

Interactive comment on “Sedimentation monitoring including uncertainty analysis in complex floodplains: a case study in the Mekong Delta” by N. V. Manh et al.

S. Mallory (Referee)

stephen@waterresources.co.za

Received and published: 6 March 2013

General comments This paper is daunting in its scope and the large of amounts of data presented. I believe that while the statistical analysis could be questioned by those with deeper understanding of statistics than myself, I believe the paper makes a valuable contribution to the scientific community with raw data presented and the uncertainty methodologies developed. While it could be argued that the paper does not entirely meet its objectives in that it fails to mathematically describe the distribution of sediment deposition, it is clearly stated in the paper that this is a very complex problem which cannot easily be solved. The data presented is however a large step forward which

C244

should help future researchers to better understand the distribution of sediment on flood plains.

The paper is somewhat marred by the inconsistent use of language and requires professional editing. Since the paper is very long and I did not have a Word document I have not attempted this editing.

Specific comments Page 327, line 7 This sentence should add that land use or anthropogenic influences also affect the sediment supply. This is perhaps the most important factor in many catchment. Perhaps a sentence could be included to what extent is land use in the Mekong catchment thought to affect sediment supply to the delta.

Page 327, Line 7: due to natural variability..add ..of the factors influencing sedimentation

Line 328, Line 20. The papers stated ‘91.061 km length of channel networks. Surely this cannot be correct? Perhaps this should be 91 061 km. Even then it seems unlikely that the channel lengths are known this accurately. Perhaps replace with approximately 91 000km.

Page 338, line 1 5.3.2 Nutrient fraction The laboratory results of nutrient analysis provide proportions of sediment mass (%). Should this not read..The laboratory results of nutrient analysis are expressed as a proportion of sediment mass (%).

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 10, 325, 2013.

C245