Hydrology and Earth System Sciences

Open Access

Discussions

Interactive comment on "Bayesian networks for environmental flow decision making and an application in the Yellow River estuary, China" *by* A. P. Pang and T. Sun

j. zhang (Referee)

zhangjianmin@scu.edu.cn

Received and published: 22 January 2014

In this paper, the authors proposed a framework for environmental water allocation based on Bayesian networks, using the Shangdong Irrigation District as case study. I would recommend its publication in Hydrology and Earth System Sciencesfollowing some minor changes set out below. (1) P8 Line 22: Check the statement that "approximately 90% of total water resources are used for agricultural purposes". Is this correct? Is only 10% currently available for industrial, domestic, and environmental uses? (2) P5 line14:Explain what is the "reference crop" and how it and the related coefficients have been adapted to crops and conditions in the Shandong area. (3) P13

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

Line8: Reference to 30% savings clearly contains large uncertainty. (4) P10 Line 2 and page 11 line6: Use of the term "maximum environmental flow" is not clear. For the consistent reason, I think the "minimum" in P10 Line 2 and P11 line6 should also be changed too. Here, I recommended "high" and "low". (5) Given that the applications in the paper are all to the past conditions, how about the applicability of the framework to future situations. I think the framework is only valuable if it can be applied in future decision making. How can it now be used?

Please also note the supplement to this comment:
http://www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/10/C7359/2014/hessd-10-C7359-2014-supplement.pdf

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 10, 14873, 2013.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper