

Authors' response to Referees' comments for:

GRACE storage-runoff hystereses reveal the dynamics of regional watersheds

The authors would like to thank both Referees for their comments, which we incorporated into our second revision. This response section provides a detailed response to the comments, or provides the line numbers in the revised manuscript that address the comments.

Comments from the Referees are posted in italics.

And our responses are in a sans serif font.

Line numbers for the submitted version are in black, while line numbers for the track changes version are in red. Due to the formatting involved, the line numbers do not correspond.

Referee #1

This manuscript has been improved tremendously since its original version. The authors have taken considerable effort to address all comments and argue their position well. I consider this manuscript suitable for publication after addressing following comments.

Specific comments

In the abstract two additional new results are claimed:

- 1. Proof of soil water storage threshold before recharge or peak runoff occurs*
- 2. Subsurface water hysteresis resemble the R-S relationship of soil matrix*

For the former a detailed explanation in section 4.3 is needed. For the latter only a brief explanation is given in the caption of Fig.a-f, please provide a sound explanation in the text as well.

Re: #1: Thank you for identifying this potential problem. We have reviewed the results, and while the data indicates this threshold exists, they are not definitive. Thus we removed this phrase from the abstract. While we still include this concept in the body of the paper, we have provided additional supporting material and additional comments in Section 4.1 (lines 278 – 280; 318-320) and Section 5.2 (lines 470 – 508; 526-568). We have also added [links](#) to interactive graphics that allow the reader to quantify and visualize the thresholds. In the body of the paper we use the words *suggests* and *indicates* to describe the soil moisture threshold. We intentionally did not use terms such as *verifies* or *proves*. These more absolute terms would require a detailed soil moisture analysis that lies outside the scope of this study.

Re#2: Thank you for the suggestion. We have added text for clarity as well as a citation for this statement (304-307; 346-349).

240: *Is it the standard Nash-Sutcliffe with the long-term mean in the denominator? If yes, please cite them. If not please note the formula.*

Thank you for identifying any ambiguity. Yes, the standard Nash-Sutcliffe efficiency was used. We added this descriptor and a citation (254-255; 287-295).

246: *How are the data sets combined?*

The two data sets were each run as a calibration and a validation data set and tested against measured values. These results are provided in Appendix Table A3. They were then compiled into a single dataset and tested against measured values, and the results are provided in Appendix Table A4. We have also modified the text for clarity (258-266; 287-295).

435-452: *(not really clear)*

- *Please better elaborate why GWSA is nearly constant from June to October and with a negative slope from Oct to March (Fig3c)*

Thank you for the suggestion. We have provided additional information in lines 321-327 (365-371).

- *Could you please describe the role of SM (and Res ??) in more detail, as they are the main difference between TWSAsub and GWSA ?*

Thank you for the suggestion. We have provided additional detail (475-489; 531-549).

- *What is the role of GW extraction vrs possible recharge from snow melt?*

This is a great question and one we have thought of before. However it is a very complicated one, especially in this region. The US Geological Survey publishes water use estimates every five years. Unfortunately the data is compiled by county, which makes it very challenging to aggregate by watershed. Additionally the county where snowmelt occurs is most likely not the county where it is extracted. For instance the Snake River plain has considerable groundwater withdrawals, but almost no precipitation. Whereas the headwater regions (potentially several counties away) have precipitation, but minimal groundwater extraction.

Helping move GRACE data beyond diagnostic calculations and towards addressing process-based hydrological questions was a goal of this paper. Obviously a single manuscript cannot address all of the process-based questions in regional watersheds. We look forward to continued investigation in the region using GRACE, and your question is along the lines with our potential future research.

- *The simultaneous display of TWSA and GWSA vrs time in one figure for each catchment might help to highlight the different dynamic behavior.*

The dynamic nature of the hysteresis over years and watersheds made it challenging to create visualizations that were not cluttered with data. In order to facilitate better analysis (and a better experience for the reader) we have added [links for web-based visualizations](#) that will allow readers to interact with the hystereses data.

488–493: The results for the Snake River end at 120 mm, the threshold is at 100mm. so is this really promising for dry areas?

Thank you for identifying this potential problem. If you look at the data in Figure 7a and b the lower threshold for using $TWSA_{Mar}$ to predict R is approximately 80 mm in the Snake River. We have included additional text in lines 549-556 (622-631) to identify the lower threshold for the Snake River.

*492 The Forecast must be poor for $TWSA < 100mm$
Is NS calculated for forecast for all TWSA values or only above the threshold?*

Yes, NSE was calculated for all years, not just values above the threshold. For clarity we have described this in lines 258-266 (287-295) of the revised manuscript.

Fig.2 Check stdev and variance units in graphs, NS values do not fit to table 1

The units in Fig. 2 are in mm and this is correct. The NS values for Figure 7a and b match Table 2. We have also added descriptors for the axes in the Figure captions.

Minor comments

For the tick between S and R, please use – in word: ctrl+minus sign and in latex: two hyphen in a row

This has been incorporated in the revised manuscript.

Please be consistent with the italicizing the index $TWSA_{month}$, sometimes month appears as italic version and sometimes not. In principle an index which does not receive number should not be italicized. Same for R_{season} .

This has been incorporated in the revised manuscript.

45: capacity to understand -> understanding

This suggestion has been incorporated in the revised manuscript (44, 53).

92–94: rephrase the sentence. It is not clear.

Thank you for the suggestion. The text has been rephrased for clarity (Lines 90 -92, 102-104).

122: 50-60% -> 50–60%

This suggestion has been incorporated in the revised manuscript (Line 120, 139).

131: *provide a reference for this statement.*

Thank you for the suggestion, and a reference has been added (Line 129, 148).

258: 2004-2012 & 2005-2011 -> 2004–2012 & 2005–2011

This suggestion has been incorporated in the revised manuscript (Lines 256, 285).

399: *remove helps*

This has been incorporated in the revised manuscript (Line 410, 460).

416, 428,454 and ...: *hyphen is not a negative sign please use negative sign in math form.*

This suggestion has been incorporated throughout the revised manuscript.

Referee #2

General comments:

1. The predictive ability demonstrated in this paper of the GRACE signal to predict seasonal streamflow in the large Columbia River basin is promising and indicates a potential for the use of GRACE results to enhance the reliability of seasonal water supply predictions.

Thank you for the constructive feedback.

2. The revised paper now includes analysis of total subsurface water storage by subtracting snow and reservoir storage from the total water storage. The almost linear relationship between subsurface moisture storage and streamflow for the Upper Columbia basin is interesting and could be further explored in comparison with the more complex result for the Snake River basin.

Thank you for your comments and suggestions. You raise a valid point, and we have provided some additional commentary in Section 4.2 and 5.2. We agree that the linear relationship between subsurface moisture and streamflow is interesting, and warrants

further investigation. But there are many similar relationships that this study and methodology introduce. However addressing them all lies outside the scope of this manuscript, but does highlight new directions for subsequent research. As with most research, authors have to balance inclusive science and the realities of a single journal article.

3. The paper still retains the GLDAS-derived estimates of soil moisture (SM) to depth of 2 m to estimate the groundwater storage changes, GWSA. However this estimate of soil moisture has little meaning for such a large heterogeneous basin and cannot be adequately separated from groundwater storage. The SM and GWSA calculations based on this soil moisture calculation should be simply deleted, along with all discussion and figures pertaining to them.

We understand the Referee's concern that there may be issues with large-scale modeled soil moisture, but this comment does not offer a direction forward. This comment is really not specific to our study, but concerns the state-of-the-science of hydrology and of an already-tested approach. As explained in the text, we attempt to address model structural error by using an ensemble of model outputs. For large areas (i.e., an area equivalent to that of the GRACE observations) this should be entirely appropriate, and it is the best methodology we know to be available. There have been numerous (~30) studies published using GRACE to detect groundwater variability globally, and all present a similar, if not less rigorous, methodology than the current work.

Additionally, there is really no alternative approach, as soil moisture observations across the domain are not available. If they were, then scaling or interpolating individual point measurements would arguably contribute as much or more error than a distributed model driven by observed forcing. While there is certainly space for continued work in hydrology on soil moisture variability and scale variance and invariance, it is really beyond the scope of the current manuscript to develop these analyses. Instead we rely on already proven, peer-reviewed methodologies to highlight new observations in the Columbia River basin. We humbly invite the Referee to collaborate on future refinement of these methods.

We agree with the statements of Referee #1 from the first round of comments:

*“ Interesting highlights in this study:
Clock-wise behavior of groundwater hysteresis in the presence of a
counter clock-wise behavior of the hysteresis for the GRACE signal.”*

And

*“The Clock-wise behavior of groundwater hysteresis is one of
interesting findings of this study.”*

Based upon these previous comments and groundwater-focused suggestions from both Referees we expanded the subsurface and groundwater component of the study. To remove them from the current manuscript would be contrary to the first round of comments from this reviewer and disregard the suggestions of the second reviewer.

4. There is much talk in the paper about hysteretic relationships between storage and streamflow, but this goes little beyond the obvious, such as the delayed response of streamflow to snow accumulation, which dominates the hysteresis and is hardly a new finding. The paper would be better off with no mention of “Hysteresis”, except perhaps in passing as a minor note.

We agree there is considerable discussion about the hysteretic relationships between storage and runoff, and this comprises a large part of our findings. We respectfully disagree with the Referee that there should be no mention of these findings in this manuscript. While the hysteretic relationship at more local scales is not novel to catchment hydrology, measurements at regional scales using satellite-based measurements are new scientific insights. They identify similar local-scale processes that while generalized, can be scaled up. This could be particularly relevant in understanding the hysteretic relationship between storage-runoff in regional watersheds regions with minimal data. These same conclusions are in general agreement with Riegger and Tourian (2014):

“Investigations of global scale Runoff-Storage (R-S) relationships for different climatic conditions show distinct periodic characteristics with hysteresis for total water storage... This system behavior thus allows for a direct determination of river runoff from GRACE mass and vice versa for unmanaged catchments.”

Riegger, J. and Tourian, M. J.: Characterization of runoff-storage relationships by satellite gravimetry and remote sensing, *Water Resour. Res.*, 50(4), 3444–3466, 2014.

The research presented in this paper builds on the work by Riegger and Tourian, and highlights the hysteretic nature of these regional watersheds. Because of these demonstratable and citable arguments, we contend that removing the term “Hysteresis” from the manuscript would not be representative of our primary findings regarding the relationship between storage and runoff and negatively impact the quality of the research presented.

5. The paper could be shortened and strengthened by concentrating on the clear results, especially the prediction of later-summer streamflow based on the March and April TWSA, and the relationship between total subsurface storage and streamflow.

Thank you for this comment, and we agree in principle. Our original manuscript was comprised of 5490 words. However, once we incorporated both Referees’ comments and

suggestions the manuscript increased by 32% to 7266 words. In order to include both referees comments and suggestions from both rounds of review, the length cannot be substantially shortened without discounting the presentation of the research that includes the perspectives of the authors and both referees.

Specific comments:

Technical comments:

L 103. This mention of a linear relationship between runoff and liquid storage is intriguing, especially since this paper finds the same relationship for the Upper Columbia. The finding that the Snake River has a more complex relationship, with runoff partly uncoupled from subsurface storage, could be further explored.

We agree that the sub-component relationships between storage and discharge provides opportunities for further discussion and research that could advance regional watershed hydrology. Our general goal for this manuscript was to present the relationships for all three watersheds, not provide a detailed analysis of any or all of them. We have included discussion of these results in Section 5.2 (lines). A detailed analysis lies outside the scope of the paper. As with most research, authors have to balance inclusiveness with the realities of a single journal article.

L 137 What is meant by “expansive aquifer storage”. Does the aquifer expand (surely not!)? This needs a much better discussion based on actual papers describing the hydrogeology of the area.

We apologize for any ambiguity. The word expansive was intended as an adjective meaning of “covering a wide area in terms of space”. We have changed the wording with a bit more description, a citation, and a reference to Figure 1 (Lines 135-137, [145-157](#)).

L 485-503. This discussion about groundwater levels and the timing of pumping tests is just not relevant. Local groundwater authorities are perfectly well aware of how groundwater levels change in their region. Advice on this matter based on the highly dubious estimate of watershed-wide GWSA would be merely irritating to them. Suggestion: delete this portion.

We agree with the reviewer on many levels regarding this part of the paper. However, we disagree that local groundwater authorities are perfectly aware of how groundwater levels change in their region. In fact, this component of the research was introduced after internal review, based on comments provided by a hydrogeologist who works in water resources conflict negotiation in this region. Our inclusion of the results is intended to highlight that storage functions as a series of sub-components. We support our arguments with published research on the topic. Additionally we have moved the figure to the Annex section in an attempt to provide the information for readers who want it, while trying to maintain readability of the primary document.

GRACE storage-runoff hystereses reveal the dynamics of regional watersheds

E.A. Sproles^{1,2,3}; S.G. Leibowitz⁴; J.T. Reager⁵; P.J. Wigington Jr⁶; J.S. Famiglietti⁵; S.D. Patil⁷

*corresponding author: eric.sproles@gmail.com

¹ Oak Ridge Institute for Science and Technology, c/o National Health and Environmental Effects Research Laboratory, US Environmental Protection Agency, 200 SW 35th Street, Corvallis, OR, 97333, USA

² Current address: Centro de Estudios en Zonas Áridas, Universidad de La Serena, Raul Bitran 1305, La Serena, Chile

³ College of Earth, Ocean, and Atmospheric Sciences, Oregon State University, Corvallis, OR, 97331-5503, USA

⁴ National Health and Environmental Effects Research Laboratory, US Environmental Protection Agency, 200 SW 35th Street, Corvallis, OR, 97333, USA

⁵ Jet Propulsion Laboratory, California Institute of Technology, Pasadena, California, 91109, USA

⁶ Retired

⁷ School of Environment, Natural Resources and Geography, Bangor University, Bangor, LL57 2UW, Wales

1 **Abstract**

2 We characterize how regional watersheds function as simple, dynamic systems through a
3 series of hysteresis loops using measurements from NASA's Gravity Recovery and Climate
4 Experiment (GRACE) satellites. These loops illustrate the temporal relationship between
5 runoff and terrestrial water storage in three regional-scale watersheds (>150,000 km²) of
6 the Columbia River Basin, USA and Canada. The shape and size of the hysteresis loops are
7 controlled by the climate, topography, and geology of the watershed. The direction of the
8 hystereses for the GRACE signals move in opposite directions from the isolated
9 groundwater hystereses. The subsurface water (soil moisture and groundwater) hystereses
10 more closely resemble the storage-runoff relationship of a soil matrix. While the physical
11 processes underlying these hystereses are inherently complex, the vertical integration of
12 terrestrial water in the GRACE signal encapsulates the processes that govern the non-linear
13 function of regional-scale watersheds. We use this process-based understanding to test how
14 GRACE data can be applied prognostically to predict seasonal runoff (mean Nash-Sutcliffe
15 Efficiency of 0.91) and monthly runoff during the low flow/high demand month of August
16 (mean Nash-Sutcliffe Efficiency of 0.77) in all three watersheds. The global nature of
17 GRACE data allows this same methodology to be applied in other regional-scale studies,
18 and could be particularly useful in regions with minimal data and in trans-boundary
19 watersheds.

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: , suggesting that regional scale watersheds require soil water storage to reach a certain threshold before groundwater recharge and peak runoff occur

20

25 **1. Introduction**

26 At the most fundamental level, watershed processes can be described as the
27 collection, storage, and release of water (Black, 1996; McDonnell et al., 2007). The runoff
28 from these processes is governed by threshold mediated relationships across scales that
29 result in storage-runoff hystereses (Spence, 2010). These threshold relationships between
30 storage and runoff ($S-R$) are not uniform across a watershed, functioning as a series of
31 discontinuous processes in soils and hillslopes that provide an integrated $S-R$ relationship at
32 the watershed scale (Spence, 2010). Kirchner (2009) described the $S-R$ relationship to be
33 non-linear and stated that watersheds typically function as dynamic systems governed by
34 their unique climate and geology. These conceptual models of hydrologic behaviors help
35 provide a process-based understanding of watersheds as dynamic environmental systems
36 (Aspinall, 2010), and identify connections that advance hydrologic science and hydrologic
37 prediction (Wagener et al., 2007).

38 At the local scale, *in situ* instrumentation can quantify the non-linear relationship
39 between streamflow and water stored in a watershed as snow, soil moisture, groundwater
40 and reservoirs (Appleby, 1970; Brutsaert, 2008; Kirchner, 2009; Sayama et al., 2011).
41 These four primary storage components, along with climate, topography, and geology
42 govern the fluxes of water through a catchment, and play an important role in the hysteretic
43 nature of storage and runoff dynamics (McGlynn and McDonnell, 2003; McNamara et al.,
44 2011). Knowledge of these processes is fundamental to developing an understanding of a
45 watershed's hydrologic behavior. However, observations over larger regions can be
46 technically challenging and costly, and *in situ* measurements from small basins do not
47 necessarily represent the complexity inherent to watersheds at more broad scales (Spence,

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Eliminado: (Black, 1996; McDonnell et al., 2007).

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Eliminado: —

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Eliminado: —

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Eliminado: —

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Eliminado: —

53 | 2010). This scaling problem limits our understanding and predict regional hydrologic
54 | processes, which is often the practical scale of watershed management (Blöschl, 2001;
55 | Western et al., 2002; Skøien et al., 2003; Peel and Blöschl, 2011; Thompson et al., 2011).

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Eliminado: capacity to understand

56 | In the absence of broad-scale observations, past hydrological studies have typically
57 | relied on *in situ* measurements as a proxy for regional scale hydrological processes. For
58 | example, in higher latitude or mountainous regions measurements of snow water storage
59 | have provided a simple metric that has been used in water resource planning for decades
60 | (Cayan, 1996; United States Army Corps of Engineers, 2001), and are often correlated to
61 | streamflow gauged downstream (Dozier, 2011). While informative, this approach can often
62 | provide hydrological forecasts that are misleading, because point-based measurements do
63 | not fully represent the broad-scale variability of rugged mountain terrain (Dozier, 2011;
64 | Nolin, 2012; Webster et al., 2014; Ayala et al., 2014). Similarly, measurements of soil
65 | moisture in the upper 2000 mm of the soil rely on point-based data that are often distributed
66 | at the regional scale, but do not effectively represent the true variability of soil moisture
67 | found at the regional scale (Western et al., 2002; Brocca et al., 2010). A complete
68 | understanding of groundwater stores and fluxes (deeper than 2000 mm) at regional scales
69 | also remains elusive, despite its increasing importance in water resources management
70 | (Wagner et al., 2007; Gleeson et al., 2012; Famiglietti and Rodell, 2013; Barthel, 2014). In
71 | addition to contributing to runoff, groundwater serves as an important water resource for
72 | consumptive use (Gleeson et al., 2012).

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Eliminado: (Cayan, 1996; United States Army Corps of Engineers, 2001)

73 | While local-scale methods have been applied with moderate success in the past,
74 | current trends in climate and in consumptive water demand suggest that long-term changes
75 | in hydrological fluxes will have a major impact at the regional scale (Milly et al., 2008). As

79 a result, the supply and demand of water is also expected to shift, especially at the regional
80 scale (Wagener et al., 2010; Gleick, 2014a).

81 Hydrologic models can help address the questions of scale and bridge the gap
82 between local scale observations and regional-scale processes by estimating the primary
83 components of water storage (snow, soil moisture, reservoir, and groundwater) across a
84 larger spatial grid. Regional-scale modeling approaches are integrated into water resource
85 management operations for navigation, human consumptive use, irrigation, and hydropower
86 (Payne et al., 2004; Rodell et al., 2004). Models can also be applied diagnostically to test
87 scientific hypotheses and provide a better understanding of the physical processes that
88 govern real world systems, such as the connections between snowmelt, streamflow, and
89 groundwater (Beven, 2007, 2010; Moradkhani and Sorooshian, 2008; Kirchner, 2009;
90 Clark et al., 2011; Capell et al., 2012). Despite their utility, developing and validating a
91 model can be both time consuming and reliant on multiple data inputs, which even in the
92 most well-instrumented basins provides sparse geographic coverage (Bales et al., 2006;
93 Zang et al., 2012). The lack of an integrated measurement of water storage and streamflow
94 has limited regional-scale hydrologic insights to model-based studies (Koster et al., 2010;
95 Mahanama et al., 2011).

96 Since 2002, broad-scale measurements of changes in the amount of water stored
97 across and through the earth have been available from NASA's Gravity Recovery and
98 Climate Experiment (GRACE) satellites (Tapley et al., 2004). GRACE measures monthly
99 changes in the Earth's gravitational field that are proportional to regional changes in total
100 water storage (Wahr et al., 2006). GRACE satellites provide a monthly record of terrestrial
101 water storage anomalies (*TWSA*), which represent the changes in the vertical sum of water

102 at the Earth's surface stored in snow, surface, soil and groundwater. Water losses to runoff
103 and evapotranspiration are implicit in the GRACE storage signal, which greatly simplifies
104 calculations of changes in terrestrial water storage.

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Eliminado: removing the added layer

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Eliminado: complexity typically required to model the

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Eliminado: balance

105 GRACE data, coupled with modeled and measured variations of water stored in
106 snow, surface reservoirs and soils, have successfully been decomposed to quantify regional
107 groundwater changes (Rodell et al., 2009; Famiglietti et al., 2011; Voss et al., 2013; Castle
108 et al., 2014) and have contributed to improving water balance calculations (Zaitchik et al.,
109 2008; Li et al., 2012). More recent efforts have quantified the relationship between regional
110 water storage and specific streamflow events (Reager and Famiglietti, 2009; Reager et al.,

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Eliminado: (Reager and Famiglietti, 2009; Reager et al., 2014)

111 2014). Riegger and Tourian (2014) coupled GRACE data using data-driven and model-
112 based approaches to better understand the relationship between storage and runoff across
113 climatic zones globally. Their study found that coupled liquid storage is linear to runoff,
114 and that in climatic regions with snow and ice the relationship between storage and runoff
115 is more hysteretic. These novel analyses, which are more diagnostic in nature, have
116 provided new insights into regional watershed hydrology using GRACE measurements as a
117 core data input. These studies have not explored how topography and geology can also help
118 describe the $S-R$ relationship of regional watersheds. Nor did these studies examine the
119 ability of GRACE measurements to predict seasonal runoff.

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Eliminado: —

120 In this paper, we use terrestrial water storage data from GRACE to better
121 understand the hydrology of regional watersheds and the relationship between storage and
122 runoff. The temporal relationships between coincident *TWSA* and discharge observations at
123 three scales in the Columbia River Basin (CRB) of western North America are investigated
124 using climate, topography, and geology as a framing principle to describe the shape of the

132 storage-streamflow hysteresis. We associate regional and temporal differences in the
133 hystereses with varying watershed dynamics. Finally, we compare the prognostic abilities
134 of GRACE observations with individual modeled estimates of snow and soil moisture to
135 predict seasonal streamflow at regional scales.

136 2. Study Area

137 Our study area is the Columbia River Basin (CRB; 41-53°N and 110-122°W; Fig.
138 1). This basin has dry summers and wet winters. Up to 70% of annual precipitation falls
139 between November and March, 50-60% of which occurs as snow (Serreze et al., 1999;
140 Nolin et al., 2012). The spring months (April to June) are also wet, but warmer.

141 Precipitation during the spring combines with snowmelt to swell rivers and potentially
142 exacerbate flooding. Snowmelt also serves as a critical component of the hydrologic cycle,
143 recharging aquifers and filling streams later in the year. These contributions bridge the

144 temporal disconnect between wet winters and dry summers when demand is at its peak as
145 farmers, fish, hydropower and municipal users vie for over-allocated water resources
146 (United States Army Corps of Engineers, 2001; Oregon Water Supply and Conservation
147 Initiative, 2008). However, concerns with winter surplus and summer scarcity are not

148 uniform across the CRB, since climate and geology vary greatly, (Nolin, 2012). Two of the
149 study watersheds, the Upper Columbia (155,000 km²) and the Snake River basin (182,000
150 km²), represent distinctly different climatic, topographic, and geologic provinces of the

151 CRB (described and illustrated in Fig. 1). The Upper Columbia is wet and is characterized
152 by steep topography of fractured rock and poor groundwater storage. In contrast, the arid
153 Snake River basin is bowl-shaped with mountains on three sides. The interior of the Snake
154 River basin is a broad plain with well-developed soils underlain by a highly transmissive

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: -

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Con formato: Fuente de párrafo predeter., Fuente: Times

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Con formato: Fuente de párrafo predeter., Fuente: Times

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: These contributions bridge the temporal disconnect between wet winters and dry summers when demand is at its peak as farmers, fish, hydropower and municipal users vie for over-allocated water resources (United States Army Corps of Engineers, 2001; Oregon Water Supply and Conservation Initiative, 2008).

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: .

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: and expansive aquifer storage.

165 | [aquifer \(Whitehead, 1992, Fig. 1\)](#). The Columbia River at The Dalles (614,000 km²)
166 encompasses the Upper Columbia and the Snake River sub-basins, and its climate and
167 geology are an integration of the two (Fig. 1). A distinct climatic feature of the Columbia
168 River at The Dalles is the western slope of the Cascade Mountains, where over 3000 mm of
169 mean annual precipitation at higher elevations sustains a considerable seasonal snowpack.
170 The scale of this study was constrained to watersheds larger than 150,000 km², the optimal
171 minimum geographic limit of GRACE data (Yeh et al., 2006; Landerer and Swenson,
172 2012).

173 **3. Methods and Data**

174 We used 108 months of GRACE and streamflow data over nine water years (WY;
175 Oct – Sep; 2004–2012). This data comprises positive, neutral, and negative phases of the El
176 Niño-Southern Oscillation and negative and positive phases of the Pacific Decadal
177 Oscillation (Feng et al., 2014; Iizumi et al., 2014). As a result, the data provides years of
178 above- and below-average precipitation, snowpack, and streamflow for the region. The
179 three watersheds were delineated upstream from United States Geological Survey (USGS)
180 stream gages at 1° resolution, which is the resolution of GRACE data. In the CRB, these
181 grid cells represent a dimension of approximately 80 km by 120 km. The Upper Columbia
182 consists of the area upstream of the Columbia River at the International Boundary gage
183 (USGS 12399500), just downstream of the confluence of the Columbia and Pend-Oreille
184 Rivers. The Pend-Oreille is a major watershed in the upper portions of the CRB. The Snake
185 River gage at Weiser (USGS 13269000) provides gauged streamflow data above Hell’s
186 Canyon Reservoir, the largest impoundment in the Snake River basin. The USGS gage at
187 The Dalles (USGS 14105700) provides the most downstream streamflow data for the CRB.

188 Monthly mean runoff (R ; mm) was calculated for each of the three gages using the USGS
189 streamflow data.

190 Measurements of $TWSA$ were obtained from the GRACE RL-05 (Swenson and
191 Wahr, 2006; Landerer and Swenson, 2012) data set from NASA's Tellus website
192 (<http://grace.jpl.nasa.gov>). The errors present in the gridded GRACE data exist primarily as
193 a result of truncation (i.e., a low number of harmonics) in the spherical harmonic solution,
194 and smoothing and systematic noise removal (called "de-striping") that is applied after
195 GRACE level-2 processing to remove spatially correlated noise (called "stripes") (Swenson
196 and Wahr, 2006). This smoothing tends to smear adjacent signals together (within the
197 radius of the filtering function), resulting in smaller signals being lost, and larger signals
198 having a coarser footprint and a loss of spatial information.

199 To restore the GRACE signal lost during processing, the data were scaled using 1°
200 Land-Grid Scale Factors produced by putting a 1° land surface model through identical
201 processing (truncation and filtering) as the GRACE solutions, then measuring the decrease
202 in the signal amplitude at each 1° grid. These procedures are described on the Tellus
203 website and detailed in Landerer and Swenson (2012). Monthly 1° GRACE estimates of
204 $TWSA$, and the associated 1° leakage and measurement errors, were spatially averaged over
205 each of the three study watersheds following the procedures described in the Tellus
206 website.

207 GRACE represents monthly storage anomalies relative to an arbitrary record-length
208 mean value, analogous to the amount of water above or below the long-term mean storage
209 of a bucket, and should balance with the equation:

210 $\Delta Storage = TWSA = \Delta GW + \Delta SM + \Delta SWE + \Delta RES$ (1)

211 where all components are at monthly time steps; *GW* represents groundwater, *SM*
212 represents soil moisture (from 0–2000 mm depth), *SWE* represents snow water equivalent
213 (the equivalent depth of water held in snowpack), and *RES* represents reservoir storage. The
214 Δ used here represents the anomaly from the study-period mean, rather than a monthly
215 change. To isolate monthly groundwater storage anomalies ($\Delta GW = GWSA$) in the above
216 equation, ΔSM , ΔSWE and ΔRES estimates were subtracted from the monthly *TWSA* data
217 using methods described in Famiglietti et al. (2011). Similarly, the combined signal of
218 water storage anomalies of subsurface moisture ($TWSA_{sub}$), *SM* and *GW*, was isolated by
219 subtracting *SWE* and *RES* from *TWSA* values.

220 Monthly *SM* values over the study basins were obtained from the mean of the North
221 American and Global Land Data Assimilation Systems (NLDAS at 1/8° resolution
222 (Cosgrove et al., 2003) and GLDAS at 1/4° resolution (Rodell et al., 2004), respectively),
223 and were spatially averaged over the three study watersheds. Monthly 1-km resolution *SWE*
224 values were obtained from the mean of NLDAS and Snow Data Assimilation System
225 (SNODAS; National Operational Hydrologic Remote Sensing Center, 2004) and were
226 spatially averaged over the three watersheds. SNODAS data were used in place of the
227 GLDAS data product, which considerably underestimated *SWE* in mountainous areas when
228 compared to point-based measurements. Changes in monthly reservoir storage were
229 calculated for the five largest reservoirs in the CRB (see Table A1). Other smaller
230 reservoirs in the CRB were excluded when it was determined that fluctuations in their
231 levels were below the detection limits of GRACE.

232 Like all measurements, estimates of *TWSA* from GRACE contain error. For all of
233 the study basins, the range of error is well below the *TWSA* signal strength, approximately
234 an order of magnitude below the annual amplitude (200 – 300 mm) of the *TWSA* signal in
235 the CRB. The basin-averaged *TWSA* errors (time invariant) for the three study basins are 37
236 mm (Upper Columbia), 22 mm (Snake), and 25 mm (The Dalles).

237 The model data from LDAS and SNODAS simulations are driven by *in situ*
238 measurements, and represents the best available data for broad scales. We address any
239 structural error from an individual model by using an ensemble of outputs. Calculation of
240 the error in individual terms followed standard methodologies (Famiglietti et al., 2011),
241 where error in *SM* is the mean monthly standard deviation, and standard errors for *SWE* and
242 *RES* are 15% of mean absolute changes. *GWSA* and *TWSA_{sub}* anomaly errors are calculated
243 as the sum of basin-averaged errors (added as variance) in the individual terms in each
244 respective calculation (eq. 1), including the error in *TWSA* (Swenson et al., 2006). The
245 basin-averaged error variance for *GWSA* (time invariant) in the three study basins are 45
246 mm (Upper Columbia), 26 mm (Snake), and 33 mm (The Dalles). For *TWSA_{sub}* these values
247 are 37 mm (Upper Columbia), 22 mm (Snake), and 25 mm (The Dalles). The individual
248 error components (*SM*, *SWE*, *RES* respectively) for each basin are Upper Columbia (24
249 mm, 6 mm, 0.01 mm), Snake (14 mm, 3 mm, 0.01 mm), and The Dalles (21 mm, 4 mm,
250 0.01mm). Note that these error estimates are distributed across an entire regional watershed
251 and do not represent the error at individual monitoring sites. A time series of these values
252 and basin-averaged errors is provided in Fig. 2.

253 Based on an approach similar to Reager et al. (2014) and Riegger and Tourian
254 (2014), we plotted the temporal relationship between *TWSA* and *R* to examine hysteresis

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Con formato: Fuente: Cursiva

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Con formato: Fuente: Cursiva

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Con formato: Fuente: Cursiva

255 relationships in all three of the study watersheds for each individual water year and for the
256 monthly mean across all water years. Expanding from the integrated terrestrial component
257 of water storage, we also plotted the relationships of $TWSA_{sub}$ and $GWSA$ with R . We
258 examined the branches of these hysteresis plots to better understand how the size, shape,
259 and direction of the hystereses varied across years in each of the three regional watersheds.

260 In order to verify groundwater hysteresis, we compared the GRACE-derived $GWSA$
261 to groundwater depths from well measurements at 33 sites throughout the study region (Fig.
262 1 and Table A2). These data were normalized by their standard deviation, and the mean of
263 the 33 wells was calculated. The standard deviation of the GRACE-derived $GWSA$ for The
264 Dalles was normalized to provide a direct comparison of $GWSA$ and *in situ* measurements.

265 We further hypothesized that because peak SWE accumulation occurs between
266 February and April, that $TWSA$ for these months could be used to predict R for an
267 individual month and the cumulative seasonal runoff (R_{season}) that occurs after peak SWE
268 accumulation. To test this prognostic hypothesis we used a two-parameter power function
269 (The MathWorks, 2013):

$$270 \quad R_{predicted} = a(TWSA_{month})^b + c \quad (2)$$

271 where $R_{predicted}$ is runoff for the predicted time interval; $TWSA_{month}$ represents terrestrial
272 water storage for an individual month, and a, b, and c are fitted parameters from the power
273 function.

274 We tested this relationship for $TWSA$ in February, March and April to predict R_{season}
275 (April – September) and for the individual months of July (R_{July}), August (R_{Aug}), and
276 September (R_{Sep}); these represent the lower-flow months when demand is near its peak.

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Con formato: Fuente: Sin Cursiva

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Con formato: Fuente: Sin Cursiva

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Con formato: Fuente: Sin Cursiva

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Con formato: Fuente: Sin Cursiva

277 Additionally, we tested and compared the modeled-values of *SWE* from NLDAS and
278 SNODAS and *SM* from NLDAS and GLDAS, and the model-derived values of *TWSA_{sub}* to
279 predict *R_{season}* and for the individual months using the same power-function analysis.

280 Because our data set was constrained to nine water years, we used a double-pass
281 approach to fit and test the empirical relationship between *S_v-R*. This approach allowed us
282 double our data inputs for calculating standard hydrologic evaluation metrics such as Root
283 Mean Square Error (RMSE), standard Nash-Sutcliffe Efficiency (NSE) and Coefficient of
284 Determination (*R*²); (Legates and McCabe, 1999; Nash and Sutcliffe, 1970). The nine years
285 were divided into two sets (Set 1, even years 2004–2012; Set 2, odd years 2005–2011). The
286 first pass calculated the power function of *S_v-R* to Set 1, and the parameters were then tested
287 against Set 2. The roles of the datasets were then reversed and the datasets were again
288 tested against each other. The empirical model results from Sets 1 and 2 were then
289 combined into a single set of solutions for the model fit and tested against measured values
290 to calculate RMSE, NSE, and *R*². In order to maximize the limited data inputs, once we
291 tested the two independent sets for model performance, we combined the input data values
292 into a single set for all nine years to calculate a single power function curve. The observed
293 data were tested against the simulated data from the complete, but limited data record. The
294 final model curve was fit to these data, and the evaluation metrics include all of the years
295 for each respective dataset.

296 4. Results

297 4.1. Storage-runoff hysteresis

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: —

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: (Legates and McCabe, 1999).

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: -

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: -

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: —

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: ,

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: of each pass

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: compiled

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: one data set

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: sets

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: -

309 The filling and emptying of the study basins at the regional-scale over the course of
310 an individual WY results in a hysteretic relationship between storage and runoff (Fig. 3a).
311 The hysteresis loops begin at the onset of the wet season in October, with *TWSA* increasing
312 (Figs. 3a, 4a-c) as precipitation is stored as snow and soil moisture. An increase in storage
313 that is not offset by an increase in discharge indicates a predominance of snow inputs and
314 the freezing of soil water. The lower branch of the hysteresis plot (storage increase
315 unmatched by runoff) can be used to estimate cumulative snow water equivalent and soil
316 moisture in the basin. This is the water that later contributes to streamflow and groundwater
317 recharge in the spring.

318 The hysteresis shifts direction from Feb-Apr (inflection 1, Fig. 3a), and represents
319 each watershed's transition from storage to release. This response is evident (Figs. 3a, 4a-c,
320 and 5), as each hysteresis loop contains a vertical branch of the curve during which storage
321 is relatively constant, but streamflow increases rapidly. This timing also represents the
322 groundwater recharge branch of the loop. As snow melts and the ground thaws, runoff is
323 generated, recharge into soils occurs, and basins tend to be at peak storage during this
324 branch. Storage losses and additional precipitation inputs during this period are re-
325 organized internally. A second shift (inflection 2, Fig. 3a) occurs from Apr-June when peak
326 *TWSA* begins to decrease, representing spring snowmelt and a switch from precipitation
327 that falls primarily as snow to rain; these combine to contribute to peak *R*.

328 Once peak *R* values are reached, the loop shifts direction a third time (inflection 3,
329 Fig. 3a), receding on both axes as contributions from snowmelt diminish while presumably
330 groundwater sustains streams and provides a source for irrigated agriculture. During this
331 period, the relationship between *TWSA* and discharge is more linear, corresponding to

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: 3a) when saturated soils and snowmelt cause *R* to rapidly increase. Each

334 baseflow-driven runoff processes in which each monthly change in storage causes a
335 proportional change in the generation of streamflow.

336 | The hysteresis plots of $TWSA_{\leftarrow R}$ for an individual water year demonstrate that the
337 timing and quantity of precipitation governs the size of a hysteresis loop for an individual
338 WY (Figs. 3a, 4a-c, 5). For instance wet years (e.g., 2008) have bigger loops, while dry
339 years (e.g., 2005) are more compressed along both axes. However, the general shape of the
340 loops is distinct for each basin. Plotting multiple WYs provides a family of curves for each
341 basin that helps describe how climate, topography, and geology govern the timing and
342 magnitude of the relationship between $TWSA$ and R (Figs. 3a, 5).

343 4.2. Subsurface water ($TWSA_{sub}$) – runoff hysteresis

344 | The $TWSA_{sub}$ hysteresis curve contracts horizontally when the snow signal is
345 removed from $TWSA$ values for both the Upper Columbia and The Dalles (Figs. 3b, 4d-f),
346 which collapses the loops and takes a form similar to a plot-scale hysteresis of soil. In the
347 initial stages of the WY, the direction of the curve changes directions 2-3 times along the
348 $TWSA$ axis. Similar hysteresis fluctuations have also been documented at the more local
349 scale as the soil profile moves towards saturation (Penna et al., 2011). Peak $TWSA_{sub}$ occurs
350 in June, which corresponds to the spring melt of mountain snowpack and the end of the wet
351 season (Figs. 4d-f). In contrast to the near linear relationship between $TWSA_{sub}$ and R in the
352 Upper Columbia and The Dalles, the Snake River retains a more complex relationship. In
353 this watershed the hysteresis curve still retains a loop, but the timing of maximum $TWSA_{sub}$
354 is also earlier, reaching its peak during March and April (Fig. 4e). It is also noteworthy that

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: —

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: However in the Snake River,

357 | in the Snake River the $TWSA_{sub}$ - R hysteresis loop temporally progresses in the opposite
358 | direction, but stays in phase with precipitation inputs.

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: —

359 | **4.3. Groundwater-runoff hysteresis**

360 | The hysteresis loops describing the temporal relationship between $GWSA$ and R are
361 | equally informative, with one distinct difference—they temporally progress in opposite
362 | directions of the hysteresis loops of $TWSA$ and R (Fig. 3). For all three watersheds, $GWSA$
363 | decreases from Oct–Feb/Mar (Fig. 4h-j), which is out of phase with the onset of the wet
364 | season. $GWSA$ does not shift towards positive gains until early spring and the initial stages
365 | of melt before reaching its maximum in June. From June-Sept, $GWSA$ decreases minimally
366 | across all years during the runoff recession limb, indicating groundwater contributions to
367 | streamflow. This decreasing $GWSA$ signal does not stand out in Fig 2, as during WY 2011
368 | the $GWSA$ increased from 12.8 mm in June to 71.2 mm in September due a large snowpack
369 | that melted several months later than normal. This considerable anomaly muted the overall
370 | $GWSA$ recession from June-Sept that is found in all other water years (supplementary data
371 | and the interactive visualizations described subsequently).

372 | The 33 point-specific well data located across the CRB show considerable
373 | individual variability throughout a water year, and the mean of the normalized standard
374 | deviations of well levels was close to zero for all months. The temporal variability for the
375 | well data provides no discernable correlation with the derived $GWSA$ signal (Fig. A1).

376 | **4.4. Individual basin hysteresis plots of $TWSA$, $TWSA_{sub}$, $GWSA$ and R**

377 | Of the three study basins, the Upper Columbia is the most hydrologically active,
378 | showing the largest annual range for $TWSA$, $TWSA_{sub}$, $GWSA$, and R (Fig. 6). The $TWSA$ - R

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: —

381 hysteresis loops are more open (Fig. 4), corresponding to the fluxes of water moving
382 through watershed. When *SWE* is removed and subsurface water is highlighted, the
383 $TWSA_{sub}-R$ hysteresis loops collapse horizontally and more closely resemble the hystereses
384 associated with soil (Figs. 4d). However the inter-annual range ($WY_{max} - WY_{min}$) for
385 $TWSA_{sub}$ in the Upper Columbia is considerably greater than the other two basins (median
386 range = 234 mm; Fig. 6). As the hysteresis reverses directions for $GWSA-R$, the loops shift
387 to a more open shape (Figs. 4d), but the inter-annual range remains similar.

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: —

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: —

388 In contrast to the rapid response of the Upper Columbia, the Snake River receives
389 ~60% less annual precipitation, but has an annual $TWSA$ range that is only 22% less
390 (median annual range = 192 mm; $R=7$ mm; Figs. 4, 5, and 6). However, the $TWSA$
391 hysteresis loops for the Snake River are collapsed vertically (Fig. 4b). In the more arid
392 Snake River, removing the snow signal does not collapse the $TWSA_{sub}-R$ hysteresis loops
393 ($TWSA_{sub} = 89$ mm). Similarly, the $GWSA$ loops suggest that subsurface moisture plays a
394 more prominent role in the Snake River.

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: —

395 The climate, topography, and geology of the Columbia River at The Dalles are an
396 integration of the Upper Columbia and Snake River, seen in the shape of the hysteresis
397 loops (Figs. 4, 5, 6; median annual range $TWSA=195$ mm; $R=27$ mm). The period from
398 Feb–June more closely resembles the Snake River basin, with gradual increases in $TWSA$
399 and sharp increases in R . The slope of the recession from June–Sept has the same general
400 shape for The Dalles as the Upper Columbia (Figs. 4a, 4c), presumably from snowmelt-
401 generated runoff.

405 [Interactive visualizations that compliment all of the hysteresis figures are online at:](https://public.tableau.com/profile/sprolese - !/vizhome/GRACE_hystereses/WSADash)
406 [https://public.tableau.com/profile/sprolese - !/vizhome/GRACE_hystereses/WSADash.](https://public.tableau.com/profile/sprolese - !/vizhome/GRACE_hystereses/WSADash)

407 **4.5. Streamflow forecasting**

408 We next present how *TWSA* was applied prognostically to predict streamflow.
409 Using the double-pass calibration and validation approach, $TWSA_{\text{Mar}}$ provided the best
410 overall predictive capabilities for R_{season} with a mean NSE ($\overline{\text{NSE}}$) and mean R^2 ($\overline{R^2}$) of 0.75
411 and 0.91, respectfully (Fig. 7a, Table 1), for all three basins. The Dalles had the highest
412 NSE and R^2 , and lowest RMSE values (0.98, 0.98, 6 mm; Table 1). The results in the
413 Upper Columbia were also robust (0.82, 0.86, 33 mm; Table 1), while the Snake River
414 performed with less skill (0.46, 0.59, and 14 mm, Table 1). Applying $TWSA_{\text{April}}$ also
415 provided similar results, but with a lower degree of skill in predicting R ($\overline{\text{NSE}} = 0.57$, $\overline{R^2} =$
416 0.69). $TWSA_{\text{Apr}}$ provided improved predicted capabilities in the Upper Columbia (0.87,
417 0.88, and 28 mm, Table 1), but inferior results in the other two watersheds. $TWSA_{\text{Feb}}$ had a
418 low degree of skill in predicting R in all three watersheds (Table A3).

419 $TWSA_{\text{Mar}}$ and $TWSA_{\text{April}}$ also served as a good predictor of monthly runoff in July
420 and August for the Upper Columbia and to a lesser degree in The Dalles (Tables 1 and A3).
421 In the Snake River, *TWSA* did not serve as a good predictor for R in an individual month.

422 Snowpack and soil moisture play a considerable role in the hydrology of the CRB
423 and are commonly used to help predict water demand and availability later in the year
424 (Koster et al., 2010). We compared the capabilities of the modeled snow (*SWE*) and soil
425 moisture (*SM*) products to predict R to the skill of measured GRACE *TWSA* data (Table 1).
426 In the Upper Columbia and The Dalles, $TWSA_{\text{Mar}}$ predicts seasonal and monthly runoff

427 (July and August) with considerably more skill than *SWE* or *SM* (Figure 7, Table 1). In the
428 Snake River, SM_{Mar} has a higher degree of skill than $TWSA_{Mar}$ in predicting R_{season} and R_{Aug} .
429 SWE_{Mar} provided inferior results in all three watersheds, but with some predictive skill in
430 the Upper Columbia and The Dalles (NSE of 0.24 and 0.46 respectively, Table 1). In all
431 three watersheds, $TWSA_{sub}$ provided extremely poor predictions (Tables 1 and A3).

432 When the results of the empirical model using two independent sets of data proved
433 robust for some of the storage metrics, the observed data were tested against the simulated
434 data from the complete, but limited data record. The performance of the empirical model
435 improved using the complete data set (Tables 2 and A4), with the same general results.
436 $TWSA_{Mar}$ provided the best model fit for seasonal runoff in the Upper Columbia (NSE =
437 0.93, RMSE = 19.8 mm) and The Dalles (NSE = 0.98, RMSE = 5.7 mm). In the Snake
438 River, predictive capabilities improved more dramatically (NSE = 0.83, RMSE = 7.4 mm),
439 but soil moisture still served as a better predictor of seasonal streamflow (NSE = 0.93,
440 RMSE = 5.2 mm). Similarly, $TWSA_{Mar}$ provided the best model fit for runoff in August, one
441 of the drier months when demand is at its peak (Tables 2 and A4).

442 5. Discussion

443 5.1. Storage-runoff hysteresis

444 Decades of data collection and monitoring at individual gage sites indicate that
445 watersheds collect, store and release water. Using one integrated measurement from the
446 GRACE satellites, our results show these same **processes** at the regional scale in the
447 hysteresis loops of storage ($TWSA$) and runoff (R). While hystereic processes have
448 previously been identified in local-scale measurements (McDonnell, 2003; McGlynn and

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Con formato: Fuente: Cursiva

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: process

450 McDonnell, 2003), only recently has streamflow-storage hysteresis been identified at the
451 regional scale (Riegger and Tourian, 2014).

452 Our work builds on Riegger and Tourian's (2014) results, and employs GRACE data to
453 describe how regional watersheds function as integrated, non-linear systems governed by
454 climate, topography, and geology. Climate controls the size of the hysteresis loops by
455 providing a first-order control on hydrologic inputs and the storage of solid water, which in
456 turn governs the ranges of *TWSA* and *R*. However, runoff response to precipitation and
457 snowmelt does not act independently from topography and geology (Jefferson et al., 2008;
458 Tague et al., 2008), which controls how liquid water is stored and routed through a
459 watershed, even at the regional scale. The climatic, topographic, and geological
460 characteristics of each watershed provide an explanation of the *S_t-R* relationship that govern
461 the shape and size of its respective hysteresis curve. GRACE offers a single, integrated
462 measurement of changes in water storage through and across a watershed that can be
463 applied to predict regional streamflow using an empirical model. Where these predictive
464 capabilities succeed and fail help better describe the climatic, topographic, and geological
465 characteristics in each watershed.

466 For example, in the Upper Columbia, steep topography and wet climate fills subsurface
467 storage quickly before reaching a threshold in April or May. This transition represents the
468 watershed's transition from winter storage to spring runoff. After this watershed-scale
469 threshold is reached, the steep topography moves snowmelt and rain quickly through the
470 terrestrial system and into the river channel until cresting in June (Figs. 4, 5, and 6),
471 followed by declines in *TWSA* and *R* from June-September. These large fluxes of water

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: —

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: helps

474 create a more open hysteresis loop, expanding non-linearly on both the horizontal and
475 vertical axes.

476 The Upper Columbia also has the broadest range of annual $TWSA_{sub}$ and $GWSA$ during
477 the study period (Figs. 5 and 6), despite having limited aquifer capacity. Conceptually, this
478 demonstrates that the upper limit of storage is greater than in the Snake River or The
479 Dalles, but that it also loses the most water. Its minimums at the end of the WY are also the
480 lowest (median $TWSA_{Sep} = -98\text{mm}$; Figs. 5 and 6). This range across $TWSA$, $TWSA_{sub}$, and
481 $GWSA$ supports the conceptual model that the watershed fills during the wet season, and is
482 then drained more quickly due to steep topography and limited water storage. The
483 predictive capability of $TWSA$ also strongly suggests that the components and temporal
484 relationships of storage across this watershed are interconnected, and that incorporating
485 April snowpack improves the model results.

486 In contrast, the arid Snake River basin provides a very different family of hysteresis
487 curves (Figs. 4, 5) that identify groundwater and soil moisture as primary components of
488 watershed function. The curves are compressed vertically (R) as compared to the Upper
489 Columbia, and are more constrained horizontally (Fig. 6). The onset of spring melt runoff
490 in February does not deplete $TWSA$ for the Snake River. Instead, $TWSA$ continues to
491 increase until May, when peak runoff occurs. As $TWSA$ decreases to the end of the water
492 year in September, the median $TWSA_{Sep}$ measurement (-78 mm) is 20 mm greater than in
493 the Upper Columbia. This indicates that the lower drainage threshold of the Snake River
494 watershed is relatively greater than the Upper Columbia, potentially explained by a less
495 severe topography and higher aquifer capacity.

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: -

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: (-

498 The $TWSA_{sub}$ hysteresis curves in the Snake River retain a similar shape to the
499 $TWSA$ signal. While they reverse direction they do stay temporally connected to the onset
500 of the wet season in October, indicating that subsurface moisture is a central control on the
501 filling of the watershed through May. The capabilities of SM to empirically predict R better
502 than $TWSA$ further highlight the importance of subsurface water in this watershed. The
503 intra-annual range of $GWSA$ in the Snake River is also more limited than in the more
504 hydrologically responsive Upper Columbia. This more limited range of data supports the
505 conceptual model of a watershed that retains comparatively more winter precipitation in
506 soils and aquifers throughout the spring season, and that sustains flow later in the year and
507 until the onset of melt the following winter.

508 The greater Columbia River Basin upstream from The Dalles integrates the climatic,
509 topographic, and geologic characteristics of the Snake River and Upper Columbia as well
510 as other areas within the CRB. The western slope of the Cascades (Fig. 1), which is outside
511 of the Upper Columbia, accumulates up to several meters of SWE each winter. Due east of
512 the Cascades, a broad basalt plain that provides aquifer storage helps dampen the snowmelt
513 pulse in the spring. The hysteresis loops for The Dalles reflect these combined
514 characteristics.

515 Storage at The Dalles increases along the horizontal axis ($TWSA$) until peak storage
516 is reached in March or April (Figs 3, 4, and 5). This $TWSA$ threshold of approximately 100
517 mm responds with an increase in R that continues through June. In July, the hysteresis
518 begins to recede along both axes closing out the loop. The $GWSA$ has the most limited
519 range, potentially explained by the extensive basalt aquifer moderating the relationship
520 between storage and runoff. In The Dalles, $TWSA_{Sep}$ has a median value of -88mm (Fig. 6),

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: an expansive

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: -

523 between the lower drainage thresholds of the Upper Columbia and Snake River watersheds;
524 indicating an integration of the contributing climate, topography, and geology.

525 **5.2. Distinguishing the difference between $TWSA_{sub}$ and $GWSA$**

526 Conceptually $TWSA_{sub}$ represents changes in the amount of water stored as soil
527 moisture and groundwater, where as $GWSA$ represents water changes greater than 2000mm
528 below the soil surface. The goals of evaluating these metrics were to see if monthly changes
529 in soil moisture were linked to changes in groundwater storage, and the role of snowpack in
530 the $S-R$ relationship.

531 The $TWSA_{sub}$ hysteresis curves in the Upper Columbia and The Dalles collapse into
532 a more linear relationship that is more commonly associated with the $S-R$ relationship of a
533 soil matrix (Fig. 3 and 4). These stand in contrast to the Snake River where the $TWSA_{sub}-R$
534 hystereses retain a loop, indicating a more complex relationship between storage and
535 runoff. The hydrological processes that create these differences warrant investigation, but
536 lie outside the scope of this study.

537 Although the annual fluctuations of SM are similar in all three basins (Fig. 2), its
538 impact in the Upper Columbia is more pronounced. This watershed has poor groundwater
539 storage, and relies on soils to provide seasonal storage of rain and snowmelt. In the Upper
540 Columbia once the SM signal is removed, the intra-annual range of $GWSA$ shifts to
541 considerably lower values (Fig. 6). Shifts of similar magnitudes in $GWSA$ are not found in
542 the Snake River and The Dalles. These watersheds have excellent groundwater storage and
543 are less reliant on soils to provide seasonal storage of rain and snowmelt. Fluctuations in

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: —

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: —

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: This is

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: $GWSA$

548 reservoir levels are minimal with regards to the water fluxes in this region, and have
549 minimal impact on calculations of *GWSA*.

550 The *GWSA-R* hystereses are represented by loops that show an out-of-phase
551 relationship between precipitation and groundwater recharge from the start of the wet
552 season in October until February or March. The $TWSA_{sub}$ and *GWSA* hysteresis plots
553 demonstrate that in the Upper Columbia and The Dalles changes in monthly soil moisture
554 are not always temporally aligned with *GWSA*. This can be explained by the physical
555 reality that soil moisture and groundwater are not always interconnected, and that there is
556 not a fixed depth (i.e., 2000 mm) that separates the two components of water storage.

557 GRACE-derived calculations of *GWSA* also provide insights into the hydrological
558 processes governing groundwater recharge and depletion, as evidenced in the *GWSA*
559 hysteresis loops. The *GWSA-R* curves show an out-of-phase relationship between
560 precipitation and groundwater recharge from the start of the wet season in October until
561 February or March.

562 This response in all of the *GWSA-R* hystereses suggests that even at the watershed
563 scale groundwater recharge requires soils and geologic materials to fill to a certain moisture
564 threshold and for the onset of snowmelt (Figs. 3a, 4a-c, 5, and web-based interactive
565 visualizations). This also suggests that snowmelt inputs to groundwater are considerable. In
566 the CRB this is critical as current climate trends are projected to reduce snowpack
567 accumulation and exacerbate melt in the region (Wu et al., 2012; Rupp et al., 2013; Sproles
568 et al., 2013).

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: these two basins

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: —

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: indicates that

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: helps sustain stream flow during the wet fall and winter and that pore space in

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: must

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: before groundwater begins to recharge and runoff is generated. The relationship between the *TWSA* and *GWSA* curves from Oct-Mar identifies how

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: also marks the beginning of groundwater recharge, and

581 Additionally, our analysis identifies summer as the time of peak groundwater
582 storage in all three regional watersheds. This finding is of value for groundwater
583 management and policy decisions, as peak groundwater levels in June correspond to the
584 timing of groundwater pump tests that are used to develop groundwater withdrawal
585 regulations (Jarvis, 2011, 2014). Our data suggest that groundwater pump tests should not
586 be limited to an individual month, and should also include periods of reduced storage
587 particularly during the winter months. The inclusion of multiple pump tests throughout the
588 year could be particularly relevant as the population and water demand is projected to
589 increase in the region.

590 The point-specific well data are not conclusive and show considerable variability
591 with no consistent pattern regarding the timing of recharge and peak groundwater levels.
592 This is presumably a function of how site characteristics (i.e., usage, depth, location,
593 elevation) are extremely variable across a region. Rather than excluding these results or
594 selecting individual wells that match GRACE data, we discuss the results from all 33 wells
595 to help demonstrate the high variability that exists from well to well, and that
596 measurements of groundwater changes at a fixed location does not represent watershed-
597 scale characteristics (Jarvis, 2011, 2014). The disconnect between sites also highlights the
598 concept brought forward by Spence (2010), that storage is not uniform across a watershed,
599 and functions as a series of discontinuous processes at the watershed scale.

600 **5.3. Applying the S_e - R relationship as a predictive tool**

601 We applied these climatic, topographic, and geologic insights to develop and test
602 the hypothesis that spring $TWSA$ could predict R later in the year, based on two

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: —

604 observations: First, the shapes of the hysteresis curves for each basin are similar (Figs. 4a-c,
605 5), but vary by magnitude of annual $TWSA$. Second, peak $TWSA$ occurs before the peak
606 runoff. We show that the integrated GRACE signal is a good baseline measurement to
607 empirically predict seasonal streamflow across a range of water years with regards to
608 precipitation and streamflow. In essence, our data suggest that the water stored across and
609 through the Columbia River Basin in March describes the water available for the remainder
610 of the water year.

611 In the CRB and in the northwestern United States, peak snowpack occurs in March
612 or April, and is commonly used as a metric for predicting spring runoff. Despite the
613 importance of snowpack to the hydrologic cycle of the region, measurements of $TWSA_{Mar}$
614 from GRACE provide a better prediction of R_{season} , R_{July} , and R_{Aug} than model-derived
615 estimates of snowpack. GRACE $TWSA_{Mar}$ also provided a better prediction for runoff than
616 soil moisture, except for the Snake River watershed. There SM_{Mar} provided a better
617 indicator of runoff for the rest of the year. $TWSA_{Feb}$ provided inferior predictive capacity, as
618 the annual maximum $TWSA$ values have not been reached.

619 These results are promising with regards to using GRACE as a predictive tool for
620 water resources in both wet and dry years. Our limited data record represents a wide-range
621 of conditions with regards to climate and streamflow, which is captured in our empirical
622 models and is shown in the box plots to the right of Figs. 7a - b. These same results also
623 indicate that R is insensitive to $TWSA_{Mar}$ values below 100 mm, in the Upper Columbia and
624 at The Dalles and below 85 mm in the Snake River watershed. This limitation is not the
625 empirical model, which works well, but that the basins have a limited response (i.e., R_{season}
626 in the Snake River only changes about 60 mm, from around 20 to 85 mm). Given these

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: March soil moisture

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Eliminado: This lower threshold

629 | responses the model works, and provides a lower threshold that describes with some
630 | certainty the amount of runoff that will be available for operations for the remainder of the
631 | year.

632 | We recognize that all three of these regional watersheds are managed through a
633 | series of dams and reservoirs that create an altered runoff signal. Water resources managers
634 | use point-specific and model-based estimates of water storage in the region to optimize
635 | their operations for the water year. Additionally, in the fertile plains of the Snake River and
636 | lower CRB, broad-scale agriculture relies on both ground- and surface water for irrigation.
637 | Water withdrawals would be implicit in the *TWSA* signal and reduce *R*. However, a more
638 | detailed analysis of withdrawals lies outside the scope of this study.

639 | Regardless of the length of record or anthropogenic influence, climate, topography,
640 | and geology still provide the first-order controls on water storage that are found in the
641 | hysteresis loops. GRACE encapsulates these hydrologic processes through measurements
642 | of *TWSA*. The hysteresis loops expand and contract accordingly during wet and dry years,
643 | as the intra-annual relationship between *TWSA* and *Q* represents the fluxes of water into
644 | and out of the watershed. Despite intra-annual differences, a family of hysteresis curves can
645 | describe each of the sub-regional watersheds. The predicative capability using *TWSA*, the
646 | vertical sum of water, as compared to snowpack and soil moisture further highlights the
647 | integrated nature of water storage in regional hydrology. These predictive capabilities
648 | highlight the potential of GRACE to improve upon seasonal forecast predictions and
649 | regional hydrological models.

650 | **5.4. GRACE as an analysis tool for regional watersheds**

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Eliminado: highlights

652 Where previous approaches to modeling watershed behavior have focused on
653 separate storage compartments, new approaches should include the magnitude and direction
654 of hysteresis (Spence, 2010). This integrated approach would provide new ways forward to
655 classify watersheds not only by runoff, but also on the first-order controls that govern the
656 non-linear hydrological processes.

657 Even though GRACE is somewhat of a blunt instrument with regards to temporal
658 (monthly) and spatial (1°) resolution, this emerging technology provides a new dimension
659 to regional watershed analysis by providing an integrated measurement of water stored
660 across and through the Earth. These measurements continue to prove their value in
661 retrospective analysis of regional hydrology (Rodell et al., 2009; Castle et al., 2014).
662 However, the hysteresis loops presented by Riegger and Tourian (2014) and further
663 developed in this paper demonstrate the ability of GRACE data to help develop a process-
664 based understanding of how regional watersheds function as simple, dynamic systems. As
665 the temporal record of GRACE continues to increase, its value as both a diagnostic and
666 predictive tool will continue to grow. In the mean time, these data have value in
667 augmenting existing management strategies.

668 Perhaps one of the most important facets of GRACE data is that it does not
669 distinguish political boundaries. It is not linked to a specific *in situ* monitoring agency with
670 limited data access and has the capacity to bridge sparse and inconsistent on-the-ground
671 hydrologic monitoring networks that exist in many regions of the world. Previous GRACE-
672 based analysis has shown its value in highlighting negative trends in terrestrial water
673 storage in trans-boundary watersheds (Voss et al., 2013; Castle et al., 2014), and resulting
674 regional conflict exacerbated by water shortages (Gleick, 2014b). GRACE provides an

675 objective measurement of a region's water resources that can provide valuable insights into
676 potential shortages or surpluses of water resources, and simple empirical predictions of
677 seasonal and monthly runoff that are easily deployable in places with limited data.

678 **6. Conclusions**

679 We have shown how GRACE-based measurements of *TWSA* distill the complexity
680 of regional hydrology into a simple, dynamic system. *TWSA* and derived estimates of
681 *GWSA* reveal hysteretic behavior for regional watersheds, which is more commonly
682 associated with hydrologic measurements at local scales. While the magnitude of the
683 hysteresis curves vary across years, they retain the same general shape that is unique to
684 each watershed. We demonstrated the utility of these hysteresis curves by showing how the
685 complete *TWSA* record during March and April can be used to empirically predict *R* for the
686 remainder for the water year ($TWSA_{Mar}$, mean NSE = 0.91) and during the drier summer
687 months ($TWSA_{Mar}$, mean NSE for July = 0.76, August = 0.72; Tables 1 and 2).

688 Because GRACE *TWSA* can augment prediction, managers could start to interpret
689 each year's hysteresis curve for the upcoming spring and summer, providing greater clarity
690 and validation for model-based forecasts presently used by water resource managers. Our
691 results demonstrate a way forward, expanding GRACE from a diagnostic tool, into a
692 conceptual model and predictive resource.

693 Although this study focused on the CRB, which has a rich data record, GRACE data
694 are available at a global scale and could be readily applied in areas with a paucity of data to
695 understand how watersheds function and to improve streamflow forecasting capabilities.
696 GRACE does not discern political boundaries and provides an integrated approach to

697 understanding international watersheds (Voss et al., 2013). This resource could serve as a
698 valuable tool for managers in forecasting surplus and scarcity, and in developing strategies
699 that include changes in supply and demand due to human consumptive needs and current
700 climate trends (Wagener et al., 2010; Gleick, 2014a).

701

702 **Author Contributions**

703 E.A.S., S.G.L., and P.J.W. developed the hysteresis concept based upon background
704 research by J.R. and J.S.F. The data analysis was led by E.A.S., but represents a combined
705 effort from all of the authors. J.R. provided expertise in the GRACE data product,
706 groundwater, and error analysis. E.A.S. prepared the manuscript with contributions from all
707 co-authors.

708 **Acknowledgments**

709 The authors would like to thank Matthew Rodell and Felix Landerer for their
710 expertise in understanding GRACE data during the initial stages of the research. GRACE
711 terrestrial data were processed by Sean Swenson, supported by the NASA MEASUREs
712 Program, and are available at <http://grace.jpl.nasa.gov>. The GLDAS and NLDAS data used
713 in this study were acquired as part of the mission of NASA's Earth Science Division and
714 archived and distributed by the Goddard Earth Sciences Data and Information Services
715 Center. We would like to thank the reviewers of the manuscript that have helped improve
716 its overall quality. Additionally, Tim Kerr provided objective feedback and comments on
717 the research findings. The information in this document has been funded entirely by the US
718 Environmental Protection Agency, in part by an appointment to the Internship/Research
719 Participation Program at the Office of Research and Development, U.S. Environmental
720 Protection Agency, administered by the Oak Ridge Institute for Science and Education
721 through an interagency agreement between the U.S. Department of Energy and EPA. This
722 manuscript has been subjected to Agency review and has been approved for publication.

723 Mention of trade names or commercial products does not constitute endorsement or
724 recommendation for use.

725

726 **References**

- 727 Appleby, F. V.: Recession and the baseflow problem, *Water Resour. Res.*, 6(5), 1398–
728 1403, doi:10.1029/WR006i005p01398, 1970.
- 729 | Aspinall, R.: A Century of physical geography research in the *Annals, Ann. Assoc. Am.*
730 *Geogr.*, 100(5), 1049–1059, 2010.
- 731 | Ayala, A., McPhee, J. and Vargas, X.: Altitudinal gradients, midwinter melt, and wind
732 effects on snow accumulation in semiarid midlatitude Andes under La Niña conditions,
733 *Water Resour. Res.*, 2014.
- 734 | Bales, R. C., Molotch, N. P., Painter, T. H., Dettinger, M. D., Rice, R. and Dozier, J.:
735 Mountain hydrology of the western United States, *Water Resour. Res.*, 42(8), W08432,
736 doi:10.1029/2005wr004387, 2006.
- 737 | Barthel, R.: A call for more fundamental science in regional hydrogeology, *Hydrogeol. J.*,
738 22(3), 507–510, 2014.
- 739 | Beven, K.: Towards integrated environmental models of everywhere: uncertainty, data and
740 modelling as a learning process, *Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci.*, 11(1), 460–467, 2007.
- 741 | Beven, K. J.: Preferential flows and travel time distributions: defining adequate hypothesis
742 tests for hydrological process models, *Hydrol. Process.*, 24(12), 1537–1547, 2010.
- 743 | Black, P. E.: *Watershed hydrology*, CRC Press, Boca Raton, FL., 1996.
- 744 | Blöschl, G.: Scaling in hydrology, *Hydrol. Process.*, 15(4), 709–711, 2001.
- 745 | Brocca, L., Melone, F., Moramarco, T. and Morbidelli, R.: Spatial-temporal variability of
746 soil moisture and its estimation across scales, *Water Resour. Res.*, 46(2), 2010.
- 747 | Brutsaert, W.: Long-term groundwater storage trends estimated from streamflow records:
748 Climatic perspective, *Water Resour. Res.*, 44(2), W02409, doi:10.1029/2007WR006518,
749 2008.
- 750 | Capell, R., Tetzlaff, D., Hartley, A. J. and Soulsby, C.: Linking metrics of hydrological
751 function and transit times to landscape controls in a heterogeneous mesoscale catchment,
752 *Hydrol. Process.*, 26(3), 405–420, 2012.
- 753 | Castle, S. L., Thomas, B. F., Reager, J. T., Rodell, M., Swenson, S. C. and Famiglietti, J.
754 S.: Groundwater Depletion During Drought Threatens Future Water Security of the
755 Colorado River Basin, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, doi:10.1002/2014GL061055, 2014.

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM
Con formato: Fuente: Adobe Caslon Pro
Bold

- 756 | Cayan, D. R.: Interannual Climate Variability and Snowpack in the Western United States,
757 J. Clim., 9(5), 928–948, doi:10.1175/1520-0442(1996)009<0928:ICVASI>2.0.CO;2, 1996.
- 758 | Clark, M. P., Kavetski, D. and Fenicia, F.: Pursuing the method of multiple working
759 hypotheses for hydrological modeling, *Water Resour. Res.*, 47(9), 2011.
- 760 | Cosgrove, B. A., Lohmann, D., Mitchell, K. E., Houser, P. R., Wood, E. F., Schaake, J. C.,
761 Robock, A., Marshall, C., Sheffield, J. and Duan, Q.: Real-time and retrospective forcing in
762 the North American Land Data Assimilation System (NLDAS) project, *J. Geophys. Res.*,
763 108(D22), 8842, 2003.
- 764 | Dozier, J.: Mountain hydrology, snow color, and the fourth paradigm, *Eos, Trans. Am.*
765 *Geophys. Union*, 92(43), 373, doi:10.1029/2011EO430001, 2011.
- 766 | Famiglietti, J. S., Lo, M., Ho, S. L., Bethune, J., Anderson, K. J., Syed, T. H., Swenson, S.
767 C., de Linage, C. R. and Rodell, M.: Satellites measure recent rates of groundwater
768 depletion in California’s Central Valley, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 38(3), L03403,
769 doi:10.1029/2010gl046442, 2011.
- 770 | Famiglietti, J. S. and Rodell, M.: Water in the Balance, *Science* (80-.), 340(6138), 1300–
771 1301, 2013.
- 772 | Feng, J., Wang, L. and Chen, W.: How does the East Asian summer monsoon behave in the
773 decaying phase of El Niño during different PDO phases?, *J. Clim.*, 27(7), 2682–2698, 2014.
- 774 | Gleeson, T., Wada, Y., Bierkens, M. F. P. and van Beek, L. P. H.: Water balance of global
775 aquifers revealed by groundwater footprint, *Nature*, 488(7410), 197–200, 2012.
- 776 | Gleick, P.: Water, Drought, Climate Change, and Conflict in Syria, *Weather. Clim. Soc.*, 6,
777 331–340, 2014a.
- 778 | Gleick, P. H.: *The World’s Water Volume 8: The Biennial Report on Freshwater*
779 *Resources*, Island Press., 2014b.
- 780 | Iizumi, T., Luo, J.-J., Challinor, A. J., Sakurai, G., Yokozawa, M., Sakuma, H., Brown, M.
781 E. and Yamagata, T.: Impacts of El Niño Southern Oscillation on the global yields of major
782 crops, *Nat. Commun.*, 5, 2014.
- 783 | Jarvis, W. T.: Unitization: a lesson in collective action from the oil industry for aquifer
784 governance, *Water Int.*, 36(5), 619–630, 2011.
- 785 | Jarvis, W. T.: *Contesting Hidden Waters: Conflict Resolution for Groundwater and*
786 *Aquifers*, Routledge., 2014.

- 787 | Jefferson, A., Nolin, A., Lewis, S. and Tague, C.: Hydrogeologic controls on streamflow
788 sensitivity to climate variation, *Hydrol. Process.*, 22(22), 4371–4385,
789 doi:10.1002/hyp.7041, 2008.
- 790 | Kirchner, J. W.: Catchments as simple dynamical systems: Catchment characterization,
791 rainfall-runoff modeling, and doing hydrology backward, *Water Resour. Res.*, 45(2),
792 W02429, doi:10.1029/2008WR006912, 2009.
- 793 | Koster, R. D., Mahanama, S. P. P., Livneh, B., Lettenmaier, D. P. and Reichle, R. H.: Skill
794 in streamflow forecasts derived from large-scale estimates of soil moisture and snow, *Nat.*
795 *Geosci.*, 3(9), 613–616,
796 doi:http://www.nature.com/ngeo/journal/v3/n9/supinfo/ngeo944_S1.html, 2010.
- 797 | Landerer, F. W. and Swenson, S. C.: Accuracy of scaled GRACE terrestrial water storage
798 estimates, *Water Resour. Res.*, 48(4), W04531, doi:10.1029/2011wr011453, 2012.
- 799 | Legates, D. R. and McCabe, G. J.: Evaluating the use of “goodness-of-fit” measures in
800 hydrologic and hydroclimatic model validation, *Water Resour. Res.*, 35(1), 233–241, 1999.
- 801 | Li, B., Rodell, M., Zaitchik, B. F., Reichle, R. H., Koster, R. D. and van Dam, T. M.:
802 Assimilation of GRACE terrestrial water storage into a land surface model: Evaluation and
803 potential value for drought monitoring in western and central Europe, *J. Hydrol.*, 446, 103–
804 115, 2012.
- 805 | Mahanama, S., Livneh, B., Koster, R., Lettenmaier, D. and Reichle, R.: Soil Moisture,
806 Snow, and Seasonal Streamflow Forecasts in the United States, *J. Hydrometeorol.*, 13(1),
807 189–203, doi:10.1175/JHM-D-11-046.1, 2011.
- 808 | McDonnell, J. J.: Where does water go when it rains? Moving beyond the variable source
809 area concept of rainfall-runoff response, *Hydrol. Process.*, 17(9), 1869–1875,
810 doi:10.1002/hyp.5132, 2003.
- 811 | McDonnell, J. J., Sivapalan, M., Vache, K., Dunn, S., Grant, G., Haggerty, R., Hinz, C.,
812 Hooper, R., Kirchner, J., Roderick, M. L., Selker, J. and Weiler, M.: Moving beyond
813 heterogeneity and process complexity: A new vision for watershed hydrology, *Water*
814 *Resour. Res.*, 43(7), doi:10.1029/2006wr005467, 2007.
- 815 | McGlynn, B. L. and McDonnell, J. J.: Quantifying the relative contributions of riparian and
816 hillslope zones to catchment runoff, *Water Resour. Res.*, 39(11),
817 doi:10.1029/2003WR002091, 2003.
- 818 | McNamara, J. P., Tetzlaff, D., Bishop, K., Soulsby, C., Seyfried, M., Peters, N. E.,
819 Aulenbach, B. T. and Hooper, R.: Storage as a Metric of Catchment Comparison, *Hydrol.*
820 *Process.*, 25(21), 3364–3371, doi:10.1002/hyp.8113, 2011.

- 821 | Milly, P. C. D., Betancourt, J., Falkenmark, M., Hirsch, R. M., Kundzewicz, Z. W.,
822 | Lettenmaier, D. P. and Stouffer, R. J.: Stationarity Is Dead: Whither Water Management?,
823 | *Science* (80-.), 319(5863), 573–574, doi:10.1126/science.1151915, 2008.
- 824 | Moradkhani, H. and Sorooshian, S.: General Review of Rainfall-Runoff Modeling: Model
825 | Calibration, Data Assimilation, and Uncertainty Analysis, in *Hydrological Modelling and*
826 | *the Water Cycle*, pp. 1–24., 2008.
- 827 | [Nash, J. E. and Sutcliffe, J. V: River flow forecasting through conceptual models part I ,Äi](#)
828 | [A discussion of principles, *J. Hydrol.*, 10\(3\), 282–290, 1970.](#)
- 829 | National Operational Hydrologic Remote Sensing Center: Snow Data Assimilation System
830 | (SNODAS) Data Products at NSIDC, [2003-2012], National Snow and Ice Data Center,
831 | Boulder, Colorado USA., 2004.
- 832 | Nolin, A. W.: Perspectives on Climate Change, Mountain Hydrology, and Water Resources
833 | in the Oregon Cascades, USA, *Mt. Res. Dev.*, 32(S1), S35–S46, doi:10.1659/mrd-journal-
834 | d-11-00038.s1, 2012.
- 835 | Nolin, A. W., Sproles, E. A. and Brown, A.: Climate change impacts on snow and water
836 | resources in the Columbia, Willamette, and McKenzie River Basins, USA: A nested
837 | watershed study. , in *Transboundary River Governance in the Face of Uncertainty: The*
838 | *Columbia River Treaty*, edited by B. Cosens, Oregon State University Press, Corvallis,
839 | OR., 2012.
- 840 | Oregon Water Supply and Conservation Initiative: Southern Willamette valley municipal
841 | water providers final report., 2008.
- 842 | Payne, J. T., Wood, A. W., Hamlet, A. F., Palmer, R. N. and Lettenmaier, D. P.: Mitigating
843 | the Effects of Climate Change on the Water Resources of the Columbia River Basin, *Clim.*
844 | *Change*, 62(1), 233–256, 2004.
- 845 | Peel, M. C. and Blöschl, G.: Hydrological modelling in a changing world, *Prog. Phys.*
846 | *Geogr.*, 35(2), 249–261, 2011.
- 847 | [Penna, D., Tromp-van Meerveld, H. J., Gobbi, A., Borga, M. and Dalla Fontana, G.: The](#)
848 | [influence of soil moisture on threshold runoff generation processes in an alpine headwater](#)
849 | [catchment, *Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci.*, 15\(3\), 689–702, doi:10.5194/hess-15-689-2011, 2011.](#)
- 850 | Reager, J. T. and Famiglietti, J. S.: Global terrestrial water storage capacity and flood
851 | potential using GRACE, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 36(23), L23402, doi:10.1029/2009gl040826,
852 | 2009.
- 853 | Reager, J. T., Thomas, B. F. and Famiglietti, J. S.: River basin flood potential inferred
854 | using GRACE gravity observations at several months lead time, *Nat. Geosci.*, 7, 588–592,
855 | doi:10.1038/ngeo2203, 2014.

- 856 | Riegger, J. and Tourian, M. J.: Characterization of runoff-storage relationships by satellite
857 | gravimetry and remote sensing, *Water Resour. Res.*, 50(4), 3444–3466, 2014.
- 858 | Rodell, M., Houser, P. R., Jambor, U., Gottschalck, J., Mitchell, K., Meng, C. J., Arsenault,
859 | K., Cosgrove, B., Radakovich, J., Bosilovich, M., Entin, J. K., Walker, J. P., Lohmann, D.
860 | and Toll, D.: The Global Land Data Assimilation System, *Bull. Am. Meteorol. Soc.*, 85(3),
861 | 381–394, doi:10.1175/bams-85-3-381, 2004.
- 862 | Rodell, M., Velicogna, I. and Famiglietti, J. S.: Satellite-based estimates of groundwater
863 | depletion in India, *Nature*, 460(7258), 999–1002, 2009.
- 864 | Rupp, D. E., Abatzoglou, J. T., Hegewisch, K. C. and Mote, P. W.: Evaluation of CMIP5
865 | 20th century climate simulations for the Pacific Northwest USA, *J. Geophys. Res. Atmos.*,
866 | 2013.
- 867 | Sayama, T., McDonnell, J. J., Dhakal, A. and Sullivan, K.: How much water can a
868 | watershed store?, *Hydrol. Process.*, 25(25), 3899–3908, doi:10.1002/hyp.8288, 2011.
- 869 | Serreze, M. C., Clark, M. P., Armstrong, R. L., McGinnis, D. A. and Pulwarty, R. S.:
870 | Characteristics of the western United States snowpack from snowpack telemetry
871 | (SNOTEL) data, *Water Resour. Res.*, 35(7), 2145–2160, doi:10.1029/1999wr900090, 1999.
- 872 | Skøien, J. O., Blöschl, G. and Western, A. W.: Characteristic space scales and timescales in
873 | hydrology, *Water Resour. Res.*, 39(10), 2003.
- 874 | Spence, C.: A paradigm shift in hydrology: Storage thresholds across scales influence
875 | catchment runoff generation, *Geogr. Compass*, 4(7), 819–833, 2010.
- 876 | Sproles, E. A., Nolin, A. W., Rittger, K. and Painter, T. H.: Climate change impacts on
877 | maritime mountain snowpack in the Oregon Cascades, *Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci.*, 17(7),
878 | 2581–2597, doi:10.5194/hess-17-2581-2013, 2013.
- 879 | Swenson, S. and Wahr, J.: Post-processing removal of correlated errors in GRACE data,
880 | *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 33(8), L08402, doi:10.1029/2005gl025285, 2006.
- 881 | Swenson, S., Yeh, P. J. F., Wahr, J. and Famiglietti, J.: A comparison of terrestrial water
882 | storage variations from GRACE with in situ measurements from Illinois, *Geophys. Res.*
883 | *Lett.*, 33(16), L16401, doi:10.1029/2006gl026962, 2006.
- 884 | Tague, C., Grant, G., Farrell, M., Choate, J. and Jefferson, A.: Deep groundwater mediates
885 | streamflow response to climate warming in the Oregon Cascades, *Clim. Change*, 86(1),
886 | 189–210, 2008.
- 887 | Tapley, B. D., Bettadpur, S., Ries, J. C., Thompson, P. F. and Watkins, M. M.: GRACE
888 | measurements of mass variability in the Earth system, *Science* (80-.), 305(5683), 503–
889 | 505, 2004.

- 890 | The MathWorks: MATLAB and Statistics Toolbox Release 2013a, 2013.
- 891 | Thompson, S. E., Harman, C. J., Schumer, R., Wilson, J. S., Basu, N. B., Brooks, P. D.,
892 | Donner, S. D., Hassan, M. A., Packman, A. I. and Rao, P. S. C.: Patterns, puzzles and
893 | people: implementing hydrologic synthesis, *Hydrol. Process.*, 25(20), 3256–3266, 2011.
- 894 | United States Army Corps of Engineers: Comprehensive water supply study - An
895 | examination of current water supply issues, edited by T. M. Hillyer., 2001.
- 896 | Voss, K. A., Famiglietti, J. S., Lo, M., Linage, C., Rodell, M. and Swenson, S. C.:
897 | Groundwater depletion in the Middle East from GRACE with implications for
898 | transboundary water management in the Tigris-Euphrates-Western Iran region, *Water*
899 | *Resour. Res.*, 2013.
- 900 | Wagener, T., Sivapalan, M., Troch, P. A., McGlynn, B. L., Harman, C. J., Gupta, H. V.,
901 | Kumar, P., Rao, P. S. C., Basu, N. B. and Wilson, J. S.: The future of hydrology: An
902 | evolving science for a changing world, *Water Resour. Res.*, 46(5), 2010.
- 903 | Wagener, T., Sivapalan, M., Troch, P. and Woods, R.: Catchment classification and
904 | hydrologic similarity, *Geogr. Compass*, 1(4), 901–931, doi:10.1111/j.1749-
905 | 8198.2007.00039.x, 2007.
- 906 | Wahr, J., Swenson, S. and Velicogna, I.: Accuracy of GRACE mass estimates, *Geophys.*
907 | *Res. Lett.*, 33(6), L06401, doi:10.1029/2005gl025305, 2006.
- 908 | Webster, C. S., Kingston, D. G. and Kerr, T.: Inter-annual variation in the topographic
909 | controls on catchment-scale snow distribution in a maritime alpine catchment, New
910 | Zealand, *Hydrol. Process.*, 2014.
- 911 | Western, A. W., Grayson, R. B. and Blöschl, G.: Scaling of soil moisture: A hydrologic
912 | perspective, *Annu. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci.*, 30(1), 149–180, 2002.
- 913 | [Whitehead, R. L.: Geohydrologic framework of the Snake River Plain regional aquifer
914 | system, Idaho and eastern Oregon, US Government Printing Office., 1992.](#)
- 915 | Wu, H., Kimball, J. S., Elsner, M. M., Mantua, N., Adler, R. F. and Stanford, J.: Projected
916 | climate change impacts on the hydrology and temperature of Pacific Northwest rivers,
917 | *Water Resour. Res.*, 48(11), W11530, doi:10.1029/2012wr012082, 2012.
- 918 | Yeh, P. J. F., Swenson, S. C., Famiglietti, J. S. and Rodell, M.: Remote sensing of
919 | groundwater storage changes in Illinois using the Gravity Recovery and Climate
920 | Experiment (GRACE), *Water Resour. Res.*, 42(12), W12203, doi:10.1029/2006wr005374,
921 | 2006.

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Con formato: Fuente: Adobe Caslon Pro

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Con formato: Fuente: Adobe Caslon Pro
Bold

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Con formato: Fuente: Adobe Caslon Pro

E Sproles 6/18/15 2:09 PM

Con formato: Fuente: Adobe Caslon Pro
Bold

- 922 | Zaitchik, B. F., Rodell, M. and Reichle, R. H.: Assimilation of GRACE terrestrial water
923 storage data into a land surface model: Results for the Mississippi River Basin, J.
924 Hydrometeorol., 9(3), 535–548, doi:10.1175/2007JHM951.1, 2008.
- 925 Zang, C. F., Liu, J., Velde, M. and Kraxner, F.: Assessment of spatial and temporal patterns
926 of green and blue water flows under natural conditions in inland river basins in Northwest
927 China, Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci., 16(8), 2859–2870, 2012.
- 928