

## ***Interactive comment on “Do land parameters matter in large-scale terrestrial water dynamics? – Toward new paradigms in modelling strategies” by L. Gudmundsson and S. I. Seneviratne***

**F Pappenberger (Editor)**

florian.pappenberger@ecmwf.int

Received and published: 5 February 2014

Dear authors,

thank you for your thorough response to the reviewers comments. Although some clear value in your work has been identified, with so many reviews detailing major points of issue, I think that it would be more beneficial at this stage if you were to go away and think about your work a bit more carefully. Some of the comments and responses show that the reviewers have systematically misunderstood what you meant, which requires some careful revision. Also I believe that some of your responses would benefit from a

C7768

consultation with a hydrological scientist.

I am therefore recommending the unusual course of action to reject at this stage but with an option to resubmit at a later stage with no additional costs. If you choose to resubmit, please give full details of this and my name as Editor in your cover letter.

A couple of things that struck me about the comments by the reviewers:

(i) I think you need to address the issue of long term storages (snow, ground water) and their impact on your results more carefully. I think you may have misunderstood reviewer #1 here for example.

(ii) Many of the reviewers note there is just nothing new. In your general answer you argue that this is not known in atmospheric science. This still requires you to set this in context of already existing literature and long standing research, particularly when you publish in a hydrological science journal. A very carefully constructed literature review is required here, and I believe this would take some time to put together.

(iii) you state in response to reviewer 5 that "calibration would render the rigorous physical interpretation of LSMs difficult (cf. equifinality .." - I suggest a closer consultation of the papers surrounding the topic of uncertainty, physically based modelling and equifinnality as I believe this is a misunderstanding of the literature.

Regards, Florian

---

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 10, 13191, 2013.

C7769