Hydrology and Earth System Sciences

Open Access

Discussions

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on "Stochastic modelling of spatially and temporally consistent daily precipitation time-series over complex topography" *by* D. E. Keller et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 2 September 2014

I have several problems with this scientific article. The first one is that this looks more like a class rather than a scientific paper. Authors expend a lot of time describing single site weather generators for nothing. All that is repetition and it can be found everywhere. The second problem is that authors are very superficial in their literature review and over simplified the publications already published. I'm extremely sure that they haven't read the papers they mention in the review, so they have no idea of the detailed method developed in each of these previous approaches. Another problem is that the title made me think that they developed something especial for complex topography areas, something the other developer scientist didn't take into account. In fact,

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

authors only apply the weather generator in some weather stations in the mountains. Some authors have done the same and published their work without advertising the issue. The methodology per se is nothing new. Authors propose no new ideas, no new methods, and no nothing. This is an application of methods already published and they add nothing to the science of stochastic modelling. Unfortunately, from my point of view, this proposed article is not to the level of scientific publication.

———————————————————

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 11, 8737, 2014.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper