

Interactive comment on “Identification of glacial melt water runoff in a karstic environment and its implication for present and future water availability” by D. Finger et al.

B. Schaefli (Editor)

bettina.schaefli@epfl.ch

Received and published: 1 May 2013

All reviewers judge de significance, the scientific and presentation quality of this paper as being good to excellent. They raise an important number of detailed comments and critics, but overall, they recommend publication of this paper with **minor revisions** rather than a substantial re-writing or expansion of the manuscript.

Before preparing the revised manuscript, I would like to invite the authors to give a detailed response to each of the reviews. Hereafter, I give a short overview of the main comments:

- Reviewer 2 and 3 highlighted that the literature review seems incomplete.
- Reviewer 2 would also like to see a better presentation of the functioning of subglacial karst hydrology.
- Reviewer 3 suggest to improve the terminology and to better discuss the limitations and transferability of the results.
- Reviewer 4 made critical comments on the over-ambitious scope of the paper and recommends reducing the scope and setting a more modest aim of establishing the hydrogeology of a glacierised karst depression. A better definition of the scope of the manuscript might also be required in view of the comments of M. Bakalowicz and the ensuing discussion.
- Besides many other detailed comments, reviewer 4 also asks for a better integration of all obtained results and avoiding conclusions that cannot be directly drawn from the analyses of this paper.
- Finally, several reviewers find the manuscript not yet very well structured and mention repetitions. And reviewer 1 would like to have more precise indications about the original contributions of this paper.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 10, 2743, 2013.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

