

## ***Interactive comment on “A comparison between remotely-sensed and modelled surface soil moisture (and frozen status) at high latitudes” by I. Gouttevin et al.***

**S. J. Schymanski (Editor)**

stan.schymanski@env.ethz.ch

Received and published: 27 November 2013

The manuscript has been reviewed by four experts in the field, all of which made very constructive suggestions for improvements. I wholeheartedly concur with Referee 4 in pointing out the importance of evaluating land surface models using appropriate data but I also acknowledge the problems all of the reviewers pointed out, among others:

- inconclusive results
- lack of significant new insights

C6466

- incomplete analyses
- not up-to-date model and parameterisations used in evaluation
- lack of systematic assessment of uncertainties in model and Earth Observation data

I therefore hope that the constructive recommendations will motivate and help the authors to complement the current results with more meaningful analysis and resubmit an insightful and publishable manuscript at a later stage. Since the reviewers were not able to gain any significant insights from the current manuscript, and given their suggestions for substantial additional analyses and re-organisation of the manuscript, I feel that resubmission of a new, improved manuscript would be more beneficial than explicitly addressing each reviewer comment in a response letter. The manuscript would have to undergo another review process before publication in any case. At this point I would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive and thorough reviews and I hope that this will help making meaningful progress towards generation of consistent Earth Observation data and land surface models.

---

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 10, 11241, 2013.

C6467