

Paper

Residence times and mixing of water in river banks: implications for recharge and groundwater – surface water exchange

N.P. Unland, I. Cartwright, D.I. Cendón, and R. Chisari

My overall impression is that the authors answered carefully the points reviewer #1 made in his review. The paper is well written and the data presentation is OK.

According to the authors' reply to reviewer #2, it is not possible to integrate the groundwater-surface water system in the Tambo River catchment to a full description of the regional hydro-geology. Looking to the morphological setting, it is apparent that the Tambo River drains groundwater and is not recharging the aquifer in the studied section. To find such things out, it is not necessary to do all these measurements. So the fundamental or main hypothesis of the present work is not clear. Did the authors carefully take samples, analyse them and finally try to make an interesting story from this workflow?

Sorry, but I remain convinced that the title is promising an interesting work, which is not developed in a complete way throughout the paper.