

Interactive comment on “Assessing the impact of different sources of topographic data on 1-D hydraulic modelling of floods” by A. Md Ali et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 24 July 2014

Although the manuscript is well structured and written, I have the feeling that it does not provide significant contributions to existing literature. In particular, most of the analyses carried out appear to repeat the methods applied in the research works cited in the introduction (the assessment of accuracy and precision of different DEM data sources was already addressed by Casas et Al. (2006) and Schumann et Al. (2008); Yan et al (2013) carried out a sensitivity analysis by considering parameters uncertainty). Apparently, the only innovation in terms of methodology consists of using two different events for calibration and validation, but I am not sure it is enough for a new publication. In addition, the results presented here are similar to previous findings in other test sites, while perhaps presenting a case study with different results would justify the application of existing methodologies.

C2679

If the authors do not agree with these considerations, they should make an effort to demonstrate the novelty and importance of their research with respect to previous works. Otherwise, I would strongly suggest to develop further the work, either by applying different methodologies, or by considering additional test sites in their analyses.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 11, 7375, 2014.

C2680