

Interactive comment on “Stochastic modelling of spatially and temporally consistent daily precipitation time-series over complex topography” by D. E. Keller et al.

E. Morin (Editor)

msmorin@mscc.huji.ac.il

Received and published: 24 September 2014

Two reviewers have read the manuscript. They provided quite contradicting assessments of the work, but there are two main problematic points that are essential. The first is the innovation of the study. Reviewer 2 claims for no novelty at all while reviewer 1 states that the method is not novel but its application is. Indeed the authors state in the manuscript that the WG was never tested in the Alps that have some unique features. However, these features are not considered later and thus the point made for the novelty in application is not convincing. A second, but related point, is that the study is focused in complex topography according to its title; however the topography data (and

C4022

its derivative such as slopes) were not actually used in the analyses, except for station selection, and so the unique application of this WG does not seem to be justified. In addition to the two above important issues, the manuscript seems to miss some publications of high space-time resolution WG, including in the Swiss environment. More important comments are listed in the two review reports.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 11, 8737, 2014.

C4023