Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 10, C4429–C4430, 2013
www.hydrol-earth-syst-sci-discuss.net/10/C4429/2013/

Hydrology and Earth System Sciences
Discussions

Interactive comment on "Darwinian hydrology: can the methodology Charles Darwin pioneered help hydrologic science?" *by* C. Harman and P. A. Troch

A. Kleidon (Editor)

akleidon@bgc-jena.mpg.de

Received and published: 26 August 2013

Three reviews have now been received that are, in general, all very supportive for publication of the manuscript after mostly minor revisions.

The first review asks for a clear definition of the term "Darwinian hydrology" and provides suggestions on how the structure of the manuscript can be improved. The review also suggests to consider the choice of words in the manuscript. For the sake of being accessible to a wider readership, I suggest that the authors attempt to pay attention to the wording at places where a simpler formulation would also be adequate.

The second review is very supportive of the paper, but points out several points that can, or need to be improved from a philosophical side. He asks for clearly directing the attention to a scientific goal for hydrology (in form of formulating bold hypotheses) and calls for a clearer definition of terms (as in the first review). The review contains much useful information on philosophy of science and points out several issues that should be clarified, e.g. on paleohydrology, on the aspects that Darwin pioneered vs. simply used, on the use of the term "Newtonian worldview", and to consider additional references (in particular the very relevant reference of Leopold 1994) that are relevant to the scope of the manuscript.

The third review is very supportive and makes minor comments.

When you revise the manuscript along these lines, please provide a point-by-point response on how you dealt with the main points that were raised by the reviewers.

I am looking forward to the revised manuscript.

Axel Kleidon

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 10, 6407, 2013.