

Interactive comment on “Hydrological, ecological, land use, economic, and sociocultural evidence for resilience of traditional irrigation communities in New Mexico, USA” by A. Fernald et al.

M. Sivapalan (Editor)

sivapala@uiuc.edu

Received and published: 21 May 2014

First of all this is an interesting paper, describing how a community has developed governance systems (norms and values) to establish resilience in a semi-arid landscape with frequent droughts. The socio-hydrologic community can learn a lot by systematically analyzing the system and eventually developing a model of coupled human-water systems. In this respect, I recall the classic study by Stephen Lansing on Balines Water Temples. The idea is similar but the places (and climates) are different. I wonder whether the authors can draw a connection.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



The reviewers have picked up two major points that need substantial revision: 1) streamlining the writing/text so that the ideas logically flow: currently there is considerable dissonance between different parts of the manuscript 2) the second part of the paper reads like it has been taken out of a grant proposal. It talks about what will be done in the next steps of this research. Stylistically, this is not acceptable. The article has to be about what has been done and not what will be done. What has been learned from the study so far? The authors should use the same material they have but should turn it around into some distillation of concepts or a conceptual model of the system based on the analysis so far etc? The authors can take a look at two papers appearing in the special issue, Kandasamy et al. (2014, already published) and Liu et al. (2014, already published) for guidance on how to do this.

The reviewers have given many good suggestions - please try and address all of their comments, and upload a document describing how you have accomplished this in the revised manuscript. Given the nature of comments received I will most likely consult with the reviewers once more before making a decision.

Thank you for submitting this interesting paper to the special issue.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 11, 1821, 2014.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper