

## ***Interactive comment on “Lumped convolution integral models revisited: on the meaningfulness of inter catchment comparisons” by S. Seeger and M. Weiler***

**B. Schaeefli (Editor)**

[bettina.schaeefli@epfl.ch](mailto:bettina.schaeefli@epfl.ch)

Received and published: 26 August 2014

All three reviewers agree that this well written paper presents interesting new insights into the description of stationary transfer functions based on stable isotope data, even if "the use of time-invariant transfer functions can now almost be called old-fashioned" (reviewer 3). As reviewer 2 puts it "stationary response functions have progressively lost scientific relevance, (..), many simple models still perform discharge simulations through calibration of stationary response functions."

The reviewers recommend minor to moderate revisions and give detailed comments

C3361

on how to further improve the manuscript. Accordingly, I invite the authors to submit a revised version addressing all the comments along the responses given in the public discussion.

---

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 11, 6753, 2014.