Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 11, C116–C117, 2014
www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/11/C116/2014/

Hydrology and Earth System Sciences
Discussions

Interactive comment on "Comprehensive evaluation of water resources security in the Yellow River basin based on a Fuzzy Multi-Attribute Decision Analysis Approach" *by* K. K. Liu et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 12 February 2014

General comments:

This paper evaluated water resources security of nine provinces in the Yellow River basin in 2006 based on fuzzy multi-attribute decision analysis approach, considering the uncertainties in the acquired information. The method appears to be reliable and convincible. Such work is novel and potentially useful for water resources decision makers. However, several issues need to be clarified in the revised version.

Specific comments:

1. The authors gave a detailed indicator system and their corresponding explanations for water resources security evaluation as Table 1 shows. Although there are a great many indicators, more explanation on how/why to choose these indicators should be added in the text. 2. How to determine the standards and the weights of each indicator? Need more explanation. 3. More advantages of FMADAA should be added in the text. 4. The authors adopted many methods in this paper. Suggest a figure that can summary these methods and their corresponding use to make the idea of evaluation clear. 5. Improve the overall quality of this paper. There are many long sentences that make them vague to understand.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 11, 371, 2014.