

Interactive comment on “Identifying sources and controlling factors of arsenic release in saline groundwater aquifers” by C.-W. Liu et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 28 October 2013

Article title: Identifying sources and controlling factors of arsenic release in saline groundwater aquifers

General Comments In the manuscript a detailed study on geochemical aspect was carried out to evaluate occurrences of arsenic and its possible deposition mechanism in saline aquifer. A significant amount of work is done and a wide range of data was analyzed and presented in this study. Therefore, I consider this is a good contribution to the journal. Overall my feeling is, though a significant amount of data is presented but there is a scope to organize the context in a more comprehensive way (especially the result section). Furthermore, the writing/ grammar can be improved. Specific comments 1) Page 10575: Line 15: Figure 3 does not look very useful. Instead of relating arsenic concentration with depth and EC, I think it would be better to link with lithology

C5907

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



and different ion composition (Like Figure 4). 2) In Figure 4: the lithological data can be presented more prominently, as it is very useful piece of information. 3) Page 10576: Line 25: "...and interaction seawater and non-saline groundwater in this region (Figure 5)"...from the discussion and from the figure 5 the above statement cannot be derived. 4) Page 10577: Line 25-30: High As(V) in YL6-1 and As(III) in YL6-1 was observed. Here the difference in EC was mentioned, however I feel mentioning difference in pH, redox condition would be more relevant. 5) Section 3.5: If Figure 9 represents only the calculated/simulated values, then line plot is more suitable and it can be combined with Figure 8.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 10, 10565, 2013.

HESSD

10, C5907–C5908, 2013

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

C5908

