

Interactive comment on “Impact of snow gliding on soil redistribution for a sub-alpine area in Switzerland” by K. Meusburger et al.

T.A. Bogaard (Editor)

t.a.bogaard@tudelft.nl

Received and published: 8 October 2013

Dear Authors,

your manuscript has received three detailed, high quality reviews for which I thank the reviewers. Thanks also to you for the open and honest replies. The ms is well written and structured. The reviewers agree that the methodology to quantify snow gliding effect on soil erosion is potentially interesting and could give additional insight in soil erosion in winter conditions. However, in the current version, the methodology is not proven. In short, the limited amount of data and the absence of thorough analysis (error analysis) makes it impossible to judge whether the effect of snow gliding can be assessed. Additional analysis can proof the concept to be undecisive with the current

C5466

data set. This means that conceptually the manuscript is not finished. I therefore follow the advice of the reviewers and reject the manuscript for HESS.

However, you did indicate in your replies that you can improve the analysis and thus proof (quantify) the effect of snow gliding on soil erosion. In words of the reviewer: “if after thorough error analysis of the data the results still hold, the authors should be invited to resubmit a manuscript”. I therefor suggest to re-submit the manuscript to HESSD after a thorough revision and additional analysis of the manuscript as indicated by the three reviewers. Hereafter it will go in public review again. You will be offered a reduction in page charge when re-submitting to HESSD (please refer to this decision for that). I am willing to act as HESS editor in such case.

Kind regards, Thom Bogaard Editor HESS

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 10, 9505, 2013.

C5467