieson, R.C., and Stratton, G.W.: Greenhouse
711 gas emissions from surface flow and subsurface flow constructed wetlands treating dairy
712 wastewater, *J. Environ. Qual.*, 39, 460-471, 2010.

713 Verhoeven, J.T.A., and Meuleman, A.F.M.: Wetlands for wastewater treatment: Opportunities
714 and limitations, *Ecol. Eng.*, 12, 5-12, 1999.

715 Vymazal, J.: Constructed Wetlands for Wastewater Treatment. *Water*, 2, 530-549, 2010.

716 Vymazal, J.: Removal of nutrients in various types of constructed wetlands, *Sci. Total Environ.*,
717 380, 48-65, 2007.

718 Whiting, G.J., and Chanton, J.P.: Greenhouse carbon balance of wetlands: methane emission
719 versus carbon sequestration, *Tellus B*, 53(5), 521-8, 2001.

720 Yavitt, J.B., and Knapp, A.K.: Aspects of methane flow from sediment through emergent cattail
721 (*Typha latifolia*) plants, *New Phytol.*, 139, 495-503, 1998.

722 Zhang, J., Shao, W.S., He, M., Hu, H.Y., and Gao, B.Y.: Treatment performance and
723 enhancement of subsurface constructed wetland treating polluted river water in winter,
724 *Environ. Sci. (in Chinese)*, 27, 1560-1564, 2006.

725 Zhou, S., and Hosomi, M.: Nitrogen transformations and balance in a constructed wetland for
726 nutrient-polluted river water treatment using forage rice in Japan, *Ecol. Eng.*, 32, 147-155,
727 2008.

728
729
730
731
732
733
734

735 Table 1 Summary of influent composition and their removal efficiencies being reported by
 736 several authors

CWs type	NO ₃ ⁻ (mg L ⁻¹)	NH ₄ ⁺ (mg L ⁻¹)	BOD ₅ (mg L ⁻¹)	MRP (mg L ⁻¹)	TN Removal (%)	References
SF	15.5	4.5	1.5 (DOC)	0.2	61	Song et al., 2011
SF	5	40			97- 98	Dzakpasu et al., 2011
SF	4.4	39			39-48	Vymazal, 2007
SF		36	170	9.6	39	Vymazal, 2010
SF	2.6	64	816	10	>90	DEHLG, 2010*
SF	6.4	34	854	4.3	>90	DEHLG, 2010**
SF	<2	196	277		35	Shamir et al., 2001
SF	<1.0	80	1200	25	>90	Harrington et al., 2007
SF	1.54	0.95	32 (COD)	1.43	45	Toet et al., 2005
SSF	3.9	74.9	514 (COD)	11.1	29	O’Luanaigh et al., 2010
SSF		87 (TN)	167		46-48	Mander et al., 2008

737 SF-surface flow; SSF-subsurface flow; NO₃⁻- nitrate; NH₄⁺- ammonium; BOD- biological oxygen
 738 demand; DOC- dissolved organic carbon; MRP- molybdenum reactive phosphorus; TN-total N;
 739 *soiled water; **wastewater

740

741

742